I think you have an interesting and important subject that needs further development and polishing before submitting to any journal. You are correct in writing that scholars have only really focused on the immigrant communities after their settlement in the United States and have looked less at the reasons why they left Palestine. I found, however, that you cannot really separate the push and pull factors as you try to do. I think you can discuss the push and pull factors purely by looking at Palestinian society at this time and how they are exposed to the idea of emigration and how they discuss the idea of emigration.

I suggest that you focus on what you know best: the role of education (i.e., the American Quaker schools—long ago, I read your dissertation). Did the American Friends teachers encourage certain students to study in the United States? This surely had an effect on family members and others. You mention Philip Hitti as describing the teacher in an American mission school who shared photographs of the United States. What about the textbooks of the Quaker schools? Did they teach about American life? Anisa Audi in her memoir talks about moving from Ramallah to the United States together with representatives of the Friends School.

In addition, you should make greater use of the Palestinian Arabic press, much of which is now online at the National Library (https://web.nli.org.il/sites/nlis/ar/jrayed/pages/default.aspx), as it is a valuable source for understanding Palestinian society at this time. Your discussion of the advertisements for the shipping agencies is worth expanding. We know that that at this time, people were beginning to travel as there are many accounts of Western travelers going to Palestine. Some secondary sources on travel would be helpful here.

To the best of my knowledge, scholars have not studied the Arabic press in order to understand emigration. I think it’s worth going back to the press and looking to see how this subject was discussed. Was the discourse in the press encouraging or were people criticized for leaving especially as Jewish immigration to Palestine increased?

The other issue that is worth looking into are tensions between Christians and Muslims, which surely would have contributed to emigration. Tensions like this appeared in 1922 with the Supreme Muslim Council, which campaigned against missionary schools. The Palestinian press also mentions scandals about Muslim girls being converted. Beth Baron has written about similar scandals in Egypt in her book *The Orphan Scandal: Christian missionaries and the Rise of the Muslim Brotherhood*.

The section on the migration from the different villages was too descriptive and all too similar in my opinion. With some editing you could make this much shorter and more persuasive. The same goes for the information about taxation.

Finally, your paper could use some theoretical framework. If you focus on the role of education, namely the American Quaker schools, and the Arabic press in discussing emigration, you could possibly rely on Benedict Anderson’s concept of “imagined communities,” as they offer one in the form of the United States. You could also argue that those emigrants were indifferent to the idea of an “imagined community” in Palestine, especially at a time when remaining in Palestine was crucial to counterbalance the Jewish immigrants. You might check the article by Tara Zaha on “Imagined Noncommunities: National Indifference as a Category of Analysis,” in *Slavic Review* vol. 69 (2010).

As for where to submit this article, once you have reworked it, I would consider the *British Journal of Middle East Studies* or the *Middle Eastern Studies Journal*.