Dear Dr. Weiss,

Thank you for submitting the manuscript entitled ‘The “Immigrant Medical Services” Organization during the End of the British Mandate and the First Years of Israel (1944–1953)’ to *Rambam Maimonides Medical Journal*. Your manuscript has now been evaluated by our editorial board and independent 3 expert reviewers.

Unfortunately, a number of major issues have been raised that prevent publication of your paper in its present form. We invite you to submit a revised version of the manuscript that addresses the points raised during the review process. The revised version will be re-reviewed and a decision on acceptability of your manuscript will be made only after the revised version has been re-evaluated. The reviewer's comments are provided beneath my signature.

**Please include the following items when submitting your revised manuscript to the Author Center:**

* A letter responding to **each point** raised by the reviewers and editor. Please upload this letter as a separate file in the "Respond to Editor's/Reviwers' Comments" section. Please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s). (You may also copy your detailed response in the text box.)
* If you choose not to make some of the suggested revisions, please explain your reasons in your response to the reviewers.
* A marked-up copy of your manuscript (preferaby using Word's Track Changes feature) that highlights **ALL**changes made to the original manuscript. Please clearly name this file as being a revised version.

Please note that your revised manuscript MUST be submitted through the same account that it was originally submitted to (usually via the corresponding author). **Please DO NOT create a new account to submit your revised manuscript. If one of your colleagues is submitting the revision on your behalf, please send them the information below.**

**To access your original sending and submit the revised manuscript, proceed as follows:**

1. Go to the logon screen of the Author Center (<http://app.rmmj.org.il/Pages/Author/Login.aspx>).
2. Enter the following User Name and Password:  
     
   Your User Name: **Dorit Weiss** (case sensitive)  
   Your Password: **Dorit2008** (case sensitive)  
     
   *The Author Center is displayed with a variety of options.*
3. Click on **Revise Manuscript**.  
     
   ***Note:***If you have already clicked on this item and exited without submitting, you should click on **Incomplete Revised Manuscripts**. In both cases, the Revise a Manuscript screen appears with a table of available manuscripts for revision.
4. Click the notebook icon in the table on the Revise a Manuscript screen. Details for your manuscript appear.
5. Follow the displayed instructions. After you click **Continue**, another screen appears for entering your response to the reviewers. When you click**Continue**again, you will be able to upload your revised manuscript and additional files.
6. After you have followed all of the onscreen instructions, the**Submit Manuscript**button is enabled; please click it to submit your revised paper.

**IMPORTANT:**Please be sure to closely follow the instructions for submitting the revised files.

If your manuscript contains figures, tables or text taken from other publications that have appeared in copyrighted material, the permissions obtained from the copyright holder should be scanned and uploaded with your submission, designated as "Additional File not For Review." If you do not have access to a scanner, further instructions will be provided upon the acceptance of your paper. Forms should not be sent by postal mail to the editorial office.

Please submit your revised manuscriptas soon as possible**.**

With best regards,

Shraga Blazer, MD  
Editor-in-Chief  
Rambam Maimonides Medical Journal online:  
[http://www.rmmj.org.il](http://www.rmmj.org.il/)

=============================================================

**Summary of Reviewers' Comments:**

1) Interesting paper, important subject. we may be mistaken, but one gets the feeling that this article may have been related to a PhD thesis. This is fine but if so, it should be acknowledged.

2) Although I am literate in the subject, I am not a medical historian and so you might want also to consult with someone like Prof Shifra Schwartz of BGU.

3) On a general note, I found it somewhat technically difficult to review this paper due to the fact that the unlike many other journals, the lines of the manuscript are not numbered.

4) In general, early on, for the non-Israeli reader you need to define "Israel" as in "State of…", "Yishuv", "Land of Israel" "Aliyah" and very briefly explain what the British Mandate was and its dates.

5) P 3 of 27: 2nd paragraph suggest: "…this is the first study, to the best of our knowledge, of how Hadassah…"

6) Same page at bottom, first tine "Clalit" is mentioned, you should say something like it was an "early form of a health maintenance organization, a non-profit that covered…" and then something about what other HMOs there were during the period of the study, etc (just Leumit?)

7) Same page in middle para, suggest: "… of Jewish immigrants amid fears by the state of morbidity and the spread…"

8) P 6 of 27: first time the "Jewish National Council" is mentioned, it should be briefly described

9) P 8 of 27: 2/3 down: "Health services would be provided [or funded?] to immigrants…."

10) P 9 of 27: (above Yassky quote) "announcement", not "announcing" ?

11) P 10 of 27 first time "Palestine Pound" mentioned, give equivalence in Stirling or $ US at the time

12) P 11 of 27 (1st complete para) last sentence:" …without an adequate financial solution."

13) Same page (3rd para): you mention "medical "staff here (and throughout the paper). I suggest using "health staff" when speaking in general, since it wasn’t only doctors who did the heavy lifting. Hard pressed nurses, administrators and other relevant professions also contributed their fair share. "Medical" should be used only when doctors are specifically referred to.

14) P 12 of 27: some of these figures are confusing and hard to reconcile eg LP 120,000 in first para vs LP 22,560 in the next. Different years ?

15) Same page 2nd full para 2nd last sentence: "… alerted the Yishuv administration [or government] about the…. "

16) P14: first full para: many readers will not be familiar with details of the War of Independence so I suggest "….coastal plain region as a result of attacks by Arab militias trying to cut Jerusalem off during the War of…"

17) Same page, last full para: "By the end of this period" - be specific.

18) Same para" enemy countries" – be specific (see point 16 above)

19) Same page, second last line, suggest: "The issue of the immigration of Jewish survivors of WW2, many of them Holocaust survivors, a significant proportion overall with severe illnesses…"

20) P15 in the middle, suggest: "…providing health services to the many citizens (Jews and Arabs alike) who had been wounded …"

21) Same page, next para use "new immigrants" not "Olim", here and throughout the text (see point 4 above).

22) P16 3rd para, suggest: "…Israel's first Independence Day celebration…"

23) Same page, next paragraph "hardcore cases" is slang and slightly pejorative. Be more specific and use more professional terminology.

24) Next para: 200 - out of how many? Always need a denominator when giving such figures.

25) P17 middle para "The first question….immigrant populations." The English is unclear. Please rewrite.

26) Next para, suggest: "…to provide adequate [not best possible] care…"

27) Next para "The second question relates to [not regarded]…."

28) P18 What "economic crisis in the United States"? Be more specific - what years, how bad, etc

29) P19, last para, we suggest, "….eradication of epidemics and contributed to the creation [or further development] of the nascent state's system of… References; These are quite extensive and although well cited, I am not sure the non-specialist reader could easily look many of them up. Eg all those at "Central Zionist Archive". Perhaps it is not possible to do so, but could these not be made more user friendly ? One reference that I could not find cited was Rhona Seidelman's important study of the time "Shaar haAliyah" (see <https://books.google.co.il/books/about/Shaar_Haaliya.html?id=g9RWQwAACAAJ&redir_esc=y>) I suggest the author examines this source during revision. It will add material and support for many of the statements offered in this manuscript. It should certainly be clearly cited for the benefit of the interested reader who wishes to dig deeper.

Rambam Maimonides Medical Journal online:  
[http://www.rmmj.org.il](http://www.rmmj.org.il/)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| https://lh3.googleusercontent.com/a/ACg8ocLsibn4fnPk7dCXu6qVkQK-UzPl4HXYV3gs0ZKTjOWi=s40-p-mo | תשובההעברה  הוספת תגובה |