Meir Seidler

“The End of German Jewry is upon us”

Rabbi Joseph Tzvi Carlebach (1883-1942) – The End of an Epoch

*MAHSHAVOT*

A Series for Studies in Jewish Thought

in Memory of Isidore Friedman

Edited by Dov Schwartz

Meir Seidler

“The End of German Jewry is upon us”

Rabbi Joseph Tzvi Carlebach (1883-1942)

– The End of an Epoch



Bar-Ilan University Press, Ramat Gan

Editorial Committee:

Binyamin Abrahamov, Sara Klein-Braslavy, Haim (Howard) Kreisel,

Yehuda Liebes, Ron Margolin, Shlomo Sela, Avi Sagi

Published with the assistance of:

ISBN 978-965-226-636-1

© 2022

Copyright by Bar-Ilan University, Ramat Gan

All rights reserved. no part of this book may be reproduced or utilized in any

form or by any means, electronic, magnetic or mechanical (including photocopying,

miniaturization or recording) or by any information storage and retrieval system,

without written permission from the publisher.

Language editing: Dr. Oded Port

Typesetting: Shulamit Yerushalmi, Jerusalem

Printed in Israel, 2022

Table of Contents

Preface by Yaakov Kohler

Foreword

Chapter 1: Rabbi Joseph Tzvi Carlebach and his Epoch

1. German Jewry in the Modern Era – A Short Sketch of the Historical and Cultural Background

a. The Unique Character of German Jewry

b. What is Orthodox Judaism

c. The Cultural and Communal Impact of Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch

1. Rabbi Joseph Tzvi Carlebach

a. Life

b. Rabbinic Profile

c. Carlebach’s Stance towards Reform Judaism

d. Carlebach’s Writings

e. His Personality

Chapter 2: Carlebach’s Intellectual Profile

* 1. Religion and Science – His Stance towards Bible Criticism

a. Tanach

b. Bible Criticism as Judaism’s Enemy

c. A Critique of the Presuppositions of Bible Criticism and its Method

d. Critical Appraisal

* 1. Religion and Science – The Challenge of Natural Sciences

a. Creation

b. Miracles

* 1. Liberty
  2. The Architecture of the Synagogue

a. The Prospect of the Berlin Rabbinate

b. The Article “The Architecture of the Synagogue”

Closing Remark

Chapter 3: His Attitude towards Eretz Israel and Zionism

1. His Sojourn as a Young Man in Eretz Israel as a Formative Experience

2. Carlebach’s Connection to Eretz Israel and Zionism during WWI and its Aftermath

3. Theological Considerations in Carlebach’s Assessment toward Zionism

4. In the Labyrinth of Jewish-Orthodox Politics

5. Confronting the "Frankfurt Principle”

a. Background

b. Carlebach and Breuer

6. Wisdom of the Nations – Believe It: Carlebach and Macaulay

7. Carlebach and Rabbi Reines

8. Carlebach’s Pragmatic Approach as a Result of his World-view

Chapter 4: “I have turned into an enthusiastic Germanophile” – The Original Sin of German Jewry

Chapter 5: The Nazi Period

1. The Historical Facts and the Mental Disposition of German Jewry

2. Attempt at Containment: The Reaction of German-Jewish Orthodoxy and of Carlebach

3. “Flourishing Jewish Life” in Nazi Germany

4. Beyond Containment – Carlebach’s Writings between Courage and Admiration

* 1. A Theological Answer to Suffering
  2. Apologetics in the Face of Danger
  3. In Upright Stand
  4. Recalculating Route after Kristallnacht: ”The End of German Jewry is upon us”
  5. “In the Second Floor of the Sinking Sanctuary We can still Rejoice”
  6. Sanctifying G-d’s Name

The Article “God’s Tear” (September 19th, 1935)

Epilogue

Appendix: “The Good Popular *Shiur*”

Bibliography

Index