Bilingual intertexts in *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!*

Eleanor Crewes’s the *The Times I Knew I Was Gay* in translation

Submitted to David Blondeau

as part of the seminar FTRA 610 (Lecture critique de traductions)

by

Ariadne Lih (40158973)

Concordia University

Département d’études françaises

April 12, 2022

# **Introduction: Textual hybridity in comics**

“Depuis le développement de la traductologie, le traducteur occupe le devant de la scène,” writes Danielle Risterucci-Roudnicky.[[1]](#footnote-1) But an overwhelming focus on translator subjectivity makes less sense when talking about translated comics. Historically, the global flow of comics translation has been driven by commercial forces; when the American comic book phenomenon was first imported into Europe in the 1930s, it was championed by “publishers and literary agents” rather than by scholars or individual translators.[[2]](#footnote-2) And since comics are still firmly rooted in popular culture, there is no great wealth of conspicuously retranslated comics or body of university-employed translators theorizing their own comics translation oeuvre. In fact, Klaus Kaindl notes that comics translators “often remain anonymous.”[[3]](#footnote-3) All this contributes to the fact that comics and graphic novels are rarely analyzed in depth by translation scholars.

 What theoretical tools would be available for analyzing comics and graphic novels? We can all but eliminate Antoine Berman’s analytic of translation whereby deforming forces must manifest within the translator’s consciousness: they “form part of the translator’s *being,* determining the *desire* to translate.”[[4]](#footnote-4) Identifying these forces becomes less meaningful when we cannot access the translator’s subjectivity, when we do not know their identity, or when other factors—such as time constraints, publisher requests and marketing concerns—play a greater role in shaping the translation than the actual translator.

The model proposed by Danielle Risterucci-Roudnicky avoids this problem. She suggests that analyses be based on both external criteria and internal criteria with respect to the translated work.[[5]](#footnote-5) Her “critères externes à l’œuvre” explicitly incorporate paratext: “le support, l’édition étrangère, la collection et leur implication sur la lecture de l’œuvre.” Her “critères internes à l’œuvre” can be determined by identifying signs of textual hybridity: footprints of the translation process, signs that the work belongs in (at least) two cultural and linguistic spheres at once.[[6]](#footnote-6) With this model, readings of translated works can be developed without psychoanalyzing translators or even attributing translational choices to specific people. The resulting analytical readings can also incorporate broader ideological concerns. As we will see, both are ideal for the work at hand.

With the help of Risterucci-Roudnicky’s framework, this essay will propose a reading of *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!*,[[7]](#footnote-7) the French translation of Eleanor Crewes’s graphic memoir *The Times I Knew I Was Gay.[[8]](#footnote-8)* This coming-of-age autobiographical story follows Ellie, the author-narrator, as she finds her place in the world. Growing up, she feels unable to understand and access part of herself, leading to various mental health struggles on the road to accepting her own gayness: problems with dating, a fraught relationship with her own body, consistent anxiety and panic attacks. After several instances of coming out to herself and others, she gains self-assurance, dives further into queer culture, and finally enters her first queer relationship, which serves as the book’s happy ending. The work is rife with references to other works of art and culture that shape Ellie’s identity and her understanding of being gay, especially the TV show *Buffy the Vampire Slayer.*

After surveying the available information surrounding the translator and the target-language publisher, Steinkis, I will situate the translated text in the context of “gay writing” (as theorized by Keith Harvey) and the French and English vocabularies describing gayness. Although the translation is very illusionistic overall, the author’s network of English-language cultural references is largely maintained. In my reading, these references have an important impact on the illusion of the first-person Francophone author. They paint the realistic portrait of someone whose formative cultural experiences were heavily Anglo-American, but whose memory and understanding of the experiences are still in their native language. I base this reading primarily on the translation’s opening pages and the way intertextual references are handled throughout: work titles have a strong tendency to remain unchanged when they are part of a picture but shift into French when they are part of the narration. Finally, an overview of references to *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* will illustrate both the difficulties of interpreting this text and the overall emergence of a “language of translation.”

# **The translator and the paratext**

Eleanor Crewes’s *The Times I Knew I Was Gay* started as a ten-page hand-stitched zine in 2017. Crewes personally delivered it to bookstores across London and the UK. In 2018, she published an expanded version with Good Comics, an indie British comics publisher. Finally, in 2020, *The Times I Knew I Was Gay* appeared as a complete graphic memoir with Virago in the UK and Scribner in the US.[[9]](#footnote-9) Crewes’s literary agent Anna Power belongs to the Johnson & Alcock agency, which has a dedicated Translation Rights department that sells directly in France.[[10]](#footnote-10) Thus, *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* came out with the French publisher Steinkis in March 2021. Steinkis owns the rights to the translation “by agreement with Johnson & Alcock Ltd..”[[11]](#footnote-11) This is consistent with the general conventions of comic strip production, where newspapers and syndicates own the rights to works more often than the authors themselves.[[12]](#footnote-12)

The translation itself, however, is by Claire Martinet. According to her LinkedIn, Martinet’s training includes a *licence* in English, history and geography, *prépa* classes in literature, one master’s degree in radio and film studies from the Sorbonneand another more recent master’s degree in “Arts et culture visuelle anglophones – Traduction éditions savantes.”[[13]](#footnote-13) Searching the catalogue of French bookstore Decitre for her name yields a catalogue of ten works.[[14]](#footnote-14) Five of them are scholarly books about music from the publishing arm of the Philharmonie de Paris. The other five are graphic novels with Steinkis. There is a social justice theme across both categories, with titles such as *L'imagination africaine en musique* by high-profile Ghanaian musicologist Kofi Agawuand *Tu pourrais me remercier,* a graphic novel about the stories of sexual assault survivors. Overall, Martinet’s internet footprint is small, but clearly shows a strong research background and an ongoing relationship with Steinkis, probably as a contractor. We can also speculate about the role Martinet’s audiovisual skills might play in this relationship. As Steinkis’s founder said in an interview, “la BD est le chaînon entre le livre et le film.”[[15]](#footnote-15)

Martinet is not mentioned in either of Crewes’s two Instagram posts about the translation—only Steinkis is named and tagged. The first post appeared on the French release date.[[16]](#footnote-16) The second post, uploaded the next day, is a simple reminder to purchase and includes the comment, “Thankfully I already know what it says! 😅”[[17]](#footnote-17) This statement, the “phew” emoji, the fact that there are only two posts about the translation and both are after the release, all these suggest that Crewes herself was minimally involved in the translation process. Martinet is also not mentioned on Steinkis’s page for the book. In fact, there is no indication that the book was translated at all.[[18]](#footnote-18) Steinkis has a diverse catalogue with numerous other translated books—Googling “Steinkis” and “traductrice” together produces plenty of translator websites and LinkedIns. Searching the Steinkis website for any mention of translation, however, yields no results.

 Faced with this relative paucity of information, we will turn to the paratext. In the context of translation studies, Kathryn Batchelor defines a paratext as “a consciously crafted threshold for a text which has the potential to influence the way(s) in which the text is received.”[[19]](#footnote-19) The histories, attitudes and practices of the target-language publisher—in this instance, Steinkis—fall easily under this definition. What is the philosophy behind their catalogue? How do they frame translations? What do readers expect from books with the Steinkis logo? Answers to these questions create the basic “threshold” for the text to be received in France.

 The origins of the Steinkis publishing group date back to 2003, when Moïse Kissous founded the children’s comics publisher Jungle!.[[20]](#footnote-20) One of Jungle!’s most important successes was acquiring the rights to *The Simpsons*: “Nous avons convaincu les Américains qu’il fallait adapter leurs BD au format français. Personne ne s’y attendait, mais ça a marché,” explained Kissous in a 2017 interview.[[21]](#footnote-21) This implies that *Les Simpsons* was primarily an adaptation, an idea for a viable product on the French market, not a tribute to the Simpsonsphenomenon in its original context. This aligns with Steinkis’s overall discretion about the fact of translation. In translation studies, we might call this a targeteering outlook.

Éditions Steinkis itself is devoted to graphic novels and was founded in 2011. Through Steinkis, Kissous clearly aspires to produce *littérature engagée.* On its tenth anniversary in 2021, he highlighted “le plaisir d'avoir contribué à notre modeste échelle au débat, à la réflexion sur un certain nombre de sujets, d'avoir été précurseur sur certains thèmes qui reviennent dans l'actualité.” He continued,

Et, en même temps, j'ai conscience que nous n'en sommes encore qu'au début. Nous nous adressons encore à des lecteurs relativement captifs. Notre souhait est d'arriver à dépasser cela pour toucher des lecteurs qui pourraient être amenés à changer d'avis grâce à nos livres.[[22]](#footnote-22)

Steinkis’s online self-promotion further underlines this commitment to change minds and shift debates. One of their taglines is “Des livres accessibles et stimulants autour du thème de la relation à l’Autre.”[[23]](#footnote-23) Their motto is the Isaac Newton quote, “Les hommes construisent trop de murs et pas assez de ponts.”[[24]](#footnote-24) Finally, an English reader on their International Rights page will find the following description: “Our titles are questionning [*sic*] issues such as coexistence of communities and specific questions related to minorities (ethnic, religious or sexual).”[[25]](#footnote-25)

 The question of sexual minorities brings us back to *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!.* As Risterucci-Roudnicky suggests, we now have now surveyed various “critères externes à

 l’œuvre.” [[26]](#footnote-26) Steinkis’s focus on France and their interest in sparking public debate will shape our reading of textual hybridity within the work—starting with the title.

# **Toutes les fois où je me suis dit je suis… what exactly?**

*Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* works well as a title translation. Using reported speech eliminates the need for a clunky subordinate clause (“Les moments quand j’ai su que j’étais…”). Adding “toutes” and using the present tense “suis” compensates for the fact that “se dire” is not as affirmative as “I knew.” And at first glance, keeping the word “gay” the same might seem like the obvious, or even the only, acceptable choice. “Gay” is entirely acceptable in French usage, with the Paris pride march being officially known as some variation of *la Gay Pride* from the early nineties until 2015.[[27]](#footnote-27) The normalized French spelling “gai” and its inflected forms only really have traction in Québec.[[28]](#footnote-28)

On the other hand, “gay” as it is used in France falls under Risterucci-Roudnicky’s definition of *xénismes*: “les mots étrangers qui se détachent de la langue-hôte, par leur graphie, sans les marques de genre et de nombre.”[[29]](#footnote-29) *Xénismes* are hotspots for referential hybridity in translated texts. Here, the French “gay” points outside the translation, towards specific American homosexual histories that led to its emergence as an umbrella term. The imported nature of this term has resulted in at least one major difference in usage. In English, only the noun form of “gay” has a strong association with men.[[30]](#footnote-30) In French, the association with gay men applies to both the adjective and the noun.[[31]](#footnote-31) A good example of this can be found in the VF (the Version Française, that is, the French dub) of *Buffy the Vampire Slayer—*the show that played such a crucial role in Crewes’s coming-out process. Buffy’s line “Willow, you’re a gay woman!” becomes “Willow, tu es lesbienne,”[[32]](#footnote-32) whereas Xander’s joke, “I’m going gay. I’ve decided I’m turning gay” stays more or less the same: “Je deviens gay. C’est décidé, je deviens gay.”[[33]](#footnote-33)

In this context, there is good reason to regard “gay” in the title as a marked choice and a sign of referential hybridity in the translated text, one of the “formes sémantiques … qui renvoient explicitement au texte original dans son irréductibilité culturelle.”[[34]](#footnote-34) Here, the irreducibility has to do with why Crewes chose the word “gay” to represent herself in the title rather than “queer” or “lesbian,” for example. Such choices are inevitably conditioned by the unique cultural connotations of these terms in English, as well as being deeply personal. This topic being relatively impenetrable, what can we observe about the *effects* of having “gay” in the memoir’s French title?

In his article “Gay Community, Gay Identity and the Translated Text,” Keith Harvey argues that “gay writing” as a category actively contributes to building gay communities: “‘gay writing’ is, perhaps above all else, a literary genre that explores the parameters of gay experience in order to *validate an identity position* and create an interactional space for the formulation and reception of *gay voices*.”[[35]](#footnote-35) These goals align smoothly with Steinkis’s stated editorial philosophy. It would make sense for them to translate “gay” not on the basis of existing French usage, but as a way of validating an identity position in the French context and creating a platform for that identity to be received and understood. From an overall positioning perspective,[[36]](#footnote-36) the fact that Steinkis acquired the rights to this book at all allows us to make certain assumptions: the values they might share with “lecteurs relativement captifs,” such as the importance of representation or the desire to support gay communities in France, and the values they may want to challenge when it comes to the “lecteurs qui pourraient être amenés à changer d'avis,”[[37]](#footnote-37) which could include homophobia or understandings of homosexuality that are centred on men. Furthermore, their framing (or lack of framing) for other translations suggests that their catalogue is not intended as a trial of the foreign: their messages are positioned as coming from Steinkis and Steinkis authors, not as coming from outside France.

That accounts for Steinkis’s preoccupation with “la relation à l’Autre.” But what about the Others themselves? “Gay readers,” Harvey explains, “will turn to gay fiction in order to see reflected and illuminated aspects of their own experience.”[[38]](#footnote-38) The French loan word “gay” speaks to at least one aspect of that experience in France—the imported nature of various facets of gay culture, from Act Up-Paris to *la Gay Pride.* Harvey sums up this reality with a poignant unanswered question: “Does the advancement of a definition [for the word gay] contribute to an emerging transcultural emancipatory strategy or, rather, does it constitute an Anglo-American neoimperialist ruse?”[[39]](#footnote-39) Harvey also reflected in 1998 that the “lack of a comfortable, home-grown label for the category reflects a more general reluctance in France to recognize the usefulness of identity categories as the springboard for political action.”[[40]](#footnote-40) Although we cannot assume these observations hold true today, they suggest that hybridity across cultures and languages has been important in French gay history and experience.

I will argue that *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* illustrates (literally and figuratively) how significant identity- and community-building happens around English-language touchstones of gay culture, even in France. As explained below, the performance of translation is uninterrupted in this book: Claire Martinet never explicitly declares herself. Instead of fabricating an author who came to terms with their sexuality through entirely French and Francophone cultural experiences, though, the performance creates someone who *thinks* about various formative experiences in French—which is realistic enough!

# **The illusion of a gay French author**

Opening *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* reveals a book flap with two sentences about Eleanor Crewes and a mention of the Palomino pencils that were used to draw the book’s pictures,[[41]](#footnote-41) opposite a simple cover page with the title, Eleanor Crewes’s name (“scénario et dessin”) and Claire Martinet’s name in slightly smaller print (“traduction de l’anglais”). The next opening has Crewes’s original dedication translated into French, as well as a quote in French quotation marks given without context: “À quoi ne pouvons-nous faire face ensemble?” There is no peritext or commentary on the translation at all, and the immediate French dedication with its mysterious quote effectively creates the illusion of a French-speaking *author* addressing her loved ones with an inside reference. Theo Hermans notes that, in most translations, the translator frames the translation by writing prefatory material in the first person before switching to “the first person that has the translator enacting the original speaker’s discourse.”[[42]](#footnote-42) Here, there is no switch: from the very beginning, the translator’s “je” is performing as a non-existent Francophone author. Two pages later, the *Avant-propos* in the first person continues this performance.

 The opening following the dedication contains the work’s three epigraphs. The first one is from a 2015 interview with Judith Butler on trans rights, which only exists in English and has been translated into French by Martinet.[[43]](#footnote-43) The two other quotes, however, are from Shirley Jackson’s *The Haunting of Hill House* and Sarah Waters’s *Tipping the Velvet,* both of which have easy-to-find published translations. Still, the titles are kept in English, while the quotes are translated into French (from scratch—they do not match the existing translations).[[44]](#footnote-44) The result is a striking juxtaposition of languages that can be interpreted in at least two ways.

First, these English titles could be subtle, space-saving ways of highlighting the fact of translation. The English title left intact in the *Avant-propos* certainly points to this: “THE TIMES I KNEW I WAS GAY est une idée qui m’est venue….”[[45]](#footnote-45) Second, the epigraph page could contribute to the illusion of an author who has read these iconic queer books, either in French knowing they were translated or in English, and who has attached personal significance to the quotes as she remembers them, in her native language. The fact that Shirley Jackson’s “get things out in the open” becomes “étaler les choses au grand jour” supports this reading. “Grand jour” creates a thematic link to the memoir’s conclusion, where Crewes describes associating the colour orange with her childhood: “Orange ... comme la lumière du soleil à travers les paupières,” with a picture of bright sunlight.[[46]](#footnote-46) These two interpretations are not mutually exclusive. The first one is a good example of how textual hybridity might manifest in graphic novel translations, where time limits, printing limits and the publisher’s ownership of the translation make prefatory material rare. The second one, however, falls within our proposed framework of gay community-building across and within linguistic boundaries, and is further supported by the way intertextuality is handled in the rest of the book.

# **Intertext in text and picture**

According to Risterucci-Roudnicky:

Si le traducteur décèle l’intertexte, il peut soit recourir à la note ou au commentaire pour le révéler, soit le transformer en « intertexte récepteur ». Dans ce dernier cas émerge un texte dans la « langue de la traduction », qui s’écarte de l’original mais lui est lié par des liens d’analogie. … Le traitement de l’intertextualité dans l’opération de traduction révèle la posture du traducteur, conditionnée par la place qu’il attribue au lecteur-destinataire.[[47]](#footnote-47)

There are no notes or commentary here, so the emergent language of translation—spoken by our non-existent, performed Francophone author—literally illustrates what it might be like to connect with touchstones of gay and alternative culture in English, as a Francophone. That is, titles of outside works are generally translated in the narration, but reproduced exactly in speech bubbles and pictures.

Klaus Kaindl’s “translation-relevant anatomy of comics” will help to illustrate this point. The untranslated titles of works are mostly in inscriptions, “the linguistic elements to be found on objects within the pictures, for instance labels, names on houses, posters and so on. Their function is to indicate local, temporal or historical references.”[[48]](#footnote-48) Most of the inscriptions in *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* have been translated, even though it would probably have been easier not to—Kaindl observes that source material is often kept the same “due to production-related problems, since any changes would imply considerable financial expense and may have an adverse effect on the aesthetic quality of the pictures.”[[49]](#footnote-49) Translated inscriptions include “Fantômes” on Ellie’s book cover on pp. 15 and 47, the name of a sci-fi merch store on p. 21,[[50]](#footnote-50) labels on moving boxes on p. 193, the advertisement on the side of a bus on p. 201, an exit sign on p. 206 and herb labels in the grocery store on p. 207.[[51]](#footnote-51) This makes untranslated work titles in inscriptions stand out: Stephen King’s *It* and other novels in a pile of books on p. 54, the names of movies in a speech bubble on p. 62, and the novel *The Lovely Bones* that T is reading to Ellie on p. 291. These English-language works inhabit the memoir’s essentially Francophone world of picture and dialogue.

Narrations, on the other hand, are the parts of comics that often appear at the top or bottom and “mark changes in time and space as well as … explain moods and situations which are hard to depict through imagery alone.”[[52]](#footnote-52) Here, they usually represent the author retelling her own life, and the work titles within them are either translated or worked around. *Joseph and the Amazing Technicolor Dreamcoat* is one example: it is given simply as Joseph on p. 147 (the English has the full title) and as “Donny Osmond *et son incroyable manteau de rêve en technicolor”* on p. 158.

References to *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* also fit this pattern. Ellie’s obsession with Willow from *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* is mentioned in both the English and French back-cover blurbs, as well as on the Steinkis website.[[53]](#footnote-53) Mentioning *Buffy* appears to be a draw for readers in both languages. It certainly has massive cultural resonance for gay women, and the show is the most important intertext among many in Crewes’s book. When the show is first mentioned on p. 18 of the translation, the title is indeed translated—incorrectly, as it happens, since *Buffy, tueuse de vampires* (in italics in the text) is the French title of the 1992 movie with Kristy Swanson, not the TV show. (The movie does not have a Willow.) But “tueuse” is still the word used for “slayer” in the VF of the Joss Whedon series. Similarly, in the narration on p. 22, the episode name “Doppelgängland” is translated, this time correctly as the VF episode title “Les Deux Visages.” However, as we might expect, the speech bubbles on p. 20 leave Xander untranslated even though the character is called Alex in the VF.

The memoir also contains two quotes from Buffy’s musical episode[[54]](#footnote-54) that are harder to fit into a pattern. The first one, “What can’t we face if we’re together,” appears as a quote under the dedication.[[55]](#footnote-55) The second, “I lived my life in shadow, never the sun on my face,” appears in Ellie’s speech bubble on p. 231 of the translation, while she draws next to a Willow+Tara poster.[[56]](#footnote-56) Ellie is quoting the opening lines from Tara’s song to Willow at an important turning point in the plot, just before she begins to tell other people she is gay. Neither quote has an attribution, and there are no extra indications such as musical notes to signal that these are quoted lyrics. *Toutes les fois* translates the words into French without adding any explanation.

There are a few ways we could explain this. In Risterucci-Roudnicky’s paragraph on intertexts, quoted earlier, a key phrase is “Si le traducteur décèle l’intertexte.” Martinet simply may simply have missed the reference. But this seems relatively unlikely for the dedication quote, which has quotation marks and would yield the right song with a quick Google. What other choices could have been made? Leaving the quote in English would immediately break the illusion created by the French dedication. Adding a footnote would clash with the book’s clean visual aesthetic as well as Steinkis’s illusionistic approach to translation. Finally, the VF equivalent for this line is “Ensemble nous sommes vraiment les meilleurs,” a painful translation and one that is unlikely to have any iconicity of its own.[[57]](#footnote-57) In this context, it is easy to imagine Martinet consciously choosing to translate the quote without further comment.

 Regardless, according to Risterucci-Roudnicky, we are in the presence of an “intertexte récepteur”: the memoir’s intertextuality has been relocated into the target language and culture. However, the “langue de la traduction” that emerges is not monoculturally or monolingually French. Instead, it describes the complex relationships of a fictional French author with works of “gay writing” that have travelled across languages and borders.

# **Conclusion: The death of the translator**

In the preceding analysis, I have avoided attributing translation choices to any specific agent, whether it be Claire Martinet or Steinkis. Both internal and external factors make such claims risky. Internally, a number of inconsistencies (such as the ones around *Buffy*) make the boundaries between conscious choice, unconscious choice, and outright mistake all but impossible to pin down. Externally, the fact that comic translation ownership cannot be attributed to one individual alone makes the project of determining translator *intentions* frustrating at best and futile at worst.

With the help of Risterucci-Roudnicky’s methodology, this essay has instead provided a reading of the translation, an analysis of its *effects.* Overall, this reading supports Klaus Kaindl’s claim that “the position of comics in a social field has a decisive impact on the shape of the translation.”[[58]](#footnote-58) Part of the social field here is the Francophone gay experience, which has strong ties to the Anglophone one. Together with Steinkis’s history of *littérature engagée* and fluent, target-oriented translations, this context impacts the signs of textual hybridity in *Toutes les fois*: the translation illustrates how identity- and community-building might take place across linguistic boundaries. My reading rests especially on the translated memoir’s title, dedication and epigraphs, as well as the way work titles and cultural references are handled throughout.

Ultimately, my hope is that this essay can serve not only as an example of how translated comics can be taken seriously by scholars, but as a framework for giving social, practical and ideological contexts at least as much weight as any translator’s psyche.

# **Bibliography**

Works studied

Crewes, Eleanor. *The Times I Knew I Was Gay.* New York: Scribner, 2020.
First edition: Virago Press, UK, 2020.

Crewes, Eleanor. *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!* Translated by Claire Martinet. Paris: Steinkis, 2021.

Works cited

Batchelor, Kathryn. “Paratexts.” In *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies,* edited by Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha, 401–405. London: Routledge, 2019.

Berman, Antoine. “Translation and the Trials of the Foreign.” Translated by Lawrence Venuti, originally published in 1985. In *The Translation Studies Reader*, edited by Lawrence Venuti, 284–297. New York: Routledge, 2012.

Harvey, Keith. “Gay Community, Gay Identity and the Translated Text.” *TTR: Traduction, terminologie, rédaction* 13, no. 1 (2000): 137–165. <https://doi.org/10.7202/037397ar>.

Harvey, Keith. “Translating Camp Talk: Gay Identities and Cultural Transfer.” *The Translator*4, no. 2 (1998): 295–320. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.1998.10799024>.

Hermans, Theo. “Positioning.” In *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies,* edited by Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha, 423–428. London: Routledge, 2019.

Kaindl, Klaus. “Thump, Whizz, Poom: A Framework for the Study of Comics Under Translation.” *Target. International Journal of Translation Studies* 11, no. 2 (2012): 263–88. <https://doi.org/10.1075/target.11.2.05kai>.

Risterucci-Roudnicky, Danielle. *Introduction à l'analyse des œuvres traduites.* Paris: Armand Colin, 2008.

Roure, Benjamin. “Moïse Kissous : Hors cases.” *Lives Hebdo*, no. 1124 (April 7, 2017): 26-27. <https://issuu.com/editionsjungle/docs/e194ma20231_20170407135226328-001>

Turcev, Nicolas. “Moïse Kissous (Steinkis): ‘Nous préférons nous concentrer sur la relation avec les librairies.’” *Livres Hebdo*, January 30, 2021. <https://www.livreshebdo.fr/article/moise-kissous-steinkis-nous-preferons-nous-concentrer-sur-la-relation-avec-les-librairies>.

Whedon, Joss, creator. *Buffy the Vampire Slayer.* Originally aired 1997–2003. Beverly Hills, CA: Twentieth Century Fox, 2005. DVD collection. Includes French audio.

Zanettin, Federico. “Comics, manga and graphic novels.” In *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies,* edited by Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha, 75–79. London: Routledge, 2019.

1. Danielle Risterucci-Roudnicky, *Introduction à l'analyse des œuvres traduites* (Paris: Armand Colin, 2008), 60. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Federico Zanettin, “Comics, manga and graphic novels,” in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*, eds. Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha (London: Routledge, 2019), 75. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Klaus Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom: A Framework for the Study of Comics Under Translation,” *Target. International Journal of Translation Studies* 11, no. 2 (2012): 268, doi.org/10.1075/target.11.2.05kai. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Antoine Berman, trans. Lawrence Venuti, “Translation and the Trials of the Foreign,” in *The Translation Studies Reader*, ed. Lawrence Venuti (New York: Routledge, 2012), 286. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. For all the explanations of Risterucci-Roudnicky’s method in this paragraph, see *Introduction à l’analyse,* 86, étapes 2 et 5. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. For Risterucci-Roudnicky’s definition of textual hybridity, see *Introduction à l’analyse,* Chapitre 1. “Marques d’hybridité” is given as “signs of hybridity” in this essay. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Eleanor Crewes, *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!,* trans. Claire Martinet (Steinkis: Paris, 2021). [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. The edition consulted here is Eleanor Crewes, *The Times I Knew I Was Gay* (Scribner: New York, 2020). [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. “Eleanor Crewes,” Johnson & Alcock literary agency, accessed March 29, 2022, [www.johnsonandalcock.co.uk/eleanor-crewes](http://www.johnsonandalcock.co.uk/eleanor-crewes). [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. “Translation,” Johnson & Alcock literary agency, accessed March 29, 2022, [www.johnsonandalcock.co.uk/translation](http://www.johnsonandalcock.co.uk/translation). [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Eleanor Crewes, *Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!*, trans. Claire Martinet (Paris: Steinkis, 2021), inside back cover. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom,” 269. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Claire Martinet, “Claire Martinet,” LinkedIn, [www.linkedin.com/in/cmartinetbazifilms/](https://www.linkedin.com/in/cmartinetbazifilms/). See also the Sorbonne’s description of the “Master Histoire et audiovisuel,” ISOR (Images, SOciétés, Représentations), Panthéon Sorbonne, accessed March 31, 2022, <https://isor.pantheonsorbonne.fr/master-histoire-et-audiovisuel>. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. “Les livres de l'auteur : Claire Martinet,” decitre.fr, accessed March 29, 2022, [www.decitre.fr/auteur/5369081/Claire+Martinet](https://www.decitre.fr/auteur/5369081/Claire%2BMartinet). [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Nicolas Turcev, “Moïse Kissous (Steinkis): ‘Nous préférons nous concentrer sur la relation avec les librairies,’” *Livres Hebdo,* January 30, 2021, <https://www.livreshebdo.fr/article/moise-kissous-steinkis-nous-preferons-nous-concentrer-sur-la-relation-avec-les-librairies>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Eleanor Crewes (@ellistrate), “Mon dieu! So happy that today ‘Toutes Les Fois Où Je Me Suis Dit...Je Suis Gay!’ AKA ‘The Times I Knew I Was Gay’ comes out in France,” Instagram, March 11, 2021, [www.instagram.com/p/CMRgmdghyNx/](https://www.instagram.com/p/CMRgmdghyNx/). [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Eleanor Crewes (@ellistrate), “In case you missed it yesterday,” Instagram, March 12, 2021, [www.instagram.com/p/CMUD\_5LBSy2/](https://www.instagram.com/p/CMUD_5LBSy2/). [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. “Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!,” Éditions Steinkis, accessed March 29, 2022, <https://steinkis.com/livres/toutes-les-fois-ou-je-me-suis-dit-je-suis-gay/toutes-les-fois-ou-je-me-suis-dit-je-suis-gay.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. Kathryn Batchelor, “Paratexts,” in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*, eds. Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha (London: Routledge, 2019), 402. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. “Les Maisons du Groupe,” Steinkis Groupe, accessed March 31, 2022, <http://www.steinkis-groupe.com/les-maisons-du-groupe/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. The interviewer concurred: “Des millions d’exemplaires plus tard, Jungle est un éditeur qui compte.” Benjamin Roure, “Moïse Kissous : Hors cases,” *Lives Hebdo*, no. 1124 (April 7, 2017): 27 <https://issuu.com/editionsjungle/docs/e194ma20231_20170407135226328-001>. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Both quotes are from Turcev, “Moïse Kissous (Steinkis).” [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. “Les Maisons du Groupe,” Steinkis Groupe, accessed March 31, 2022, <http://www.steinkis-groupe.com/les-maisons-du-groupe/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. “Steinkis Éditions – Éditeur de romans graphiques,” accessed March 31, 2022, <https://steinkis.com/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. “Steinkis Groupe à l’international,” Steinkis Groupe, accessed March 31, 2022, <http://www.steinkis-groupe.com/international-rights/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Risterucci-Roudnicky, *Introduction à l'analyse,* 86, étape 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Wikipedia, s.v. “Marche des fiertés en France,” last modified January 22, 2022, 22:27, <https://fr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Marche_des_fiert%C3%A9s_en_France>. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. “On emploie généralement *gai* au Québec et *gay* en France.” *Usito*, s.v. “gai, gaie ou gay,” accessed April 1, <https://usito.usherbrooke.ca/d%C3%A9finitions/gay>. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Risterucci-Roudnicky, *Introduction à l'analyse,* 67. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. “Unlike the adjective, the noun gay usually denotes men only.” *Fowler’s Dictionary of Modern English Usage (4 ed.)*, edited by Jeremy Butterfield, s.v. “gay,” published online 2015, <https://www-oxfordreference-com.lib-ezproxy.concordia.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780199661350.001.0001/acref-9780199661350-e-2315>. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. *Usito*, s.v. “gai,” where the noun has “SPÉCIALT homme homosexual” marked and the adjective is defined as “relatif à l'homosexualité, spécialement à l'homosexualité masculine.” Compare this to Merriam-Webster, where “especially: a gay man” is noted for the noun form only. S.v. “gay,” accessed April 1, 2022, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/gay>. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, season 7, episode 6, “Him,” written by Drew Greenberg, aired November 5, 2002, on UPN and June 6, 2003, on Série Club, DVD, 33:40. [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, season 7, episode 14, “First Date,” written by Jane Espenson, aired February 11, 2003, on UPN and September 19, 2003, on Série Club, DVD, 37:07. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Risterucci-Roudnicky, *Introduction à l'analyse,* 67. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. Original emphasis. Harvey, “Gay Community,” *TTR: Traduction, terminologie, rédaction* 13, no. 1 (2000): 140, <https://doi.org/10.7202/037397ar>. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. “In applying the concept of positioning to translation, a basic assumption is that the translation is delivered to an audience by someone, and that the very fact of delivering it already allows an observer to make assumptions about the presenter.” Theo Hermans, “Positioning,” in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*, eds. Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha (London: Routledge, 2019), 423–428. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Turcev, “Moïse Kissous (Steinkis),” as above. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. Harvey, “Gay Community,” 138. [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Harvey, “Gay Community,” 141. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Keith Harvey, “Translating Camp Talk: Gay Identities and Cultural Transfer,” *The Translator*4, no. 2 (1998): 310, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.1998.10799024>. [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. In the Scribner edition, which has no book flap, this text appears on the last page before the back cover. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Hermans, “Positioning,” 427. [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. The attribution is simply “Butler, 2015,” and the interview is this one: Cristan Williams, “Gender Performance: The TransAdvocate Interviews Judith Butler,” *The TransAdvocate,* accessed April 9, 2022, <https://www.transadvocate.com/gender-performance-the-transadvocate-interviews-judith-butler_n_13652.htm>. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. For *Hill House,* see “Les gens, ajouta le docteur avec tristesse, sont toujours tellement désireux de nommer les choses” in Shirley Jackson, *La Maison hantée,* trans. Dominique Mols (Rivages: Paris, 2018), chap. 3, pretnumérique.ca. For *Tipping the Velvet,* see Sarah Waters, *Caresser le velours,* trans. Erika Abrams (Denoël: Paris, 2002), 506. [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Crewes, *Toutes les fois,* “Avant-Propos,” 7. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. Crewes, *Toutes les fois,* 313. [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. Risterucci-Roudnicky, *Introduction à l'analyse,* 74. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom,” 275. [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. The sci-fi merch store is the UK chain Forbidden Planet, translated as Planète Interdite, which preserves the general atmosphere of a nerdy emporium in exchange for eliminating the specific reference. [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. All page numbers refer to the Steinkis edition. To find the corresponding page in the Scribner edition, add two. Note that some inconsistencies can still be attributed to the quick production time and/or expense; for example, the “Happy Birthday” banner on p.17 is left intact, but it might well have been too complicated to redraw “Joyeuse fête” as individual letters hanging from a string. Likewise, on p. 207 “basil” becomes “basilic,” but on p. 208 it remains “basil.” This is easily attributable to human error. [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. “Toutes les fois où je me suis dit… je suis gay!,” Éditions Steinkis. [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. Both quotes below from *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, season 6, episode 7, “Once More, with Feeling,” written by Joss Whedon, aired November 6, 2001, on UPN and June 25, 2002, on Série Club, DVD. [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. Note that this quote does not appear in the dedication of the Scribner edition, but Steinkis’s manuscript presumably came from the Virago (UK) version. It is given in *Toutes les fois* as “À quoi ne pouvons-nous faire face ensemble?” [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. Given in *Toutes les fois* as “J’ai passé ma vie dans l’ombre. Sans jamais sentir le soleil sur mon visage.” [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. The podcast *Pourquoi Buffy c’est genial* and their online commenters have discussed the poor quality of the French dub, even though they frequently rely on it. See “PBCG INVESTIGATIONS #1 : LA DIRECTION ARTISTIQUE DU DOUBLAGE VF – PART 1,” posted August 5, 2014, <https://pourquoibuffycestgenial.wordpress.com/2014/08/05/pbcg-investigations-1-la-direction-artistique-du-doublage-vf-part-1/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. Kaindl, “Thump, Whizz, Poom,” 273. [↑](#footnote-ref-58)