The Editorial Board discussed your manuscript several times, before and after peer review and following submission of the revised version. There is a consensus that the manuscript is interesting, and the topic is within the scope of our journal. However, we also agreed that our international readership would find the paper difficult to read. Because our readership is quite diverse – many speak English as a second language and most are not Jewish – readability is particularly important conveying a topic of high potential general interest such as yours. You might be surprised to know that many of papers focused on Jewish topics such as history and ethics have a high download rate!

These issues relate to your paper's writing style: the sentences are extremely long, the presentation needs to be better organized, and the terminology is inconsistent, which may confuse the reader.

As Editor-in-Chief, I regret to inform you that, while we are very interested in the topic of your paper and believe it would be of high interest to our readership, we cannot accept it as written unless it undergoes significant changes. Although we are willing to help you with this process, it might not be one you are used to. It would involve a back-and-forth process guided by the internal review of a member of our editorial board and our scientific/English editor. Kindly note this is an unadvertised service unique to Rambam Maimonides Medical Journal that we only offer when we believe the submission merits publication. While demanding, such a process would improve your manuscript considerably. However, we cannot force this process upon you. Please let me know if you are interested in pursuing such a path to see your paper published.

Following are a few examples of issues that need to be corrected by you.

  \*   The manuscript is not written according to the journal guidelines (see <https://www.rmmj.org.il/for-authors/instructions-for-authors/>). There was no abstract and a heavy use of footnotes. However, we do not use footnotes. The information provided must be introduced into the text where appropriate. Finally, many of the references are not written according to our format.

  \*   The manuscript should be organized under more than two subheadings. Following is an example of how the paper could be organized. Obviously, you might have other ideas, and perhaps want to introduce additional subheadings.

     \*   Introduction, which explains why you thought it important to write about this topic.

     \*   Background, providing the information readers need to understand the main issues and main players involved in this story, which led to the eventual formation of the IMS.

     \*   Formation of the Immigrant Medical Services Organization towards the end of the British Mandate (1944-1948)

     \*   The Immigrant Medical Services Organization during the first years of the State of Israel (1948-1953)

     \*   Aftermath (if needed). This could provide readers for a glimpse into the impact this past had on the current state of medical care in Israel

     \*   Conclusions

  \*   Sentences need to be simplified. Long sentences should be avoided. I have pasted below a couple of particularly long sentences that are very hard to read. Sometimes too much information is provided, sometimes seemingly irrelevant information is provided. In most cases, these sentences need to be cut into 2 or 3 sentences. While we recognize there are MANY ways the could be rewritten, I’ve asked our English editor to give an example of her suggested rewrites so that you can have an example of what the problem is, possible solution, and how our editor would relate to it. In the actual experience, you would be asked to rewrite as best as you can so that we understand the important nuances to you, and then our editor would help you polish the text and ask you to verify that it is acceptable.

     \*   Page 2, paragraph before Immigrant Medical Services section: Following the establishment of the State of Israel in 1948, the need to provide comprehensive health services for a rapidly expanding population within a short space of time provided increased opportunities to Hadassah and the JDC, both of which regarded health and welfare as top priorities and were able to bridge the growing gap between immigrant needs and the availability of healthcare services. (63 words)

EB Comments: This sentence needs to be cut into at least 2 or 3 sentences.

Editor’s suggestion:
There was an obvious need to provide comprehensive health services for a rapidly expanding population within a short space of time once the State of Israel was established. Both Hadassah and the JDC regarded health and welfare as top priorities. Hence, they were able to bridge the growing gap between immigrant needs and the availability of healthcare services. [Query from editor: Is this what you meant?]

     \*   Page 3, middle:  With the establishment of the State of Israel in 1948, the newly-created Israeli Ministry of Health took responsibility for the provision of medical services and building hospitals, primarily using the infrastructure left by the British. IMS, established by the Jewish National Council and the Jewish Agency in 1944, operated until 1953 (6).

EB Comments: Although rewritten in the revision as two sentences, some readers will understand that the Jewish National Council and the Jewish Agency created the British IMS in 1944 and that it operated until 1953.

Editor’s suggestion:
In 1948, the new government established the Israeli Ministry of Health, which took responsibility for providing medical services and building hospitals using the infrastructure left by the British. They also took advantage of the IMS services which had been established by the Jewish National Council and the Jewish Agency in 1944 and operated until 1953.6 [Query from Editor: Is this what you meant? If not, then it is not clear what the connection is between the IMS and the Israeli Ministry of Health. In reading the entire paragraph, it seems like the sentences need to be reorganized for logical order: a. establishment of the IMS; b. establishment of Israeli Ministry of Health; c. relationship between the two; d. what happened as a result.  What do you think?]

     \*   Page 6, first full paragraph, first sentence: In June 1945, Dr. Eliezer Kaplan (1891–1952), a board member of the Jewish Agency and director of its finance department until the establishment of the State of Israel (after which he served as Israel’s first Minister of Finance), approached Rivka Shulman who was elected president of Hadassah in 1953 after serving as a liaison between Hadassah in Israel and the Hadassah organization in the United States. (67 words).

EB comment: Surplus information seems to be provided. This sentence could be rewritten as follows: “In June 1945, Dr. Eliezer Kaplan, the finance director of the Jewish Agency, contacted Rivka Shulman, who served as a liaison between Hadassah’s organizations in Israel and the United States.” (30 words)

Editor’s query: I agree with the suggested rewrite. The future positions of Kaplan and Shulman do not seem to us to be important information for this point in history, which the paper is relating to.

  \*   One example of inconsistent terminology is the use of "settlement" vs. "Yishuv." This may confuse a non-Hebrew-speaking and non-Jewish audience who, despite your definition earlier on, may think they are two different entities. All terms need to be used consistently throughout the paper.

I hope these examples are helpful in understanding what our editing process would look like.

Please let me know if you are interested in my proposal. Based on your response, I will process your paper accordingly (Reject after revision or Accept with Major Changes). I will respect whatever decision you make.

I look forward to your soonest response.

Thank you again for your informative and important submission.

With best warm regards,

Shraga