DRAFT NOTES:

Highlighting identifies problems needing attention.

{Curly brackets} are notes that can be removed upon resolution.

Page #s from Zhan Ru's book (e.g. {p1}) are noted for editing convenience and should be retained until editing is complete.

{p29}

Chapter Two: The Organization and Character of Dunhuang's Buddhist Temples, Meditation Caves, and *Araṇya*

2.1 Preamble

Dunhuang, which is situated in the western part of Gansu Province, is the earliest of four commanderies (*jun* 郡) that were established after Han Wudi 漢武帝 took Hexi 河西[[1]](#footnote-1) from the Xiongnu 匈奴. It was a place of strategic importance in the military affairs of the Han and Tang dynasties and is a town of international importance {國際要邑}. Since the Han dynasty, the road leading from China to Western Regions {caps or no?} (*xiyu* 西域), in order to avoid the Taklamakan Dessert directly to the west, follows along the edge of the desert and splits into northern and southern routes. According to accounts in 'Xiyu zhuan' 西域傳 [Historical Accounts of Western Regions] of the *Hanshu* 漢書 [Book of Han], the southern route passed through Loulan 樓蘭 (the northeast of today's Ruoqiang County), Yutian于闐 (Hetian/Hotan), Pishan皮山, Shache莎車 (Yarkant), passing through Congling葱嶺 (the Pamir Mountains of Tajikistan) to arrive at Dayueshi大月氏 (Afghanistan) and Anxi安息 (Parthia), and then to the west reaching Tiaozhi 條支 ({Tajiks--treat as a toponym or people? Rong, 18 Lectures, 53 has "Tiaozhi (in the Persian Gulf)"}) on the Arabian Peninsula and the Roman Empire of the Mediterranean Sea. The northern route passed through the former royal court at Cheshi 車師 (Gaochang 高昌, present-day Turpan), Guizi 龜兹 (Kuche/Kuqa), Gumo 姑墨 (Akesu/Aksu), and Shule 疏勒 (Kashi/Kashgar), going through the Pamir Mountains to arrive at Dayuan 大宛 ({a town in Ferghana?}) and Kangju 康居 (Samarkand), and potentially also to reach Parthia and the Roman Empire. For both the southern and northern routes, the starting point was Dunhuang. At the time, the 'Sunny Frontier Pass' (Yang guan 陽關) was set up to Dunhuang's southwest and a 'Jade-Gate Frontier Pass' (Yumen guan 玉門關) was set up to the northwest, controlling the comings and goings of the two routes, geographically positioned at the hubs of transportation.

Because Dunhuang served as the gateway to immediate neighbors in the Western Regions, it became a place for the gathering of Eastern and Western civilizations, first receiving the influence of Indian Buddhist culture and becoming one of China's earliest Buddhist centers. The 'Shilao zhi' 釋老志 [Records of Buddhists and Daoists] in the *Wei shu* 魏書 [Book of Wei] has this account: 'Dunhuang has hamlets lined up in succession {/is a village forming a row}, with many pagodas and temples' 敦煌村塢相屬，多有塔寺.

In Dunhuang society of the medieval period {中古時期}, a relatively outstanding characteristic feature is that monasteries {寺院} stood in great numbers and monks and nuns were numerous.{p30} With support and encouragement from the political authorities of Turpan and the Guiyi Army {'Guiyijun'?}, monasteries and monks and nuns all had relatively high social standing. In the period of rule by Turpan {the Yar klungs dynasty of Tibet}, there were twelve temples with monks and nuns {僧尼寺 or 'monasteries and convents'?}; in the period following rule by Turpan these increased to fourteen or fifteen; in the Zhang-family Guiyi Army period there were sixteen; and in the period that followed, [the number of temples] increased to seventeen,[[2]](#footnote-2) while at the same time there were three meditation caves and some *araṇya*蘭若.[[3]](#footnote-3) By the end of the ninth century, the number of monks and nuns in Dunhuang's religious communities reached over one thousand people;[[4]](#footnote-4) religious practitioners and their population of dependents comprised at least one-fifth of Shazhou's 沙州 (Dunhuang's){ I see this equated with Dunhuang, but it is perhaps the larger area around Dunhuang?} total population.[[5]](#footnote-5) The presence of organized activities for copying scripture made the Buddhist canon of Dunhuang's monasteries quite impressive. Such foreign and Chinese{蕃漢} Greatly Virtuous Ones (*dade*大德, Skt. *bhadanta*) as Tankuang曇曠, Moheyan 摩訶衍 (Tb. Ma ha ya na), and Facheng 法成 (Tb. Chos 'grub) settled here, writing, translating scriptures, practicing meditation, and propagating the Dharma, helping to advance Dunhuang Buddhism's studious atmosphere.

The organizational structure of Dunhuang Buddhism of the medieval period and the Vinaya Piṭaka rules of sectarian Buddhism in India have a direct relationship, with some key administrative systems of [Dunhuang] monasteries following some of the traditions of Indian Buddhist monasteries, taking these as a foundation for shaping many of Dunhuang's regional characteristics. In the Turpan period, the *dusi* 都司 (Management Office) was the overarching organization for Dunhuang Buddhism, administering control of all activities of Dunhuang Buddhist communities. The core group of leaders in this [office] was comprised of teachers {教授 not clear if singular or plural} dispatched from Tibet and one or two Han Chinese clergy members chosen from among the local Dunhuang saṃgha.

Monasteries (*siyuan* 寺院) are the substance of Dunhuang Buddhism and the locus of religious belief; Dunhuang's several meditation caves (*chanku* 禪窟) provided a site for the meditation practice of monks and nuns, and *araṇya* 阿蘭若, which initially had served as places of quiet practice, at Dunhuang more often stood out for functioning as [venues for] lay Buddhist societies (*sheyi* 社邑) and were strongly characterized by a concern over good lineage {並有濃厚的名門望族色彩}. Monasteries and meditation caves constitute the basic structural units of Dunhuang Buddhist communities. We will, in this present book, first discuss problems concerning Dunhuang monasticism's organization, which will have important implications for deepening our understanding of the form and character of religious groups {教團 also 'religious communites' below} of the Dunhuang region.

{31}Regarding research on the organization of Dunhuang monasticism, such works as Jacques Gernet's *Zhongguo wu–shi shiji de siyuan jingji* 中國五–––十世紀的寺院經濟 [Monastic Economy in China from the Fifth through Tenth Centuries][[6]](#footnote-6) and Yamazaki Hiroshi's 'Tōdai sōkan seido' 唐代僧官制度 [The System of Saṃgha Officials in the Tang Dynasty][[7]](#footnote-7) {both cited in Ch1; repeat characters and translations, or drop here?} discussed in succession [sic.]{Yamazaki's work is earlier} Dunhuang monasticism and problems concerning the office of the Superintendent of the Clergy (*sengtong*僧統) in Dunhuang's Buddhist communities. Fujieda Akira and Chikusa Masaaki's brilliant studies on this issue are also a foundation upon which we can progress our theories. Jiang Boqin performed detailed textual research on the office of the *siqing* 寺卿 (temple minister) in such of his writings as *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*[[8]](#footnote-8) and *Dunhuang shehui wenshu daolun*,[[9]](#footnote-9) pointing out that the *siqing* served as manager of the temple-household (*sihu*寺戶), cooperating with all the temple administrators {諸寺綱管} to take care of temple affairs. Based on Buddhist scriptures {內典}, he also expounded on the necessity of a *siqing* for the establishment of a nunnery, progressing one step forward to touch on the organization of religious communities. Doi {INBUDS: Tohi}Yoshikazu's 'Jiin to seikatsu' 寺院と生活 [Monasteries and Life] is an important piece of research in this area.[[10]](#footnote-10) In Tanaka Ryōshō's paper 'Shoki zenshū no kairitsu ron' 初期禪宗の戒律論 [A Discussion of Moral Restraints and Rules of Discipline in the Early-Period Chan School], he touches on problems such as early-period Chan Buddhist communities and Rules of Purity,[[11]](#footnote-11) having important understandings for those of us researching the nature of Dunhuang monasticism. Publication of Chunwen's book *Tang houqi Wudai Song chu Dunhuang sengni de shehui shenghuo* 唐後期五代宋初敦煌僧尼的社會生活 [The Social Life of Dunhuang's Monks and Nuns in the Late Tang, Five Dynasties, and Early Song][[12]](#footnote-12) has helped the author of this present book add many new understandings during the work of revising and rewriting.

This chapter will, on the foundations set by the research of predecessors, proceed to discuss a problem: {32} What connections can be made between the formulation of rules for monks and nuns in China and the Indian Vinaya Piṭaka? What function did early Chinese Buddhist monastic regulations have in the process of Sinification that was advancing Buddhism? If the *san'gang*三綱 ('Three Cords', the directors of a monastery) of Dunhuang monasticism was the basic level of saṃgha officials (*sengguan* 僧官) leading monks and nuns in their practice and studies, what was the function of the *san'gang* of Dunhuang monasticism during the Turpan and Guiyi Army periods? The focus of our attention is the organizational structure of the three meditation caves, the nature of the *araṇya* {蘭若 trans. as 'hermitage'?}, and the formal characteristics of Dunhuang monasticism {敦煌寺院}. Below, we will clarify and discuss the above problems.

2.2 Early Monastic Regulations in China

2.2.1 The *Standards for Monks and Nuns* by Dao'an {Existing Eng TOC: 'The Disciplinary Regulation of Monks and Nuns by Ven. Dao An', or use 'Sengni guifan'/ *Sengni guifan*?}

Around the sixth century before the Common Era, Śākyamuni first turned the wheel of the Dharma in the Deer Park {鹿野苑} [at Sarnath], preaching such essential points of Buddhist learning as the four noble truths 四諦and dependent origination緣起, persuading five monks to leave home {? the ascetics had already abandoned their homes, no? should this not be a matter of conversion to the Buddha's way?}. This is the primary symbol of the formation of the Buddhist saṃgha. In the foundational period of Buddhist teachings, when there was a person who wanted to enter the saṃgha, he only had to arrive in front of the Buddha and explain his reasons and the Buddha would say to the one who came [only] the words, 'Welcome, monk' 善來比丘, and this person would then and there become a member of the saṃgha. The early-period Buddhist saṃgha existed under a kind of egalitarian and common-living principle,[[13]](#footnote-13) the first twelve years after Śākyamuni attained awakening {成道}, the Buddhist saṃgha did not show an appearance of moral restraints and rule of discipline, but only used self-reflection and the Verse of the Shared Morality of the Seven Buddhas七佛通誡偈 ('Don't do bad things; practice acts of goodness; purify your intentions––These are the teachings of the Buddhas' 諸惡莫作 諸善奉行 自淨其意 是諸佛教) to regulate one's body and mind.

The internal observances{內部行事} and administration of monastic affairs{法務} of pre-sectarian Buddhism{原始佛教} were all determined on the basis of the saṃgha's ecclesiastical proceedings (*jiemo* 羯磨, Skt. *karman*), that is, the three types of ecclesiastical proceedings.[[14]](#footnote-14) In the thirteenth year after Śākyamuni attained awakening, Buddhist moral restraints and rules of discipline gradually started being drawn up, passing through their first formulation and recitation in their long and slow process of formation. {33} In the historical process of setting up and refining the moral restraints and rules of discipline, the saṃgha had, internally, a certain level of discrepancy in understanding of the actual clauses, which influenced compilation of and deliberation on the Vinaya Piṭaka, and which guided pre-sectarian Buddhism toward a transformation into sectarian Buddhism. Regardless of whether we are speaking of the eighteen sects or the twenty-something sects recorded in early Buddhist documents, the understandings involved in moral restraints and rules of discipline almost all have the characteristics of the individual sect; each sect has its own vinaya system {note that I am varying between the long-hand and short-hand for戒律, choosing 'moral restraints and rules of discipline' vs 'vinaya' depending on the context}. Wang Bangwei once stated, 'Using different rules of discipline became the primary indicator for differentiating between different sects'.[[15]](#footnote-15)

Construction of the saṃgha institutions of early Chinese Buddhism and the process of the Sinification of Buddhism almost move in tandem. In the development of Buddhism in China since the beginning of the two Jin dynasties until the period of the North South Dynasties, the number of monasteries and monks and nuns increased, with establishment of a *bhikṣu* saṃgha and a *bhikṣuṇī* saṃgha{比丘尼僧團}. For the Buddhist saṃgha at the time, the most pressing task was to strengthen the organizational build of the saṃgha, to improve the managerial structure of the saṃgha, and to endeavor to make the disciplinary institutions directly or indirectly transmitted from India gradually adapt to the requirements for Buddhism's development in China. A core motivation of pilgrimages to the west to seek the Dharma in the early period of Chinese [Buddhism] was to improve the moral restraints and rules of discipline.[[16]](#footnote-16) The vinaya being incomplete, the drawing up of rules for the saṃgha, strengthening the management of educational oversight {教務管理awk}, and enabling the life of practice and study of monks and nuns to conform with the teachings and with the rules of discipline––[these] had already garnered a great deal of concern from Buddhist leaders of the time. Such leaders of the saṃgha as Dao'an道安, Zhu Senglang 竺僧朗, Huiyuan 慧遠 all made exploratory efforts in the area of formulating rites and rules. Among these, Dao'an's *Sengni guifan* 僧尼規範 [Standards for Monks and Nuns] is most representative. Zanning's 贊寧*Dasong sengshi lüe*大宋僧史略 [Song-Dynasty Outline of the History of the Buddhist Clergy] records,

Dharma Teacher Dao'an of the Jin dynasty was troubled by the incompleteness of the moral restraints and rules of discipline, feeling pained over the many inadequacies of deportment, and therefore patched up the mistakes, dammed its flows, set up three precedents to command a regulation, such that [people] are at once convinced: 1) The offering of incense, sitting in meditation, and attending lectures; 2) the six periods of worship and confession; and 3) methods [of practice] such as the *poṣadha*. If [anyone] surpasses these standards of behavior, then do not set up obstacles... These three precedents are to be respectfully carried out by all. 晉道安法師傷戒律之未全，痛威儀之多缺，故彌縫其闕，㙌堰其流，立三例以命章，使一時而生信。一行香定座上講，二六時禮懺，三布薩等法，過踰此法者，則別立遮防…… 上之三例，天下翕然奉行也。

The biography of Dao'an in the fifth fascicle of the *Gaoseng zhuan* 高僧傳 [Biography of Eminent Monks] also says,

{34}The standards drawn up for monks and nuns, the patterns [set by] the Buddha's teachings, have three articles: 1) The methods of offering incense, sitting in meditation, and attending lectures; 2) the daily period-based methods of circumambulating, drinking, eating, and chanting during the six periods; and 3) such methods as repenting one's errors in [practice of] the *poṣadha* {or separate these: 'the *poṣadha* and repenting of one's errors'?}. All temples and hermitages meet these standards and comply with them. 所制僧尼軌範、佛法憲章，條為三例：一曰行香定座上講之法；二曰常日六時行道飲食唱時法；三曰布薩差使悔過等法。天下寺舍，遂則而從之。

In the Three Kingdoms period, although Dharmakāla (Tankejialuo) 曇柯迦羅 and Tandi曇諦 translated some content such as the methods {法 method of practice, custom, model; this Chinese usage follows from 'dharma' as 'custom', no? In some cases 'custom' seems more fitting, but 'method' is more common in existing translations} for conferring precepts found in the *Mahāsāṃghika Vinaya* (*Mohesengqi lü* 摩訶僧祇律) of the Mahāsāṃghika school and the *Dharmaguptaka Vinaya* (*Sifen lü*四分律 or Four-Part Vinaya) of the Dharmagupta school, they were nonetheless still unable to satisfy the needs of the developing saṃgha. The construction of moral restraints and rules of discipline in Dao'an's time was still at the stage of just having taken some first steps. And the group of monks that Dao'an personally presided over, 'Had teachers and students numbering in the several hundreds, tireless in [undertaking] fasts of purification and lectures. They lacked the arts of transformation, yet could puzzle the eyes and ears of the common person; they lacked great power, yet could organize the group and minimize its unevenness. And their teachers and followers acted respectfully to one another.' 師徒數百，齋講不倦。無變化伎術，可以惑常人之耳目；無重威大勢，可以整群小之參差。而師徒肅肅，自相尊敬。[[17]](#footnote-17){assuming this is a positive assessment, I have interpreted it as such, but the tranl may need clarification} This passage helps us see the imposing manner of 'the mountain-community spirit, a purity of the six ways in which the clergy harmonize with each other' 山門精神，六和清淨displayed by Dao'an's community of monks and which became a model for the construction of Buddhist communities at the time, held in high esteem by the two worlds of clergy and laypeople. The achievement of Dao'an in the area of constructing a community of monks, apart from the influence of his own purity of moral discipline and lofty character, it is on the basis of the basic spirit of the vinaya to 'adapt the rules of discipline to local conditions' 隨方毗尼, adhering to the traditions of the sectarian vinaya of India while making every effort to ~~construct and~~ {redund.?} formulate rules and regulations for the saṃgha in China. The Standards for Monks and Nuns {or no caps? treat as document (w/ ital.) or description?} formulated by Dao'an were promoted by the Buddhist world as the Charter of the Buddhadharma 佛法憲章, observed by monasteries and communities of monks one after another, and in this way a first attempt at the Sinification of Buddhist institutions.

According to the accounts in the *Dasong sengshi lüe* and the *Gaoseng zhuan*, the primary content of the Standards for Monks and Nuns is:

1) The methods of offering incense, settling onto one's seat {定座上this punctuation is a point of debate; see below}, lectures on scripture and the attendance of lectures, these being the ceremonies for scriptural exegesis and explanation of the Buddhist teachings. *Xingxiang* 行香 refers to the time at the start of a Dharma assembly for a lecture on the scriptures when an elder venerable of the saṃgha distributes incense to the assembly for offering incense {敬香} before an image of the Buddha, for the purpose of testifying one's faith and dignifying the entire Dharma assembly. The next item concerns getting seated {定座 usually 'mental concentration', but clearly that is not meant here} and lectures on the scriptures. On these [items], Ui Hakuju宇井伯壽, in his *Shaku Dōan kenkyū* 釋道安研究 [Research on Shi Dao'an], divided these lines as 行香、定座上講、經上講, considering 座上講 to refer to lecturing on scripture from atop a ceremonial platform {禮臺}, while經上講 refers to sequential exegesis of scripture.[[18]](#footnote-18) {35} Meanwhile, Ōchō Enichi, in his book *Chūgoku bukkyō no kenkyū* 中國佛教の研究 [Research on Chinese Buddhism], divides the phrase 行香定座上講經上講 as *xingxiang* 行香, *dingzuo* 定座, *shangjing* 上經, and *shangjiang* 上講. This would indicate that to *xingxiang* is to first offer incense to the monks on the occasion of lay benefactors' [sponsoring] a vegetarian banquet {齋often interpreted as a vegetarian banquet, but I prefer 'fast of purification', since this is lay involvement in something like the poṣadha---the 八關齋戒 mentioned in Ch1--- and would have entailed more than just food, no?}. To *dingzuo jizhai* 定座即齋 is to set out a banquet for the holy saṃgha {聖僧}; to *shangjing* and *shangjiang* is to, after receiving the lay benefactors' vegetarian food, recite scriptures for them and lecture [on their meanings]. Based on this [interpretation], Ōchō Enichi goes a step further to conclude that 行香定座上講經上講 is the custom of reciting scriptures and lecturing on them during times when the clergy is receiving support.[[19]](#footnote-19) Fukui Fumimasa 福井文雅, in his paper 'Tōdai zokukō gishiki no seiritsu wo meguru shomondai' 唐代俗講儀式の成立をめぐる諸問題 [Some Problems Concerning the Formation of the Tang-Dynasty Public-Lecture Ceremony], first summarizes the sequence of the Tang-dynasty public-lecture protocols {俗講儀規} according to these eight points: 1) The bell is struck and the assembly enters the hall; 2) the lecturer (*jiangshi* 講師) and organizers enter the hall; 3) the lecturer and the others ascend to the high seats and praise the names of the buddhas {稱讚佛名 plural or singular?}; 4) after [everyone] takes a seat {定座ZR does not clarify how this is to be interpr; see釋氏要覽 T2127\_.54.0275c04}, the assembly is called to order with a melody and [then] the title of a scripture is chanted {唱經題目}; 5) a lecture is given on a scripture following its three divisions; 6) the reasons behind the enactment of ceremonial protocols are set out; 7) [there is] a discussion period with questions and answers or the lecturer revisiting points, etcetera; and 8) the lay benefactor makes a vow {發願} and donates things. And so [he] thinks that Dao'an's '*xingxiang, dingzuo, shangjing, shangjiang zhi fa*' 行香、定座、上經、上講之法 has points of similarity with the sequential structure of the public lectures of the Tang dynasty.[[20]](#footnote-20)

We, on the other hand, think that if one understands 行香定座上講經上講 as 'offering incense' 行香, 'settling onto one's seat' 定座上, and 'the lecturer on scripture goes up to lecture' 講經上講, this is more suitable. It is indeed at the start of a Dharma assembly that incense is offered, then the lecturer goes up to sit, and finally [the lecturer] expounds on the Buddhist teachings {佛法 or use 'Buddha Dharma'?} following Dao'an's own divisions of 'introduction' 序分, 'the main discussion' 正宗分, and 'explanation of the text's dissemination' 流通分. From this sequence, we can deduce that the meeting place for lecturing on scripture was a dignified scene, with Buddhist images on display and hanging banners.

Secondly, the daily custom of having periods for practice, eating, drinking, and chanting during the six periods of a day is none other than the regulation regarding getting up to practice, to worship and repent {禮懺}, and to eat, drink, chant, and preach during the six periods of day and night. Regarding this point, it is probably because Zanning was still not entirely clear in his time about the methods for chanting periods {唱時法} that he only mentioned the six periods of worship and repentance (*liushi lichan*六時禮懺) in his *Dasong sengshi lüe*. {36} Nonetheless, Daoxuan 道宣, in the *Gaoseng zhuan*, had already discussed the six periods of worship and repentance, as well as touched on the methods for periods of eating, drinking, and chanting, yet we are unable to know the specific content of the six periods of worship and repentance.

Still, according to the research of Tsuchihashi Shūkō, this protocol for the six periods of worship and repentance first appeared in the *Dazhidu lun* 大智度論 [Treatise on the *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*]. In the *Dazhidu lun*, mention of the six periods for worship of Buddha {六時禮佛} appears under 'the ritual chanting of the names of the ten Buddhas' {十佛名號} and under 'repentance before a Buddha' {佛前懺悔}. He also points out that the spread of worship and repentance [rites] indicates the transition from rules for the saṃgha having precepts for monks {比丘戒} as their core to bodhisattva precepts, constituting a kind of change of viewpoint on the moral restraints and rules of discipline.[[21]](#footnote-21) If we understand Dao'an's 'methods for chanting periods within the six periods' 六時唱時法 to be a kind of 'chanting and preaching' ( ) {literally 'chanting and guiding'--that is, guiding people in the meaning of the teachings}, then the 'six periods of worship and repentance' later had a direct influence on the Tang-dynasty Buddhist world. In Daoxuan's 'Zhu za yao xing pian' 諸雜要行篇 [Article on Various Essential Practices] from within his *Sifenlü shanfan buque xingshi chao* 四分律刪繁補缺行事鈔 [Transcription of Abridged and Augmented Rules of Conduct from the Four-Part Vinaya] and in Tiantai Zhiyi's 天台智顗 'Lizhi fa diyi' 立制法第一 [Establishing Methods Part One] from the first fascicle of *Guoqing bailu* 國清百錄 [A Hundred Records from Guoqing Temple] we can see traces of the influence of the 'six periods of worship and repentance', forming a genealogy for the 'six periods of worship and repentance' that flows from the *Dazhidulun* to Dao'an to Zhiyi to Daoxuan. It also becomes important content in practice of the Mahāyāna bodhisattva path.

Stipulations for the methods of chanting periods (*changshifa* 唱時法) also originated in India. Content from the *Zengyi ahan jing* 增一阿含經 [Increased by One Āgama Sūtras] that is cited in the *Fayuan zhulin*'s 法苑珠林 [A Pearl Grove in the Dharma Garden] 'Shouqing pian' 受請篇 [Article on Receiving an Invitation] indicates stipulations for the saṃgha's chanting during a *zhai* 齋 {treat as a vegetarian banquet hosted by a benefactor, or a fast of purification? Or leave untranslated?}. 'Methods for chanting periods' (*changshifa* 唱時法) and 'chanting and preaching' (*changdao* 倡導) are related, as recorded in 'An fashi faji jiuzhi sanke di ershiyi' 安法師法集舊製三科第二十一 [The Long-Established Three Categories in Dharma Teacher An's Dharma Collection: Part Twenty-One] from the twelfth fascicle of the *Chu sanzang jiji* 出三藏記集 [Compilation of Notes on the Translation of the Tripiṭaka].[[22]](#footnote-22) At the same time, the 'Baizan pian di sanshisi' 唄贊篇第三十四 [Article on Singing Praise: Part Thirty-Four] from the *Fayuan zhulin* says, 'Long ago during the Jin dynasty, Dharma Teacher Dao'an compiled and established the Three Categories (*sanke* 三科) of *shangjing* 上經, *shangjiang* 上講, and *busa* 布薩 [*poṣadha*]. What former worthies established should not fall to the ground (i.e., be cast aside). These are universal codes that everyone should learn and practice.'[[23]](#footnote-23)

Additionally, the *Huiyuan waizhuan* 慧遠外傳 [Unofficial Biography of Huiyuan] contained in the 'Guyi bu' 古逸部 [Section Containing Old Unedited Works] in the Eighty-Fifth Volume of the Taishō Canon reveals to us some information on Dao'an concerning the *Sengni guifan*, such as, 'At this time the audience was [as big as a] cloud, the [bustle] of benefactors like the sound of a bell in movement. As the time for the lecture was approaching, the preacher (*dujiang* 都講) called for the rector (*weina* 維那) to bring the assembly to order'...'whereupon Dao'an held in his hand the *ruyi* staff, his body seated on a jeweled stand. Priceless incense burned throughout [the hall] and he immediately proclaimed marvelous ideas, sounding his voice to chant and then raising the sūtra title and speaking.' 其時聽眾如雲，施利若鐘聲既動，即上講，都講舉維那作梵……於是道安手把如意，{37} 身座寶臺。廣焚無價香，即宣妙意，發聲乃唱，便舉經題云。[[24]](#footnote-24) {trans. needs a check}

From this we can see that the various rites and ceremonies {禮儀} from when Dao'an's saṃgha held a Dharma gathering are the assembling of the group, ringing of the bell, going up to the lecture {上講}, making the call to order, [the lecturer] ascending to the seat, the preacher burning incense, and chanting of the [scripture] title. Regarding the application of 'chanting and preaching' in different Dharma assemblies and its relationship to the text of a eulogy {贊文}, we will have a detailed discussion based on other selected passages, but Dao'an's stipulation of a time for chanting has us looking for 'chanting and preaching' in [early] Chinese sources.

A third point is [in regards to] ceremonies for the custom of *poṣadha* messengers repenting mistakes (*busa chaishi huiguo fa* 布薩差使悔過法) and the custom of [other attendees] repenting mistakes at a *poṣadha* (*busa huiguo fa* 布薩悔過法). The 'messengers' {差使} is in reference to the stipulation of having the two assemblies {i.e. monks and nuns?} of the saṃgha mutually dispatch messengers, [a practice] which already existed in the time of the Buddha. Dao'an was a relatively early case of a Chinese monk implementing the *poṣadha*, having a great influence on later generations, continuing up to the present day.

The three stipulations discussed above not only gave Dao'an's monastic community rules that they could follow in their practice and studies, it at the same time exerted a huge influence on the later Buddhist world's formulation of educational standards {教制}.

Dao'an's *Sengni guifan*, in the process of its formulation, absorbed much thought from such contemporary Vinaya as the *Shisonglü* 十誦律 [Ten Recitations Vinaya, the *Daśa-bhāṇavāra-vinaya* of the Sarvâstivāda school], the *Sengqilü* 僧祇律 [Vinaya of the Majority, the *Mahāsāṃghika-vinaya* of the Mahāsāṃghika school], and the *Wufenlü* 五分律 [The Five-Part Vinaya, the *Pañcavargika-vinaya* of the Mahīśāsaka school]. Especially since the Eastern Jin, circulation of the *Shisonglü* was quite widespread and Dao'an had even written a preface for the ten-fascicle *Binaiye* 鼻奈耶 [Vinaya] that had recently been translated. According to research by Hirakawa Akira, the *Shisonglü* and the *Binaiye* are [both] Sarvâstivāda {有部} disciplinary texts {律典}.[[25]](#footnote-25) Beginning with Dao'an, Chinese Buddhism, in its process of development, ceaselessly explored and formulated education standards {教制} adapted to the needs of local religious groups, extending from the North-South dynasties to the Sui and Tang dynasties and beyond, a thousand years from start to finish, the generations having no shortage of people. These education standards carry the spirit of the Indian disciplinary texts and also characteristics of Chinese Buddhism, congealing together the wisdom of countless clergy of Buddhism['s doctrinal teachings] and of [China's] sectarian Buddhist schools {?教下與宗門緇侶}.

2.2.2 Monastic Institutions as Viewed in the Dunhuang-Edition *Jiaotuan guizhi*

The Dunhuang-Edition *Jiaotuan guizhi* 教團規制 [Rules and Regulations for Religious Communities] personally collected by Mr. Hao of Beijing has for half a century been nearly unknown to society. {38} Tsukamoto Zenryū 塚本善隆 transcribed the entire scroll based on photographs that he took personally, and published the paper 'Tonkō bon Shina bukkyō kyōdan seiki: toku ni "gyōzō" no saiten ni tsuite' 敦煌本·シナ佛教教团制规[sic.]――特に<行像>の祭典について [The Dunhuang Edition of the Chinese Buddhist 'Rules and Regulations for Religious Communities': Especially Regarding the Festival for Taking an Image on Procession],[[26]](#footnote-26) helping us understand the situation with regional systems of education standards from the Western Wei to the Sui and Tang. According to the research of Moroto Tatsuo 諸戶立雄, the scroll's contained regulations and its regions of distribution are Shaanxi 陝西 or Gansu 甘肅.[[27]](#footnote-27) From this we can vaguely perceive that, in the northwestern regions from the Western Wei to the Sui and Tang, a basic level of the institution of saṃgha officials (*sengguan* 僧官), with the three monastic directors (*san'gang*三綱) at the center, had already been determined. The entire scroll is damaged from head to foot, but the headings have been worked out by Tsukamoto Zenryū, within a total of 217 lines, the division into sections looking like this:

Line 16 Section Five on the Methods for Merit [Making] on the Eighth Day of the Fourth Month, Eighth Day of the Second Month四月八日二月八日功德法第五

Line 33 Section Six on the Methods for [Making] Merit by Leaving Home 出家功德法第六

Line 48 Section Seven on the Methods for Vinaya Teachers 律師法第七

Line 55 Section Eight on the Methods of Practice for Meditation {'Chan'?} Teachers 禪師行法第八

Line 65 Section Nine on the Methods of Practice for Dharma Teachers 法師行法第九

Line 82 Section Ten on the Methods of Practice for Learning the Precepts 學戒行法第十

Line 91 Section Eleven on the Methods of Practice for Learning Meditative Concentration 學定行法第十一

Line 102 Section Twelve on the Methods of Practice for Learning Wisdom 學慧行法第十二

Line 112 Section Thirteen on the Methods of Practice for Controllers (Clergy Leaders) 僧綱維行法第十三

Line 126 Section Fourteen on the Methods of Practice for Temple Leaders 寺綱維行法第十四

Line 159 Section Fifteen on the Methods of Practice for Having Few Desires and Knowing Satisfaction 少欲知足行法第十五

Line 169 Section Sixteen on the Methods for Bearing Humiliation and Not Being Argumentative 忍辱無諍法第十六

Line 184 Section Seventeen on the Methods for Maintaining Accordance with the Dharma and Obey Always the Rules of the 'Instructions on Purity' (for Receiving Donations Through an Intermediary) 着如法服長則說凈法第十七

Line 196 Section Eighteen on Methods for Achieving Purity in the *Poṣadha* 布薩立凈法第十八

Line 202 Section Nineteen on Methods for Teachers to Teach Disciples and Disciples to Receive Teachings 師教弟子並弟子受教法第十九

{39}Among these, the 'Methods of Practice for Temple Leaders' (lines 126-158):

127 The method for setting up a top seat (senior monk or nun), a temple head, and a rector is to gather together with the chief benefactor(s) to discuss and harmoniously elect... 凡置上座丶寺主丶維那之法，必集及檀越議論，和同推舉

128 ...a vinaya teacher, meditation teacher, and Dharma teacher, who may debate the affairs of the clergy; whomever the community is pleased with is set up as the Three Monastic Directors (*san'gang*). These are the clergy leaders (*gangwei* 綱維)... 律師丶禪師丶法師，堪辯僧業，衆所樂者，立為三綱。既為綱

129 ...who for the sake of order must strictly reign in the clergy, [having them] diligently study the Three Activities (*sanye* 三業), [keeping their] deportment lofty and generous, [their] movements becoming principled, [such that] society... 維，理需嚴勒僧徒，勤修三業，威儀翔厚，動成物則，為世

130 ...shows them reverence. They do not commit transgressions; with good words they encourage, teaching repentance, professing joy to sentient beings, helping them to be without disagreements... 所欽。設有過非，善言慰喻，教懺悔，稱悅衆情，令無違諍

131 ...

132 ...from now on, when the many monks and nuns have important... ……自今以後，諸有僧尼，有要

133 ...conditioned matters (i.e., matters arising from relationships in the secular world) and [need to] go beyond the boundaries of the region, they are made to tell the clergy, which grants permission, and then they go to hear [about the matter]. The three Monastic Directors of a temple... ...緣事，出至州界之外者，必令白僧和許，然後聽去。在寺三綱

134 ...may suitably provide hand-written documents... 宜給手牒……

It is not hard to see from the above quoted text that the conditions for appointing the three clergy leaders and the responsibilities of the work after entering a post all have detailed guidelines, the contents of which involve leadership of the monastic community, such as travel permissions, the management of monastic properties, etc. This document is an important resource for understanding the *san'gang* (three clergy-leader) institution for early Chinese [Buddhism]. By the Northern Wei period, the *san'gang* had already been incorporated into the system of saṃgha officials (*sengguan*), as mentioned in a document from the second year of Yongping 永平 (509) of Shizong's [reign] that the monk superintendent (*shamentong* 沙門統) Huishen 惠深 presented to the emperor: 'Rectors, top seats, and temple heads of the various towns, prefectures, and sub-prefectures each decree the moral restraints and rules of discipline and practices them personally, all relying on [these] internal disciplines; if there is anyone who does not understand the disciplinary rules, remove his (or her) authority to preside over others.' 諸州鎮郡維那、上座、寺主，各令戒律自修，咸依内禁，若不解律者，退其本次。[[28]](#footnote-28)

As everyone knows, Zhaoxuan Temple {Zhaoxuansi/Zhaoxuan Temple/ Zhaoxuan temple/Zhaoxuan monastery etc.; I need feedback on preferences for this} 昭玄寺 of the Northern Wei was a central administrative organization of the first class, such that monastic affairs across the country were all managed through Zhaoxuan si and the most basic level of the Superintendent of the Clergy (*sengguan*) was the Three Clergy Leaders (*san'gang*) {How to best handle these? Translate or leave untranslated? Add caps or no?}, who were responsible for a monastery's daily affairs, such as reciting of scriptures, worship and repentance [rites], *zhaihui* 齋會 {fasts of purification/lay-sponsored vegetarian banquets; as above, trans or leave as special Ch institution?}, Buddhist services {佛事}, and the free roaming of monks and nuns. At the time, in the *Jiaotuan guizhi*, [people] emphasized the *san'gang* as the center of operations of religious communities; in the case of the issuing of identifying documents for itinerant monks and nuns, for example, it was the *san'gang* who would jointly sign. From the Northern Wei, religious communities [became] more enormous than ever before, the setting up of *sengguan* {maybe 'monastic officials' or 'clergy administration' is better than the awkward 'Superintendent of the Clergy' from DDB? Or Chen and Li, Zhongying fojiao cidian, 'Director of monks'? Is this one office, or a large administrative structure, as ZR seems to suggest here?} proliferated, and in the northwestern regions, [where] education standards {教規} were based on the spirit of the vinaya, citing widely from canonical Buddhist texts {内典}, [but] had been formulated with local characteristics, there appeared a monastic authority on problems of educational administration [in Chinese Buddhism].{40}

2.3 Administrators {綱管} of Dunhuang Monasteries

According to records in such documents as S. 1947V, P. 3218, S. 3156, and S. 4504, during the period of governance by Turpan and the Guiyi Army periods of the Zhang clan {張氏} and the Cao clan {曹氏}, Dunhuang had, in order according to priority {先後}, monasteries for monks that include Longxingsi 龍興寺, Dayunsi 大雲寺, Lingtusi 靈圖寺, Liantaisi 蓮臺寺, Kaiyuansi 開元寺, Qianyuan 乾元寺, Jin'guangmingsi 金光明寺, Yongansi 永安寺, Baoensi 報恩寺, Yongkangsi 永康寺, Yongshousi 永壽寺, Sanjiesi 三界寺, Xiandesi 顯德寺, and Qianmingsi 乾明寺; monasteries for nuns including Helingxiusi 和靈修寺, Puguangsi 普光寺, Dazhongsi 大乘寺, Anguosi 安國寺, and Shengguangsi 聖光寺; three meditation caves, and some *araṇya*.[[29]](#footnote-29) The *dusi* 都司 (Management Office) was responsible for the administration of the affairs of the entire Dunhuang religious community, this highest administrative organ for Dunhuang Buddhism being situated at Longxingsi.[[30]](#footnote-30) During the earlier period of occupation by Turpan, the *sengguan* system was:

Management Office (*dusi* 都司)––Chief Buddhist Controller (*dusengtong* 都僧統)––Chief Administrative Assistant (*dupan'guan* 都判官)––Administrative Assistant (*pan'guan* 判官)––Three Monastic Directors (*sisan'gang* 寺三綱) {drawing trans from Rong Xinjiang, Eighteen Lectures on Dunhuang}

Nonetheless, in documents from after 810 CE a kind of 'Instructor' (*jiaoshou* 教授) saṃgha official {僧官} begins to appear. Chikusa Masaaki believes that there is a relationship between the prevalence of teaching institutions in Dunhuang Buddhism of the first half of the ninth century and emphasis on the institution of the abbot (Tib. *mkhan po*) in the institutions of Tibetan Buddhism.[[31]](#footnote-31) During the later period of occupation by Turpan, the *sengguan* system was:

Chief Instructor (*dujiaoshou* 都教授)––Deputy Instructor (*fujiaoshou* 副教授)––Chief [Master of the] Teachings and Disciplines (*dufalü* 都法律)––[Master of the] Teachings and Disciplines (*falü* 法律)

[And, aligned with the *dufalü* in descending hierarchical order:] Chief Administrative Assistant (*dupan'guan* 都判官)––Administrative Assistant (*pan'guan* 判官)––Three Monastic Directors (*sisan'gang* 寺三綱)––Temple Minister (*siqing* 寺卿)

{This is how it looks in the Chinese book:}



The *dupan'guan* and *pan'guan* of the period of governance by Turpan were retained in the later period. Monastic occupations in this period thus underwent a change, newly adding a *siqing*, in addition to the three monastic directors (*san'gang*). {41} When Zhang Yichao 張議潮 led Hexi soldiers to overthrow rule by Turpan, each kind of organizational system returned to the Tang standards, with the system of saṃgha officials {僧官} undergoing a corresponding reformation. The highest saṃgha official {僧官} of the Hexi region was renamed '*Hexi dusengtong*' 河西都僧統 (Chief Buddhist Controller of Hexi), below which were set up the Chief Monastic Administrator (*dusengzheng* 都僧政), Monastic Administrator (*sengzheng*僧政), Master of the Teachings and Disciplines (*falü*法律), Chief Administrative Assistant (*dupan'guan* 都判官), Administrative Assistant (*pan'guan* 判官), and the Three Monastic Directors (*sisan'gang* 寺三綱). {use CAPS or not for this kind of official title? the caps create clutter, so I have dropped them later on; need a global decision on this}

The *dusi* 都司 served as the core organization of the Shazhou Buddhist clergy {僧團}, and because of the enormity of the regular operations of the religious communities, with monks and nuns carrying out religious practices according to the Dharma {如法}, apart from the setting up of many saṃgha officials{僧官}, [the *dusi*] also incorporated all kinds of specialized branches, such as the divisions of Donations Office (*chensi* 櫬司) (P. 2638), Effigy Procession Office (*xingxiangsi* 行像司) (S. 0474), Mahāyāna Ordination{or Practice} Site Office (*fangdeng daochang si* 方等道場司) (P. 3167 backside), Scripture Office (*jingsi* 經司)(S. 2142), Lantern Office (*dengsi* 燈司)(S. 5495 and P. 2613), Service Office (*gongsi* 功司)(S. 2042), Office of Merit and Virtue (*gongdesi* 功德司)(S. 4689), Banquet Office (*tangzhaisi* 堂齋司)(S. 4782), Renovation and Building Office (*xiuzaosi* 修造司)(S. 5495 and P. 2613), Office of the Four Quarters (*zhaotisi* 招提司)(P. 3352, S. 1600, P. 3881, S. 6276), Storehouse Office (*cangsi* 倉司)(S. 5806), Office of the Western Storehouse (*xicangsi* 西倉司)(P. 2030 backside), Office of the Storehouse of Permanently Abiding [Property] (*changzhuzangsi* 常住藏司)(S. 0470), Office of Merit and Virtue (*gongdesi* 功德司 [sic.])(P. 4649, S.6980), Sheep Office (*yangsi* 羊司)(S. 6452), [Office of] Sound and Voice (*yinsheng* 音聲)(P. 2613), and Office of the Buddha Canopy (*fozhangsuo* 佛帳所)(P. 3432 and S. 1475).[[32]](#footnote-32)

No matter how much the structure of the upper-levels of the system of saṃgha officials {僧官} was adjusted in the period of governance by Turpan and in the Guiyi Army period, the institution of Three Directors (*san'gang* 三綱) in the administration of all temples {諸寺綱管} was all along the core of the entire foundation of Dunhuang's religious communities. Each monastery was a constitutive unit of Dunhuang's religious community, and the Three Directors {三綱} were the managers of the specific affairs of a monastery. Below, we will attempt to do a comprehensive investigation of institutions such as the Three Directors {三綱} in Dunhuang monasticism.

'Cibu' 祠部 [Bureau of Sacrifice] in the fourth fascicle of the *Datang liudian* 大唐六典 [Six Decrees of the Great Tang Dynasty] records: 'Every temple has one top seat, one temple head, and one chief rector who together administer the affairs of the assembly.' 每寺上座一人、寺主一人、都維那 一人，共綱管衆事。'Zhiguangshi: Honglusi' 職官志•鴻臚寺 [Record of Official Posts: Honglu Temple] in the forty-fourth fascicle of the *Jiutang shu* 舊唐書 [History of the Early Tang Dynasty] [says]: 'The Three Directors of all Buddhist and Daoist temples, and the Great Virtuous Ones (Skt. *bhadanta*) of the capital, all use their lofty and marvelous virtue to augment [the efforts] of those elected by the multitudes.' 凡天下寺觀三綱，及京都大德，皆取其道徳高妙、爲衆所推者補充。'Zhiguangshi: Cibu' 職官志• 祠部 [Record of Official Posts: Bureau of Sacrifice] in the forty-third fascicle of the *Jiutang shu* [says]: 'Every temple sets up the Three Directors, with those of lofty conduct augmenting them. Every temple has one top seat, one temple head, and one chief rector.' 每寺立三綱，以行業髙者充之。每寺上座一人、寺主一人、都維那一人。The three materials, cited above, reveal that the institution of the Three Directors had already by the Tang dynasty spread to various regions and that the most important qualifications of those taking up a post as [one of the] Three Directors was lofty and marvelous virtue and the acclaim of the multitudes {衆望所歸}. At the same time, the specific name for the Three Directors (*san'gang*) had in the Tang dynasty been formally verified and standardized. As Zhangsun Wuji 長孫無忌 says in the sixth fascicle of the *Tang lü shuyi* 唐律疏議 [Commentary on the Tang Code], 'A temple has a top seat, a temple head, and a rector, who are the Three Directors.' 寺有上座、寺主、都維那，是爲三綱。{42}

The Three Directors had some jurisdiction over the enforcing of laws within a monastery. As Niida Noboru wrote in the *Tōrei shūi ho* 唐令拾遺補 [Addenda and Corrigenda to the Remnants of Tang Statutes] edited by Ikeda On and others, 'The Regulations for the Buddhist and Daoist Clergy (*sengdao ge* 僧道格) say that if there are agents who violate the disciplines {?犯苦使者 'troublemakers'?}, the Three Directors file a case [for investigation] and suppress them. They are put in an empty hall, where they are ordered to write out scriptures, a daily lesson being five papers {五紙}. At the end of the day their papers are collected and counted; if sufficient, then they are released. In the case of those who do not understand books, they are sent to apply [themselves in such activities as] staying upon an earthen [or] wooden seat, cultivating merit and virtue. Their seniority and youth are at the time noted, but that is all; this is not used to absolve them {其老小臨時量耳，不合贖也}.'[[33]](#footnote-33) Additionally, epigraphical materials also contain records of the setting up of the Three Directors in Tang-dynasty monasticism. During the years of the Zhen'guan 貞觀 era, the top seat, temple head, and chief rector of Kaiye Temple 開業寺 were filled, respectively, by Yuanche 圓徹, Yuanjing 圓鏡, and Daoying 道英.[[34]](#footnote-34) In year four of Chang'an 長安 (704), the temple head, top seat, and rector of Shaolin Temple were filled by Yijiang 義獎, Zhibao 智寶, and Daju 大舉.[[35]](#footnote-35) In Dunhuang documents, materials that have records on the Three Directors are relatively plentiful; from them we can learn about their establishment and dissemination across the Central Plain (Zhongyuan 中原). The temple head, one of the Three Directors, is an office that was established already in India, the Sanskrit for which is *vihāra-svamin* {DDB *vihārasvāmin*? which correct?}, transliterated [into Chinese] as *piheluosuomi* 毗訶羅莎弭. People who built a temple would not necessarily be members of the saṃgha; the temple head of early periods and what we are calling the temple head as part of the Three Directors was not entirely the same. Xuanzang 玄奘 in his *Datang xiyuji* 大唐西域記 [Great Tang Records on the Western Regions] and Yijing 義净 in his *Datang xiyu qiufa gaoseng zhuan* 大唐西域求法高僧傅 [Great Tang Biographies of Eminent Monks Who Sought the Dharma in Western Regions] both record materials on temple heads, and among these the *Datang xiyuji* touches on them six times, in [the context of] the six kings who built temples in Nālandā {那爛陀}, the 'Daciensi sanzang fashi zhuan' 大慈恩寺三藏法師傅 [Biography of the Tripiṭaka Dharma Teacher of Dacien Temple] and the 'Faxian zhuan' 法顯傳 [Biography of Faxian] saying they are often kings, great ministers, or merchants. As they are not members of the saṃgha, they should not live in the monasteries, however, due to their social standing and abundant economic power, their influence on the monasteries can be imagined.

Zanning, in the *Dasong sengshi lüe*, holds the view that the origins of China's temple head is related to the founding of Baima Temple 白馬寺 in the Eastern Han, and furthermore holds that after the Eastern Jin, 'this office was widespread' 此職方盛.[[36]](#footnote-36) 'Qiantuole zhuan' 犍陀勒傳 [A History of Gandhāra {Kandahar}] in the tenth fascicle of the *Gaoseng zhuan* and the twenty-fourth fascicle of the *Fayuan zhulin* separately record that in Gandhāra of the Western Jin there was a situation in which the monk Jingseng 静僧 from Shu 蜀 (Sichuan) was elected by the assembly as temple head. {43} Before the independence of Chan Buddhist communities, the institution of Three Directors of a monastery had already settled into place and, furthermore, the name [of the office] was current in all levels of society, the only caveat being that the sequential order of temple head and top seat was sometimes reversed. Later when Baizhang Huiahai {introd in Ch1} independently created Rules of Purity (*qinggui* 清規) for the Chan Buddhist school, he established ten occupations {十務}, but the specific names cannot be known. The *Chanmen guishi* 禪門規式 [Behavioral Code of the Chan School] only has cook (*fantou* 飯頭), vegetable steward (*caitou* 菜頭), attendant (*shizhe* 侍者), and rector.[[37]](#footnote-37) By the time of the *Chanyuan qinggui* 禪苑清規 [Rules of Purity for Chan Monasteries], the Chan Buddhist organizational system had been established, with the abbot or abbess (*zhuchi* 住持) at the center, with the four offices (*sizhishi* 四職事) of superintendent (*jianyuan* 監院), rector (*weina* 維那), head cook (*dianzuo* 典座), and labor steward (*zhisui* 直歲), and the six prefects (*liutoushou* 六頭首) of head seat (*shouzuo* 首座, i.e. top seat), secretary (*shuzhuang* 書狀), canon prefect (*zangzhu* 藏主), guest prefect (*zhike* 知客), bath prefect (*yuzhu* 浴主), and accounts prefect (*kutou* 庫頭). The title of *sizhu* 寺主 (temple head) had, in the Chan Buddhist system, already been substituted by *zhuchi* 住持 (abbot or abbess), {no caps for mention of official titles, unless used with a name?} and the responsibilities [of the position] also underwent some changes. The temple head (*sizhu*) of the *san'gang* system had carried out such functions as managing the administration of the monastery, taking responsibility for the concrete affairs of the monastery in a way that was strongly characteristic of a monastic official (*sengguan*), whereas with the Chan Buddhist institution of an abbot or abbess (*zhuchi*), greater emphasis was placed on the success of one's practice and the ability to lead an assembly in practice and study [based on] the status of one's spiritual cultivation {能領衆修學的修道本位精神}.[[38]](#footnote-38)

In Dunhuang documents, the generating of a temple head usually involved a jointly signed recommendation by a top seat or rector along with other monks or nuns, submitted for ratification to the Management Office (*dusi*). P. 3730, for example, records that Rector Huaiying 懷英 and others of Jin'guangming Temple 金光明寺 recommended Huaiji 淮濟 as top seat, Ming[...] supplementing as temple head (*sizhu*) {明□補充寺主}, and in the application document it is emphasized that the two men are both virtuous and talented, characteristics of concern to the gaze of the assembly. Chief Buddhist Controller (*dusengtong*) Hongbian 洪辯 says in the judgement [on the case]: 'The talent and wisdom of the Top Seat are [well] known and his observation of the precepts shows restraint. Temple Head Lü's character is without impediment, his efforts orderly and timely.' 上座才智有聞，戒行具挹。吕寺主方圓不滯，務略臨機。We can see [from this] that Huaiji is, from the perspective of observation of the precepts, a Buddhist elder with impeccable [adherence to] the vinaya, and Temple Head Lü is likewise a well-integrated and resourceful person of outstanding talent.

Moreover, in the document P. 3100, members of the saṃgha and other people recommend the Vinaya Teacher Shancai 善才, who is 'refined of mind and practiced in conduct, eloquent and resourceful' 精心練行、辯捷臨機, to assume the office of temple head (*sizhu*). In S. 1073V, Shaojing 紹净 and others invite a certain person whose 'precept pearls are round and pure' 戒珠圓净 and whose 'talent and wisdom are extensive and profound' 才智洪深 to serve as temple head. And S. 2575 records that Daxing's 大行 being recommended as temple head by Top Seat Yishen 義深 and others, was also for being of 'outstanding virtue and talent among saṃgha members, widely competent in service to the assembly' 僧中俊德，務衆多能.

This is especially the case for the record in S. 6417 of Yuanzheng 圓證 of Puguang Temple 普光寺 and others requesting that Miaoci 妙慈 fill the office of *falü* (keeper of the teachings and disciplines{How to best render this one?}), Zhiyuan 智員 fill the office of temple head, [...] fill the office of head cook, and Cixiang 慈相 fill the office of labor steward (*zhisui*). [The record] then emphasizes that the above-named people, {44} 'Do not discard, day or night, the four [kinds of] reliance, and their [practice] of the eight [precepts] of respect extends through the months and years' 四依不弃於晨昏，八敬長然於歲月. Here, the four kinds of reliance (*siyi* 四依) refer to relying on wisdom and not on knowledge 依智不依識, relying on the meaning and not the letter 依意不依語, relying on the teachings and not the person 依法不依人, and relying on the definitive meaning and not the indefinite meaning 依了義不依不了義. The eight respectful practices (*bajingfa* 八敬法) are important prerequisites established by the primitive *bhikṣuṇī* saṃgha,[[39]](#footnote-39) about which we can learn a thing or two from the conditions of their implementation in Dunhuang nunneries.

Yuanzhi 願志, Yuanying 願盈, and Yuanfa 願法, who were filling monastic offices in Shengguang Temple 聖光寺 in S. 4760, likewise, 'observed the precepts with brightness like the autumn moon, their virtuous deeds contending with the appearances of spring flowers' 戒行以秋月倶明，德業共春花競色, and, furthermore, all came from elite families. The monks and nuns discussed above who served as temple head and top seat, all had this outstanding characteristic of bearing the lofty demeanor of moral virtue. When a temple head assumed the post, he had to report to the Management office (*dusi*) for approval, and when the period of the post was fulfilled or when for some reason he had to resign, he had likewise to obtain the approval of the Management Office. The judgement of the Management Office at these times, however, often used veiled wording {措辭含蓄} and frequently delegated to the monastic communities the decisions to be made on specific arrangements. In the document P. 3100, for example, the temple head Daoxing 道行 begs permission to resign after six or seven years in the post and the Chief Buddhist Controller (*dusengtong*) Wuzhen 悟真, in addition to affirming and praising Daoxing's outstanding achievements, also says in the judgment, 'Commit this to deliberation by the disciples of the monastery' 付寺徒眾商量.

Also, in the document P. 3753, *Tang dashun er nian zhengyue puguangsi ni dingren deng cizhi bing panci* 唐大順二年正月普光寺尼定忍等辭職并判詞 [Resignation Request and Judgment for the Nun Dingren and Others of Puguang Temple in the First Month of the Second Year of Dashun (891) During the Tang Dynasty], there is a record of Temple Head Cijing 慈净, Chief Rector Tijing 體净, Head Cook Zhizhen 智真, Labor Steward Jieren 戒忍, and Dingren 定忍, who is probably the top seat (*shangzuo*) of this temple. This is a document specifically of resignations for monastic offices that is quite rarely seen in Dunhuang documents. We do not learn the reasons for the resignations, but Wuzhen also says in this judgment, 'Commit this to detailed deliberations by the disciples of the monastery' 付當寺徒衆細與商量. This move of the Chief Buddhist Controller reflects that although Dunhuang's monasteries fell under the jurisdiction of the Management Office (*dusi*), at the same time each temple also had a corresponding authority to determine its monastic affairs.

The responsibilities of office for the temple head of Dunhuang monasteries were primarily to administrate for the monks and disciples, and to put in order temple affairs, as P. 6005 *Shimen tie zhusi gangguan* 釋門帖諸寺綱管 [A Buddhist Statement on the Various Temple Administrators], which is a notice passed down to lower levels concerning the monastic administrator (*sengzheng* 僧政) and keeper of the teachings and disciplines (*falü*) fulfilling the orders of the chief Buddhist controller, telling all the temple administrators to do all kinds of preparations for the summer retreat: 'Those living in a temple and having settled in [it] {依止 'depend and rest/settle'} follow a teacher in furthering deeds of practice and study, worshipping and repenting during the three periods. Fearing that the assembly will be hard to straighten out, we therefore [give] reigns to the top seat, for which the temple head personally signs off, in order to put in order the clergy and disciples' 住寺依止、從師進業修習、三時禮谶、恐衆難齊，仍勒上座、寺主親自押署，齊整僧徒. {I have doubts about ZR's punctuation}

The various temple administrators, in the course of taking action on the statement from the Management Office, [must beware that] 'should there be any who are negligent of their official duties, the administration will be penalized one banquet for fifty people' 如慢公者綱管罰五十人一席. {or is this a warning to non-administrators *by* the temple administration?}{45} In the same document, we also read, 'Monks and nuns of the various temples and a number of their novice monks (Skt. *śrāmaṇera*) who have in some cases not yet requested to depend and settle (*yizhi* 依止), as well as eminent monks and nuns who lately entered [a temple], are both ordered to request to depend and settle and will not be enabled to live in leisure. If [there are] some who do not follow a teacher, we request that the administration give their names to the officials; a heavy punishment will be imposed' 諸寺僧尼、數内沙彌、或未有請依止及后入名僧尼，并令請依止，無使寬閑，如不□(從)師者，仰綱管於官通名，重有科罰. We can see from this that the focus for the various monastic administrators in regard to the spiritual practice and study of monks and nuns is on guidance and supervision.

Apart from this, the responsibilities of office for the temple head are also expressed in the management of the economic affairs of the monastery. In the document *Dashengsi siqing Tangqian jinsuan yangdie* 大乗寺寺卿唐千進算羊牒 [Document on the Dasheng-Temple Temple Minister Tangqian Submitting a Calculation on Sheep], fifth page {or #5?} on the back of S. 0542, where Temple Head Shanlai 善來 and Temple Minister Tangqian submit both their signatures, it also explains that the temple head serves as a comprehensive administrator {統理者} for the temple, showing an interest in the specifics of the monastery's economy. Because of this we can say that the temple heads of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples are directly under the leadership of the Management Office (*dusi*), taking responsibility for the specific affairs of each temple, and having supervisory authority over the spiritual practice and study of the clergy and disciples.

'Top seat' (*shangzuo* 上座) is *sthavira* in Sanskrit and *thera* in Pāli. It is transliterated as *xitabiluo* 悉他薜羅 and *xitina* 悉提那. [This position] was also called *zhanglao* 長老 (elder), *shangla* 上臘 ('top in Dharma age'), *shouzuo* 首座 (head seat), *shangzuo* 尚座 ('esteemed seat'), and *zhuwei* 住位 ('residing position'), which refer to high status in terms of Dharma age[[40]](#footnote-40) (*fala* 法臘) and being the head of the residing clergy. Fascicle six of the *Pinimu jing* 毗尼母經 [Sūtra on the Source of the Vinaya] uses the number of years of Dharma age as the basis for setting up the four levels of lower seats (*xiazuo* 下座), middle seats (*zhongzuo* 中座), top seats (*shangzuo* 上座), and venerable elders (*qijiu zhangsu* 耆舊長宿). Those with a Dharma age between zero and nine are called 'lower seats', those between ten and nineteen are called 'middle seats', those between twenty and forty-nine are called 'top seats', and those who are above fifty Dharma years and are treated by a king, elders, or clergy members as special cases are called 'venerable elders' (*qijiu* 耆舊).[[41]](#footnote-41) In the fourth fascicle of J*iyimen zulun* 集異門足論 [Collection on Different Aspects of the Abhidharma Path Treatise, Skt. *Abhidharma-saṃgīti-paryāya-pāda-śāstra*], '*shangzuo*' 上座 is divided into three kinds: 1) Top seats based on year of birth 生年上座, *jāti-sthavira* in Sanskrit, indicating venerable elders. 2) Top seats based on social conventions 世俗上座, *saṃvṛi-sthavira* in Sanskrit, indicating those who have wealth, status, and power through social conventions. 3) Top seats based on Dharma nature 法性上座, *dharma-sthavira* in Sanskrit, indicating those whose Dharma age is relatively older, those liberated by wisdom {智能解脱}, and those whose arhatship has been confirmed.

Moreover, according to a record in the fiftieth fascicle of the *Shisonglü* 十誦律 [Ten Recitations Vinaya, Skt. *Daśa-bhāṇavāra-vinaya*], a top seat should meet ten conditions: 1) Having a place to live; 2) being fearless and incorruptible {無畏無能遮者 'not able to be thwarted' sounds like moral equipoise, hence my translation here}; 3) an ability to cease worrying {息煩惱}; 4) abundant knowledge, a [positive] reputation, and an ability to give rise to pure intentions; 5) eloquence sufficient to not be outdone by others; 6) having no [intellectual] hindrances and being clear about meanings; 7) inspiring confidence in those listening; 8) being good at understanding others {善能安祥入他家}; 9) being able to profoundly explain the marvelous teachings to lay Buddhists, differentiating the various paths, authoritatively mandating the practice of charity and [participation in] fasts of purification {齋戒}, leading others to abandon evil and follow goodness; {46} and 10) being sufficiently versed in the Four Noble Truths, [abiding] joyfully in the manifest world, and not having shortcomings {無所有乏}.

It is not hard to see that the explanations regarding 'top seat' (*shangzuo*) in the Buddhist disciplinary rules {内律} all tend toward an emphasis on aspects of virtuous conduct. Zanning's middle fascicle of the *Dasong sengshi lüe* records, 'Top seats are of three kinds, as the *Jiyimen zu*[*lun*] and the Abhidharma say: "1) Using birth years as years of years of seniority, 2) social conventions on being famous for wealth and aristocracy, and 3) being first to have received the precepts or being first to have a verified realization". In the past and in the present this status is set up, always being filled by choosing someone competent and with the virtues [that come with] age. The *Gaosheng zhuan* frequently says that such and such a person has been imperially decreed to serve as the top seat of a given temple. Daoxuan was imperially decreed to be the top seat of Ximing Temple, hierarchically superior to the temple head and the rector. ' 夫上座者，有三種焉，爲《集異門足》、《毗曇》云:一生年爲耆年，二世俗財名與貴族，三先受戒及先證果。古今立此位，皆取其年德干局者充之。《高僧傳》多云被敕爲某寺上座是也。道宣敕爲西明寺上座，列寺主維那之上。Here, the top seat does not hold responsibility for concrete affairs, but serves as an honored elder, receiving in large measure the reverence of the saṃgha. But the top seat of the Three Directors (*san'gang*) became one of the monastic offices, not only guiding the saṃgha in spiritual practices and study, but also serving as an honored elder and participating in the management of temple affairs. For example, S. 6417 *Houtang qingtai ernian sanyue jingguangmingsi tuzhong shangzuo shenwei deng qing shanli wei shangzuo zhuang bing longbian panci* 後唐清泰二年三月金光明寺徒衆上座神威等請善力爲上座狀并龍辯判詞 [An Account from the Third Month of the Second Year of Qingtai (935) in the Later Tang Dynasty of Top Seat of the Disciples Shenwei and Others of Jin'guangming Temple Requesting That Shanli be Top Seat, and Longbian's Judgment] [furnishes this record]:

1) 'An account from Shenwei (and others), Top Seat of the disciples of Jin'guangming Temple'

2) 'The congregation requests that Shanli be top seat.'

3) 'A monk of the right-front division with a youthful mind and fine virtue, and an unusual measure of wisdom and ability',

4) 'the constancy of his [good] actions are expressed in his complying with the clergy; his standards do not run counter to those of old.'

5) 'Superiors and subordinates of the temple have affection and admiration for this person. For this great undertaking, he is eager to register his name and work diligently';

6) 'In governing affairs, he wants to adjudicate for the assembly. We hand this over for the oversight'...

7) ...'of the Chief Buddhist Controller, the monk Ren'en, for his scrutiny and for the Emperor's special bestowal [of permission for his] leadership. We humbly request your handling of this matter.' ... [The text that follows is omitted.]

1金光明寺徒衆上座神威等狀。

2衆請善力爲上座。

3右前件僧，幼懷佼德，别量英奇。

4行業恒表於緇從，軌範不乖於古

5則。寺中上下，情慕斯人。鴻業切籍干

6勤，治務要平處衆。伏望

7都僧統和尚仁恩詳照，特賜任持。伏請處分。

This is a document from the time when the top seat [position] of Jin'guangming Temple was being transferred. Before leaving office, Shenwei recommends Shanli as the next to assume the role of top seat. The Chief Buddhist Controller says in the judgment, 'The top seat is the chief occupation of the six administrators {六綱主務}, to which the competent members of the clergy are eager to be appointed. Supposing Shanli was deaf and blind, then just like the drawing of a shadow, were the disciples of the temple to request as a group and unanimously raise him up, I could not go against their feelings. In accordance with the account, I supplement it: this matter should be taken care of.' 上座是六綱主務，切籍衆内能人。况善力耳聾眼暗，便共畫影一般，寺徒衆請僉升，不可違情，準狀補充，便須料事。 Some scholars believe that Shanli was actually deaf and blind, {47}and that his designation as top seat is quite puzzling.[[42]](#footnote-42) This is [explained] by Shanli being of lofty virtue and high prestige, a Most Virtuous One (*dade* 大徳; Skt. *bhadanta*) among the saṃgha, very much admired by the disciples of the temple, able to serve as a paragon of virtue and learning, as supervisor for the practice and study of this saṃgha. If we say that the temple head (*sizhu*) inclined heavily toward the concrete management of temple affairs, then the top seat (*shangzuo*) held greater weight in the area of directing the spiritual practice and study of the saṃgha. The document P. 6005 *Shimen tie zhusi gangguan* concerns a notice regarding preparations for practice and study during the summer retreat, and this independent and complete document has in total thirty-four lines, such as the two instances on line 5 and line 23 where it mentions the top seat:

5) The reins [are given] to the top seat and the temple head personally signs off, putting in order the monastic disciples {僧徒 ambiguous; 僧 can be modifier or part of compound noun: clergy and disciples/monks and their followers, or just the saṃgha members}

23) The meditation and vinaya [teachers] and the top seat handle [this].

5勒上座、寺主親自押署、齊整僧徒。

23禪律及上座勾當。

And again, in S. 4664 *Tuanseng deng yu bailu daochang renzhen kenian tie* 圑僧等於白露道場認真課念帖 [Statement on the Monks of the Congregation Earnestly Reciting Their Devotions While Waiting at the Bailu (White Dew) Practice Center {等於 'equivalent to'?}], which is a notice about six groups of monks chanting, the top seat is supervising here too:

7) 'Those monks of the upper divisions, now connected with the Bailu Practice Center, each must, once per day and once per night',

8) 'recite their devotions with single-minded concentration and must not slack. In the circumambulation of the two time periods'...

9) ...'one must not stop; in the slow-walking (*jingxing* 經行) of the morning and evening one must be discreet. If there are any who do not hold to the regulations'...

10) ...'and implement them according to their whims, the top seat will fine each of them seven *dou* 斗 [about 70 litres] of wheat; there will indeed be no accommodations and exemptions'.

7上件圑僧等，今緣白露道場，各須一日一

8夜，課念精專，不得怠慢。二時巡繞而

9莫停，朝夕經行而謹慎。若有不憑條

10式，隨意施行，上座各罰麥柒斗，的無容免。

The responsibilities of office for the top seat of Dunhuang's various temples can be vaguely perceived from this. Secondly, the top seat serves as one of the three directors (*san'gang*), also participating in management of some of the Dharma work {法務 or equal to 'monastic affairs'?}. For example, the document P. 2769 *Mou si shangzuo wei sheri linjin zhuan tie* 某寺上座爲設日臨近轉帖 [Statement on Setting the Day of the Approaching Transfer Made by Some Temple's Top Seat], which is signed by the top seat, orders people of the relevant temple, including the novice monks Yuanlin and Hongjing, to make the necessary preparations and arrangements before the appointed day. In the document S. 2575 *Houtang tiancheng sannian qiyue shier ri dusengtong Haiyan yu zhusi peijie fansan deng tie* 後唐天成三年七月十二日都僧統海晏於諸寺配借幡傘等帖 [Statement from the Twelfth Day of the Seventh Month of the Third Year of Tiancheng (928) in the Later Tang on the Chief Buddhist Controller Haiyan Arranging for the Lending of Banners and Canopies Between Several Temples], we also find a public report {狀牒} from Top Seat Yishen 義深 of Lingtu Temple 靈圖寺. In the later Rules of Purity (*qinggui* 清規) for Chan monasteries, the responsibilities of office for the top seat became increasingly pronounced and important. The third fascicle of the *Chanyuan qinggui* has [this]: 'The job of head seat is to set an example for the members of the saṃgha, raising up [cases of] incorrect and correct teachings' 首座之職，表儀衆僧，舉非正法. The *Chixiu Baizhang qinggui* 敕修百丈清規 [Baizhang Rules of Purity Reconstructed by Imperial Decree] also has [this]:

The head seat of the front hall, a model for the congregation who is under scrutiny by the eyes of gods and people, takes a turn at the dais to expound on the teachings. He drills the later generations [of monks], sits in meditation and leads the congregation, is circumspect in following the articles [of the disciplinary rules], [eats] midday and morning meals that are refined or coarse, and advises the workers. If behaviors of members of the saṃgha depart from the norm, he meets out a punishment based on the rules. When the elderly or sick are passing away, he sees them to their end with an expression of sympathy. He must carry out all the affairs of the assembly.[[43]](#footnote-43) 前堂首座，表率叢林,人天眼目，分座説法。開鑿後昆，坐禪領衆，謹守條章，齋粥精粗，勉諭執事，僧行失儀，依規示罰，老病亡殁，垂恤送終、凡衆之事，皆得舉行。{I question ZR's punctuation}

{48}The top seat not only oversees the spiritual practice and study of the congregation, but also takes care of monastic affairs and, at the same time, his (or her) conduct and bearing serve as a model for the monastic assembly. Among the top seats of the Central Plain, there were also no shortage of scholars who were well-versed in points of doctrine and good at lecturing. Ennin 圓仁, in the third fascicle of the *Nittō guhō junrei kōki* 入唐求法巡禮行記 [Record of Travel to the Tang in Search of the Dharma] gives an account of the scenes of the morning lecture 'Fahua' 法華 [The Dharma Flower (i.e., Lotus Sūtra)] and the evening lecture 'Zhiguan' 止觀 [Cessation and Observation] of the Top Seat Hongji 洪基 of Huayan Temple 花嚴寺 on Mount Wutai.

The rector (*weina* 維那), as one of the Three Directors (*san'gang*), has an important role in the work of a temple. Looking into the etymology of the word '*weina*' contributed to by both Sanskrit and Chinese words, we find that *wei* 維 means 'administrative jurisdiction' (*gangwei tongli* 綱維統理) and *na* 那 comes from the Sanskrit words *karma-dāna*, which are transliterated [to Chinese] as *jiemotuona* 羯磨陀那, the meaning of which is 'giver of duties' and is [the person] who directs people in the various chores, an office presiding over a temple clergy's miscellaneous chores that was ordered to be established by the Buddha. According to a record in the first fascicle of the *Sifenlü shanfan buque xingshi chao*:

There was a time when in the monastery no one knew the temporal boundaries, arrival of the time for chanting and for striking bells and drums. Also, no one cleaned up or whitewashed the lecture hall or the place for eating. No one regularly made the beds or taught people to clean the bugs out of the food [made from] fruits and vegetables. At mealtimes, no one brought water. When the congregation was lost in noisy chatter, no one snapped his fingers. The Buddha ordered that [the position of] rector be set up, which the Grammarians translate as 'second', saying that [the position] is second [in command] after the *zhishi* ('knower of affairs'). Transmission of [what the Buddha] said delighted the congregation.[[44]](#footnote-44) 時僧坊中無人知時限，唱時至及打楗椎，又無人灑掃、塗治講堂食處。無人相續鋪床及教人净果菜食中蟲，飲食時無人行水，衆亂語時無人彈指等，佛令立維那，聲論翻為次第也，謂知事之次第，相傳云悦衆也。

We can see that the office of rector originated from a stipulation of the Buddha. Chan temples and vinaya temples all set up this office. Among the ten jobs established in the *Baizhang gu qinggui* 百丈古清規 [Ancient Rules of Purity of Baizhang] is the office of rector (*weina*).[[45]](#footnote-45) In other schools, the rector is a pioneering guide for the diligent practice of the essentials of the Dharma.[[46]](#footnote-46) The rector serving as a saṃgha official {僧官} began during the Later Qin 姚秦. At the time, [the rector] handled monastic affairs together with a *sengzheng* 僧正 (monastic preceptor) and a *senglu* 僧録 (monastic registrar), and enjoyed a certain level of remuneration {待遇 'compensation'? monetary or not?}. The thirty-sixth fascicle of the *Fozu tongji* 佛祖統記 [Comprehensive Record of the Buddhas and Patriarchs] records: 'Sengnu was ordered to serve as Monastic Preceptor of State with an official rank at the same level as a grand counselor (*shizhong* 侍中) and given the powers of a livery-service (transportation and conveyance) official. Faqin served as Monastic Registrar and Sengqian served as *yuzhong* 悦衆 ('assembly pleaser', a manager of monastic affairs), with a discrepancy in their official rank, each of them provided with thirty trusted aides and lay followers.' 令僧砮爲國僧正，秩同侍中，給車輿吏力。法欽爲僧録、僧遷爲悦衆，班秩有差、各給親信白從三十人。[[47]](#footnote-47) The rector of this time served as a saṃgha official of the central level of the state [government], and because of the official salary and rank, there is a definite discrepancy with the scope of duties of the rector from the three-director (*san'gang*) [institution] of later monasticism.

{49}The responsibilities of office of the rector in Chan Buddhism are explained in fascicle three of the *Chanyuan qinggui*: '[He or she] presides over all affairs of the saṃgha'. Not only administering the spiritual practice and study of the monks and nuns, [the rector] had to look after all aspects of the daily life of monks and nuns in a monastery. In documents from Dunhuang, the rector (*weina*) is also referred to as *duwei* 都維 ('chief rector'), *dushi* 都師 ('chief teacher'), and *duweina* 都維那 ('chief rector').[[48]](#footnote-48) In 'Xuanzhongsi tiemile xiang bei' 玄中寺鐵彌勒像碑 [Epitaph on the Image of the Iron Maitreya of Xuanzhong Temple] from the eighty-fourth fascicle of the *Jinshi cuibian*, the rector is referred to as the chief teacher (*dushi*), raised as a topic, and discussed alongside the temple head (*sizhu*) and top seat (*shangzuo*). Based on materials in the documents from Dunhuang, we know that the responsibilities of office for the rector of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples is manifest in the following several aspects. We begin with temple records of the clergy leaders {綱維 this needs a global revisiting: 'controller' DDB, 'temple administrators' etc.}. In the document P. 3730, Rector Huaiying 懷英 of Jin'guangming Temple 金光明寺leads twenty-one disciples and applies for permission to have Huaiji augment him as top seat (*shangzuo*) and Sengming [damaged text] {ZR includes the elipse after the name; how to best render this?} augment as temple head (*sizhu*). This clarifies that the rector, under circumstances in which the temple head and top seat are absent, would take charge of monastic affairs.

S. 371 *Jingtusi shibu tie* 浄土寺試部帖 [Notice from the Testing Division of Jingtu Temple]

1) 'Jingtu Temple Testing Division – Notice':

2) 'First day, tenth month, twenty-fifth year, we have received the Chief Buddhist Controller and Great'...

3) ...'Teacher's disciplinary action, that all temples will send groups of disciples to read and recite the sūtras',

4) ...'precepts, commentaries, and disciplinary rules. Twice monthly. It will be up to the saṃgha leader'...

5) ...'to collect fines lightly or heavily. Each will study intently from his or her own master'.

6) 'At the beginning of the month and halfway through the month, the Rector will send notice for the community to gather. If any arrive late or'...

7) ....'do not come at all, then, on a temporary basis, superiors will be fined half an urn of alcohol, and inferiors'...

8) ...'will face fifteen lashes with a cane; there will indeed be no accommodations and exemptions'. ... [The text that follows is omitted.]

S. 371《浄土寺試部帖》

1净土寺試部 帖：

2戊子年十月一日，奉都僧統大

3師處分，諸寺遣徒衆讀誦經

4戒論律。逐月兩度。仰僧首看

5輕重科徵。於各自師主習業，月

6朝月半維那告報集衆，後到及

7全不來，看臨時，大者罰酒半瓮，少者

8决丈十五，的無容免者。

The activities of spiritual practice and study of groups of disciples from the various temples, the recitation and learning of such texts as sūtras, vinayas, and śāstras twice per month, were called to assembly and order by the rector, and with corresponding standards of punishment. Secondly, presiding over Dharma assemblies and Buddhist services {佛事} is another function of the rector. In P. 3336 *Chounian yinnian zanpu xinjia futian zhuan dabore jing fenfu zhusi weina li* 丑年寅年贊普新加福田轉大般若經分付諸寺維那歷 [Record of Zanpu (Btsan po, a Yar klungs ruler{?}) Adding New Fields of Merit Through an Order to the Rectors of All Temples to Turn the Pages of the Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra in the Year of the Ox and Year of the Tiger],{50} large-scale sūtra-reading Dharma assemblies are held for Zanpu to pray for blessings, separately at each temple, with the rectors taking responsibility for presiding. Additionally, at the time of the *poṣadha*, it is again the rectors who are implicated. Documents on Dunhuang's Buddhist services {佛事} include *Dasheng busa wen* 大乗布薩文 [Text of the Mahāyāna Poṣadha] and *Shengwen busa wen* 聲聞布薩文 [Text of the Śrāvaka Poṣadha]. For example, in S. 0453 and P. 3177, from the assembly entering the hall, to reciting the text of the *poṣadha*, to addressing the assembly, to receipt of the voting sticks {受籌}, to the return of the voting sticks {還籌}, to the invitation for the preceptor to go up to his seat––in all these, progression through the sequence is made under a presiding rector.

Among the saṃgha officials {僧官} of Dunhuang's various temples, apart from the three directors (*san'gang*), there were also positions such as *dianzuo* 典座 (head cook), *zhisui* 直歲 (labor steward), and *siqing* 寺卿 (temple minister), cooperating with the three directors to together handle temple affairs. The appellation '*dianzuo*' derives from the expression *dianzuochuang* 典座床 ('person in charge of seats and beds'). According to a record from fascicle six of the *Mahāsāṃghika Vinaya* (*Mohesengqi lü* 摩訶僧祇律):

The Buddha was residing at Śrāvastī as extensively explained earlier, and at that time there was a monk named Dravyo Malla-putraḥ. The group of monks showed reverence to the Manager (*dianzhi* 典知) of the Nine Matters (*jiushi* 九事, Skt. *nava-dravya*, *nava dravyāṇi*). The nine matters: taking charge of giving out beds and seats, taking charge of dispatching [people] to call a meeting, taking charge of apportioning rooms and buildings, taking charge of apportioning clothing, taking charge of apportioning flowers and incense, taking charge of apportioning fruit, taking charge of the people responsible for warm water, taking charge of apportioning various breads and foods, and taking charge of knowing competent people to appoint on an ad-hoc basis. This is the Manager of the Nine Matters to which famous monks pay reverence. When giving out beds and seats, this elder's little finger of his right hand gives out lamp light that accompanies the article. 佛住舍衛城廣説如上，爾時有比丘，名陀驃摩羅子。衆僧拜典知九事。九事者:典次付床座、典次差請會、典次分房舍、典次分衣物、典次分花香、典次分果蓏、典次知暖水人、典次分雜餅食、典次知随意舉堪事人。是名僧拜典知九事。付床座時，是長老右手小指出燈明隨品。

In the middle fascicle of the *Dasong sengshi lüe*, and in fascicle four of the *Fanyi mingyi ji* 翻譯名義集 [Compilation of Translated Buddhist Terms], and in fascicle eight of the *Zuting shiyuan* 袓庭事苑 [Garden of Matters from the Patriarchs' Hall], the one who is called the *dianzuo* is the functionary (*zhishi* 知事), the term coming from his overseeing (*dianzhi* 典知) the nine matters and miscellaneous services. In Chan monasteries, it is the position in charge of the assembly's midday and morning meals. In the *Chanmen guishi*, where it speaks of the ten jobs set up by Baizhang, it only mentions that there is a cook (*fantou* 飯頭, 'rice head'), a vegetable steward (*caitou* 菜頭, 'vegetable head'), an attendant (*shizhe* 侍者), and a rector (*weina*); we do not learn about the other six positions. If, however, we rely on a record in number twenty-four of the *Wumenguan* 無門關 [The Gateless Passage], the Chan master {禪師} Guishan Lingyou 潙山靈佑{靈祐?} once served in the office of *dianzuo* under Baizhang.[[49]](#footnote-49) If Baizhang's monastery {叢林} had the position of *dianzuo*, there should be such an office among the ten jobs of the *Baizhang gu qinggui*.

In the article on the *dianzuo* in the third fascicle of the *Chanyuan qinggui* it says, 'The position of *dianzuo* is in charge of the great assembly's midday and morning meals and [the person filling it] must carry an aspiration for enlightenment and change with the [needs of] the moment, enabling the great assembly to experience peace of mind. [The *dianzuo*] also must not waste property and ingredients for the midday meal, and when assessing the larder must not arbitrarily scatter things.' 典座之職，主大衆齋粥，須運道心，隨時改變，令大衆受用安樂，亦不得枉費常住齋料，及點檢廚中，不得亂有拋散。This position, although merely a staff position for managing food and drink, {51} nonetheless received much emphasis in Buddhist monasteries and was frequently filled by people of lofty aspirations and pure conduct who have given rise to a great intention [to achieve enlightenment]. Monastic positions beneath the *dianzuo* include a cook (*fantou*), congee steward (*zhoutou* 粥頭), rice steward (*mitou* 米頭), firewood steward (*chaitou* 柴頭), and a meeting steward (*tuantou* 圑頭 {constable, groundskeeper, guild head}), etc. While one does not often see mention of *dianzuo* in Dunhuang documents, P. 3757 *Tang dashun ernian zhengyue puguangsi Dingren deng cizhi die bing panci* 唐大順二年正月普光寺定忍等辭職牒并判詞 [A Document from the First Month of the Second Year of Dashun of Tang (891) with the Resignations of Dingren and Others of Puguang Temple Along with the Judgment] has a record of Zhizhen 智真 filling the post of *dianzuo*. In the document S. 4760 *Song taiping xingguo shengguang si sheli ni Xiushan deng qing Jieci deng chong dang si zhi die bing panci* 宋太平興國聖光寺闍梨尼修善等請戒慈等充當寺職牒并判詞 [A Document from Taiping Xingguo (981) on the Ācārya Nun Xiushan and Others of Puguang Temple Requesting That Jieci and Others Fill Temple Positions Along with the Judgment], Yuanying 願盈 also has served in the role of Puguang Temple's *dianzuo*. This position, in the monasticism of the Tang dynasty, is included in the commonly set up temple positions, without much discrepancy in the responsibilities of the role.[[50]](#footnote-50)

The position of labor steward (*zhisui* 直歲) was also established in Dunhuang's various temples. According to a record in the *Dasong sengshi lüe*, 'Sometimes a *zhisui* ("duty"+"year") is set up, which is duty for one year; or sometimes there is a *zhiyue* 直月 (month of duty), a *zhibanyue* 直半月 (half-month of duty), or a *zhiri* 直日 (day of duty), all of which are *yuzhong* 悦衆 ('pleasers of the assembly', managers of monastic affairs); one establishes them according to circumstances. Together they {/Those who are chief} are referred to as *san'gang* and fill the various roles of the saṃgha administration. At several points during the early Tang, a monastic leader {僧主} was not set up and each temple only set up these three officers.' 或立直歲，則直一年;或直月、直半月、直日，皆悦衆也，隨方立之。都謂之三綱，雜任其僧綱也。唐初數葉不立僧主，各寺設此三官而己。 The meaning of *zhi* 直 is to have one's turn being on duty, and in Chan Buddhist monasticism [this] was one of the six stewards (*zhishi* 知事), named after the handling of all miscellaneous matters. The third fascicle of the *Chanyuan qinggui* says:

The position of labor steward (*zhisui*) is the one who does work in the monastery and is in charge of it: So-called monastic repairs (*yuanmen xiuzao* 院門修造), gates and windows of monks' and nuns' residences, to what use wall space is put––[these] are repaired and replaced in times of need and beautifully adorned. [The labor steward] is also in charge of milling, fields and gardens, large buildings, the oil-making facility, stables and saddling of horses, boats and carts, sweeping and cleaning, cultivating plants, patrolling the mountain (main) gate, guarding against robbers, sending for manual laborers, and selecting farm hands {/tenant farmers}, making diligent efforts while appropriately mindful of the common good, knowing the [best] timing and distinguishing suitability.[[51]](#footnote-51) {again, I don't agree with all of ZR's punctuation} 直歲之職，凡系院中作務并主之。所謂院門修造，寮舍門窗，牆壁動用什物，逐時修换嚴飾。及提舉碾磨、田園、莊舍、油坊，後槽鞍馬、船車、掃灑、栽種、巡護山門、防警賊盗、差遣人工、輪拔莊客，并宜公心勤力，知時别宜。

From this we can see the wide scope of the work of a labor steward. At the same time, the latter fascicle of the *Dabiqiu sanqian weiyi* 大比丘三千威儀 [Three Thousand Regulations for Great Bhikṣus] stipulates that those filling the role of labor steward must possess ten virtues:

1) Sparing no effort in [all] three aspects of the Dharma.[[52]](#footnote-52) 2) When monks have arrived from far away, greeting and putting them at ease. 3) When providing bed mats or lamp light, [doing so for] three to seven days. 4) If in setting up a room the space is all filled, avoiding showing favoritism in giving out space. 5) Going repeatedly to ask and inspect. 6) Explaining the customs of the local land. {52} 7) To not give [the temple community] cause for worry {/if the 不 is interpolation that does not belong, we might have 七者當憂所具足, to keep the temple toilet completely furnished}. 8) If there are some among [the assembly] involved in a dispute, [he or she] must not aid [either side], but must always ease tensions and settle [people] down. 9) If the accommodations provided {/roomates?} are not convenient and comfortable, [he or she] must not spread insults among the community and also must not call people together for some plot to make the leader disallow [the problem situation]. 10) [He or she] must not dispute with the Moboli {?摩波利} over attainments, calculating among the assembly whether [people] have practiced or said it. [He or she] also must not take any [one] thing from among the three aspects of the Dharma and make a special practice of it. One who practices kindness and whose conduct is in accord with the Dharma can be a labor steward. 一者為三法盡力。二者若有比丘從遠方來，當迎安穩。 三者當给與床席，若燈火，三日至七日。四者設房皆滿，當自避持處與之。五者當數往問訊占視。六者當為説國土習俗。七者當憂所不具足。八者若中有共諍者，不得有所助，常當和解令安隱。九者若宿與不相便安，不得於衆中呵罵，亦不得呼人使共作某令主不可。十者不得與摩波利共諍求長短，數於衆中若行説之；亦不得取三法中所有物，持行{;}作恩惠，如法行者，可作直歳。

The *Dabiqiu sanqian weiyi* is two fascicles in total and was translated by An Shigao. From looking at the list of ten virtues, many of these are jobs associated with being responsible for hospitality among the saṃgha and with managing the saṃgha's daily affairs. [The list] also [sets out] the ten criteria of the labor steward and does not touch on management of monastic affairs and economy. In the ten jobs of the *Baizhang qinggui* there should be a position of labor steward, but the *Chanmen guishi* in the sixth fascicle of the *Jingde chuandeng lu* only mentions a cook (*fantou*), vegetable steward (*caitou*), attendant (*shizhe*), and a rector (*weina*) and does not touch upon the other six jobs. In fascicle nine of the *Wudeng huiyuan* 五燈會元 [Combined Sources for the Five Lamps], however, there is a record of Yangshan Huiji 仰山慧寂 'serving as labor steward at Guishan' 在潙山爲直歲作務.[[53]](#footnote-53) Guishan Lingyou 潙山靈佑 (771-853) and Baizhang Huaihai 百丈懷海 (720-814) are Chan Buddhist elders of the same time period, and Guishan, moreover, had served in the role of head cook (*dianzuo*) in Baizhang's Chan Buddhist monastery. Guishan's disciples were numerous, his Dharma-heir (*sifa* 嗣法) disciples amounting to forty or fifty people.[[54]](#footnote-54) These materials are a relatively early record of the labor steward (*zhisui*) in documents from the history of Chan Buddhism.

As everyone knows, the setting up of a labor steward in China appears relatively early in Chan Buddhist monasticism and later [other] Buddhist monasteries extended the use of this position. Particular to {特別在} Dunhuang monasticism, the position of labor steward was established in all the temples and managed the monastery's economy and affairs. Chikusa Masaaki believed that the monastic institutions of the *Baizhang qinggui* of the Chan school in the late Tang and Five Dynasties did not have any influence on Dunhuang monasticism, and that the organizations of Dunhuang monasticism are all vinaya temples {律寺}.[[55]](#footnote-55) Of course, in the Dunhuang documents there are many Chan-school documents and [some] outstanding monographs have come out,[[56]](#footnote-56) {53}and not a few papers have also been published.[[57]](#footnote-57) Nonetheless, up to now there has not yet been a discovery of documents related to the Rules of Purity (*qinggui*) of the Chan school of Buddhism. The labor steward and other types of stewards {各種頭首} set up in Dunhuang's monasteries cannot yet be seen to have a direct relationship with the *Baizhang qinggui* circulating at this time in the Central Plain.

To say it another way, whether or not the Chan-school monastic institutions made waves into the institutions of Dunhuang monasticism cannot yet be decisively judged (we will take a step forward in this investigation in the section below on the nature of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples). In both the *Jingde chuandeng lu* and the *Song gaoseng zhuan* 宋高僧傅 [Song Biographies of Eminent Monks] there is no record pertaining to the labor steward, but in the seventeenth fascicle of the *Xu gaoseng zhuan* 續高僧傅 [Continued Biographies of Eminent Monks] [under] Shi Sengshan 釋僧善 (?–605) in the 'Xichan pian' 習襌篇 [Section on Those Who Learned Meditation], [we read], 'He filled the role of labor steward of the saṃgha, overseeing the rice fields' 充僧直歲監當稻田.[[58]](#footnote-58) The biography of *Shi Zhibao* 釋智保 under 'Minglü pian' 明律篇 [Section on Those Who Clarified the Vinaya] in the twenty-first fascicle of the *Xu gaoseng zhuan* has, 'Four hundred saṃgha members ate together in one hall'...'in the irrigation for vegetables in the garden, the water was filled with little bugs; the labor steward regarded this with disdain, but took care of it by discussing the matter' 僧衆四百同食一堂……園蔬溉灌，水雜細蟲，直歲高視，但論事辦.[[59]](#footnote-59)

There are not many materials on the labor steward to be seen in biographies of monks, and clearly the labor steward of Zhibao's saṃgha was not diligent and responsible. As for the responsibilities of office for the labor steward of Dunhuang monasteries, [these are] largely reflected in management of revenues and expenditures in the monastic economy. In particular {特別是}, a document on Jingtu Temple's revenues and expenditures for the calendar [year]{入破曆} enables us to see information on the situation with economic management of Dunhuang's monasteries, and revenues and expenditures throughout the year for a typical monastery.[[60]](#footnote-60) Monasteries frequently, at the end of the year or at the beginning, would have the labor steward give a report to the saṃgha with the final economic accounting for the year. For example, P. 2049V1 *Tongguang sannian zhengyue jingtusi zhisui Baohu shouxia jiashennian chun zhi jiyounian chun zhuse ru poli jikuai* 同光三年正月浄土寺直歲保護手下甲申年春至己酉年春諸色入破曆計會 [Accounting from the First Month of the Third Year of Tongguang (925) for Revenues and Expenditures of All Material Things Under Management by the Labor Steward Baohu of Jingtu Temple from Spring of the Twenty-First Year to Spring of the Forty-Sixth Year], P. 2049V2 *Changxing ernian zhengyue jingtusi zhisui Yuanda shouxia gengyinnian chun zhi xinmaonian chun zhuse ru poli jikuai* 長興二年正月净土寺直歲願達手下庚寅年春至辛卯年春諸色入破曆計會 [Accounting from the First Month of the Second Year of Changxing (932) for Revenues and Expenditures of All Material Things Under Management by the Labor Steward Yuanda of Jingtu Temple from the Twenty-Seventh Year to the Twenty-Eighth Year], and P. 2032V11 *Jiachennian zhengyue yihou jingtusi zhisui Hui'an shouxia zhuse ru poli jikuai gao* 甲辰年正月以後浄土寺直歲惠安手下諸色入破曆計會稿 [Draft of the Accounting for Revenues and Expenditures of All Material Things Under Management by the Labor Steward Hui'an of Jingtu Temple After the First Month of Jiachen (944)] are all from the first month at the beginning of the year and have the labor steward explaining to the community the detailed circumstances for all kinds of expenditures incurred by the monastery throughout the year, such as processions of [Buddha] images and the Cold Food [Festival],[[61]](#footnote-61) as well as a host of revenues. {54}

The contents of P. 3234 (backside) *Renyinnian zhengyue yiri yihou zhisui shami Yuantong shoushang zhuse ruli* 壬寅年正月一日以後直歲沙彌願通手上諸色入曆 [Calendar-Entry for All Material Things Under Management by the Labor Steward and Novice Monk Yuantong after the First Day of the First Month of the Thirty-Ninth Year ] are an accounting of revenue items throughout the year, and this document also has *Maonian zhengyue yiri yihou zhisui shami Guangjin maipo* 卯年正月一日以後直歲沙彌廣進麥破 [Wheat Expenditures by the Labor Steward and Novice Monk Guangjin After the First Day of the First Month of the Fourth Year], recording such and such temple's items of expenditure for a year. This document lays bare for us an item of information on the organizational structure of Dunhuang monasticism. This [information] is material on a novice monk (Skt. *śrāmaṇera*) assuming the role of labor steward, and the labor steward at the end of the year making a report on revenues and expenditures to the saṃgha. The third fascicle of Ennin's *Nittō guhō junrei kōki* also has a record [of this]:

On the twenty-fifth day (of the twelfth month of the fifth year of Kaicheng), with the entry into the new year, the saṃgha ascended to the hall to eat congee, wontons, and various fruits. While the saṃgha ate congee, the rector, head cook, and labor steward read out and explained before the assembly accounts for all material expenditures of money and things from the temple's various farmsteads, trading, and [arrangements] for guests within the year.[[62]](#footnote-62) 廿五日（開成五年十二月）更則入新年，衆僧上堂吃粥餛飩雜果子。衆僧吃粥間，綱維、典座、直歲一年内寺中諸莊及交易并客斷(誤，應為料)諸色破用錢物賬衆前讀申。

This is a record of what Ennin observed at Zisheng Temple 資聖寺 in Chang'an. At the same time, according to the document S. 3074V *Mou si poli* 某寺破曆 [Calendar of Expenditures for Some Temple], we also learn that Dunhuang monasteries set up labor stewards, as well, for the outer farmsteads (*zhuang* 莊). For example:

Ninth day of the fifth month, an expenditure of six *dou* of white flour was given to Aunt An {/Lady An} to serve as food for [being] labor steward of the outer farmsteads. 五月九日出白面六斗付安大娘充外莊直歲食

Third day of the tenth month, an expenditure of five *dou* of white flour was given to Huiju to fulfill the provisions of the seventh month for the labor steward of the outer farmsteads. 十月三日出白面五斗付惠炬充七月粮外莊直歲

Jiang Boqin, in *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*, thinks that the Aunt An of this document must be categorized as belonging to the wives or women of the outer farmstead of the temple-household {寺户} who handled foods and beverages, with payment of white flour as one allotment of provisions, reflecting the advantageous position of the labor steward of the out farmsteads.[[63]](#footnote-63) This research outcome has an important [point of] inspiration for [helping] us understand the status of the labor stewards of Dunhuang's monasteries. From seeing this phenomenon, discussed above, of having a novice monk hold the post of labor steward for Jingtu Temple, [we learn that] the status of the position of labor steward assumed within Dunhuang monasteries was not especially restrictive. From the *Chanyuan qinggui*, we learned the scope of duties managed by the labor steward. Because of development of the monastic economy and possession of farmsteads external to the monastery, the phenomenon of setting up several people as labor stewards within a single monastery arose in response to the demands of the time. The labor steward of external farmsteads in the document S. 3074[V] cited above is one such example. {55}

Apart from these [instances], there are also records of a great labor steward (*dazhisui* 大直歲) and a minor labor steward (*xiaozhisui* 小直歲) in epigraphical materials.[[64]](#footnote-64) In the disciplinary rules of Buddhism, there is also the setting up of a *zhiyue* 直月 (month-long steward) and a *zhiri* 直日 (day-long steward). For example, 'Ming weiyi fa zhi yi' 明威儀法之一 [Section One of Clarifications of the Customs for Deportment] from the thirty-fourth fascicle of the *Mohesengqi lü* (Skt. *Mahāsāṃghika-vinaya*), records this material: 'With the arrival of daybreak, one should dispatch the month-long steward (*zhiyue*), maybe a field hand (Skt. *ārāmika*) or a novice monk, to go and see it' 至明旦，應遣直月，若園民若沙彌往看之.[[65]](#footnote-65) This lays bare for us that those who assumed the role of month-long steward (*zhiyue*) were not only novice monks, but also included field hands.

In addition to the Three Directors, the head cook, and the labor steward, a *siqing* 寺卿 (temple minister) was also set up. Chikusa Masaaki, in 'Tonkō no sōkan seido', thinks that the temple minister serves as manager for the temple-household (*sihu* 寺户), helping the Three Directors take care of temple business.[[66]](#footnote-66) Jiang Boqin has also carried out systematic research on the temple minister and used Buddhist canonical texts to point out the important meaning of the temple minister who is set up in convents, obtaining a structural [model] of monastic management: top-level administrators (*gangguan*) – temple minister (*siqing*) – group head (*tuantou* 圑頭) – hall attendant{?} (*tangzi* 堂子).[[67]](#footnote-67) Apart from these, monastic positions and honorific titles seen in documents in the Tang dynasty include *zuozhu* 座主 ('seat master' or prelate), *yuanzhu* 院主 ('master of the monastery' or abbot), *fazhu* 法主 ('dharma master'), *laosu* 老宿 (a 'long-disciplined' virtuous elder, Skt. *sthavira*), *dade* 大徳 ('great virtue', a term of respect), *lüdade* 律大徳 ('greatly virtuous in the rules of discipline'), *lintandade* 臨壇大德 ('greatly virtuous ones who have reached the ordination platform'), *sanjiaoshouzuo* 三教首座 ('head seat of the three teachings'), *zhushi* 主事 (a director or controller, Skt. *viharāsvāmin*), *sidu* 寺都 ('monastery chief'), *sengshou* 僧首 ('saṃgha leader').[[68]](#footnote-68) By the time of the *Baizhang qinggui*, monastic positions in Chan Buddhist monasteries had become more systematized and their names increasingly numerous.

2.4 The Organizational Structure of the Three Meditation Caves

Regarding research on Dunhuang's meditation caves (*chanku* 禪窟), this has been very much emphasized by scholars inside and outside of China. In 1978, Liu Huida 劉慧達 published 'Beiwei shiku yu chan' 北魏石窟與禪 [Northern Wei Caves and Meditation], pointing out that the meditation methods circulating at the time and the construction of meditation caves had a direct influence on the substantive details of the meditation caves.[[69]](#footnote-69) In 1982, He Shizhe 贺世哲, in the paper 'Dunhuang mogaoku beichao shiku yu changuan' 敦煌莫高窟北朝石窟與襌観 [The Northern Dynasties Caves of Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes and Dhyāna-Contemplation] used an analysis of such meditation sūtras as the *Chanmi yaofa jing* 禪秘要法經 [Sūtra on the Secret Essential Methods of Meditation] to link together the major styles {體裁 'genres'} of meditation caves. He thinks that the Mogao caves of the Northern Dynasties gave rise, for the saṃgha and disciples, to the functions of giving offerings (*gongyang* 供養), worshipping Buddha (*lifo* 禮佛), and *dhyāna*-contemplation (*changuan* 禪觀), {56}but that there was a separate, worldly objective for the owners of the constructed caves.[[70]](#footnote-70) In 1983, He Shizhe again put forth a major work {大作}, 'Dunhuang suidai shiku yu shuanghong dinghui' 敦煌隋代石窟與雙弘定慧 [Dunhuang's Sui-Dynasty Caves and the Dual Promotion of Meditation and Wisdom], indicating in this paper that Tiantai Zhiyi's theory of the dual practice of cessation and observation stimulated a high level of emphasis on Sui-dynasty Buddhism, with Chang'an at center, and that this sort of ideological trend made waves in Dunhuang. The Mogao grottoes have, extant today, subject matter {題材} from over seventy cave murals from the Sui dynasty––products influenced by ideas about the dual promotion of meditation and wisdom.[[71]](#footnote-71) In 1987, Sudō Hirotoshi 須藤弘敏 presented 'Chanding biqiu tuxiang yu Dunhuang 285 ku' 襌定比丘圖像與敦煌285窟 [Images of Monks in Meditative Concentration and Dunhuang's Cave #285], raising refreshing propositions. He believes that the murals and sculptures in Cave #285 are for conceptually praising the thinking on meditative concentration {在觀念上賛嘆禪定思想}, and to praise meditative-concentration [itself] and famous meditator monks {禪僧}, this being the purpose of this cave, which is different from the commonly held explanation that the purpose of cave #285 is *dhyāna*-contemplation and spiritual practice {禪觀修行}.[[72]](#footnote-72) And regarding the problem of the 'three meditation caves' 三所禪窟, Doi Yoshikazu puts forth in his paper 'Tokuron tonkō no shakai to bukkyō: 9–10 seiki no bakkōkutsu to sansho zenkutsu to tonkō bukkyō kyōdan' 特論敦煌の社會と佛教–––九–十世紀の莫高窟と三所禪窟と敦煌佛教教圑 [Master Class on Dunhuang's Society and Buddhism: The Mogao Grottoes of the Ninth through Tenth Centuries, the Three Meditation Caves, and Dunhuang's Buddhist Communities] {following ZR's footnote citation; paper title in text does not match; doubles with note 75, so maybe the other is intended here?} that the 'three meditation caves' are the Mogao Grottoes, the Western Thousand Buddha Caves (*Xi qianfo dong* 西千佛洞), and the Yulin Grottoes (*Yulin ku* 榆林窟). Later, this author himself called into question this viewpoint, proposing [instead] that the 'three meditation caves' are [all] within the Mogao Grottoes.[[73]](#footnote-73)

Ma De meanwhile, after retrieving materials from related Dunhuang documents and doing meticulous textual research, continues to maintain that the 'three meditation caves' should be the Mogao Grottoes, the Western Thousand Buddha Caves, and the Yulin Grottoes.[[74]](#footnote-74) In any case, that the 'three meditation caves' served as centers of practice and bases for practicing meditation in Dunhuang's Buddhist communities has been widely accepted by scholars. This present [book] will, on the foundation of research set by predecessors, attempt a straightforward verification of the structural organization of the 'three meditation caves'. {57}

The document S. 1947 records that 'Dunhuang had in its management sixteen temples and three meditation caves' 敦煌管内十六所寺及三所禪窟. This is a document from the fourth year of Xiantong 咸通 (863) of the Tang dynasty in which the military commissioner (*jiedushi* 節度使) of the Guiyi Army and the [authorities of] religious communities together carried out an investigation of the properties of Dunhuang's Buddhist groups. [This document] directly explains that three meditation caves were under the jurisdiction of the religious community. In the Dunhuang materials, there are these forms of address for meditator monks {禪僧}: *sanku jiaoshou* 三窟教授 (Three-Cave Instructor), *sanku jiaozhu* 三窟教主 (Three-Cave Main Lecturer), *sanku yuanzhu* 三窟院主 (Three-Cave Abbot), *jianjiao sanku* 檢校三窟 (Inspector of the Three Caves), *zhi sanku* 知三窟 (Steward of the Three Caves), *zhuku chanshi* 住窟禪師 (Cave-Residing Meditation Teacher), *kuchan* 窟禪 (Cave Meditator), and *zhuku chanseng* 住窟禪僧 (Cave-Residing Meditator Monk or Nun). From this, we seem to perceive that the organizational structure held by the three meditation caves can be divided up according to the following several levels:

Management Office (*dusi*)

Three-Cave Instructor…Three-Cave Main Lecturer…Three-Cave Abbot

Inspector of the Three Caves Steward of the Three Caves

Three-Caves Resident Meditation Teacher . Cave-Residing Meditation Teacher

Cave Meditator…Cave-Residing Meditator Monk or Nun

都司

三窟教授……三窟教主……三窟院主
檢校三窟 知三窟
住三窟禪師.住窟禪師
窟禪…住窟禪僧

As recorded in S. 2113V, the one who assumes the post of Three-Cave Instructor is Fajian 法堅, the same person known from the document S. 7939.[[75]](#footnote-75) The Three-Cave Instructor (*sanku jiaoshou*) is the highest position of the three [meditation] caves and at the same time, after 810 in the period of rule by Turpan, the highest saṃgha official of Dunhuang's Buddhist communities was called the *dujiaoshou* 都教授 (Chief Instructor), in connection with the institutions of Tibetan Buddhism that placed emphasis on the *kanbu* 堪布 (abbot; Tib. *mkhan po*).[[76]](#footnote-76) Entering the Guiyi Army period, the position title 'Three-Cave Instructor' was replaced with 'Three-Cave Main Lecturer'. The 'Foshuo amituo jing tiji' 佛説阿彌陀經題記 [Epigraph for the *Sūtra of Amitâbha Spoken by the Buddha*], #35 of *jiezi* 芥字 in the Beijing Library (National Library of China) [collection of scroll fragments] {ZR is using shorthand for some system organizing Dunhuang holdings in a library collection: '北圖芥字35號' (藏敦煌殘卷芥字..?)}, says, 'The lay benefactors hold pure faith in the disciples of the Buddha, all the Main Lecturers of the Three Caves who are simultaneously Administrative Assistants of the Dharma lineages in the five nunneries meritoriously gathering the two saṃghas to together give rise to a victorious mind' 施主清信佛弟子，諸三窟教主兼五尼寺判官法宗、福集二僧同發勝心. {Does the passage not suggest a plurality of 三窟教主? } {58}

According to the research of Doi Yoshikazu, this is a tenth-century document and he believes that this system of saṃgha positions with the Main Lecturer of the Three Caves (*sanku jiaozhu*), in which the *dusengtong* 都僧統 (Chief Buddhist Controller) of Dunhuang's Buddhist community would directly appoint a presiding *sengzheng* 僧政 (Monastic Administrator) or *falü* 法律 (Master of the Teachings and Disciplines) to serve in these roles, is to be considered an honorary position.[[77]](#footnote-77) And furthermore, materials on the Inspector of the Three Caves (*jianjiao sanku* 檢校三窟) are seen in S. 4660.3 *Dunhuang guannei sengzheng jian goudang sanku Cao gong miaozhen zan* 敦煌管内僧政兼勾當三窟曹公邈真贊 [Eulogy on the Portrait of Mr Cao, Monastic Administrator with Jurisdiction of Dunhuang Who Was Also in Charge of the Three Caves], which was written up in 884 by Wuzhen 悟真, the Chief Buddhist Controller of Hexi (*Hexi dusengtong*), and which appears connected with the person Preceptor Cao Fajing 曹和尚法鏡, who passed away in the fourth year of Zhonghe 中和 (884) and who is known from records in scroll fragments {散??} 0544, P. 2079, Beijing Library New {北圖新} 0293, the epigraph {題記} of S. 5972, and P. 2838.[[78]](#footnote-78) The 'Eulogy on the Portrait' records:

6) The precepts a full white moon, temperance like the cold pines; moving within the rules, his natural endowment is great indeed.

7) Eating [as] authorized by the saṃgha leader, he gets along harmoniously with superiors and subordinates; the position is high but his mind [stays] low, only being circumspect, only being respectful.

8) The sweetness (secret) of the meditation hall presenting [itself], he directly arrived at penetration of the mind; the Instructor Who Has Reached the Ordination Platform: rely on his innate intelligence.

9) In generosity winning over the assembly, through intelligence rendering a great service; the Inspector of the Three Caves: through his countless strategies, the [Buddhist truth] is perpetuated.

6戒圓白月，節比寒松。動中規矩，禀性恢鴻。

7食權僧首，上下和同。位高心下，惟謹惟恭。

8禪庭蜜(密)示，直達心通。臨壇教授，賴之神聰。

9寬而得衆，敏而有功。檢校三窟，百計紹隆。

From the eulogy on the portrait we learn that Monastic Administrator Cao 曹僧政 is one who is stringent in [practicing] the vinaya, that he held a high position, and also that he was a saṃgha officer (*sengguan*) who held harmonious relations with the assembly. Owing to 'the secret of the meditation hall presenting [itself and his] directly arriving at penetration of the mind' 禪庭密示，直達心通, he successively held the posts of Instructor Who Has Reached the Ordination Platform (*lintan jiaoshou*) and Inspector of the Three Caves (*jianjiao sanku*), causing the Buddhist truth to be 'perpetuated by his countless strategies' 百計紹隆.

Materials on the Steward of the Three Caves (*zhi sanku* 知三窟) are seen in P. 3541 *Zhang Shancai miaozhen zan* 張善才邈真贊 [Eulogy on the Portrait of Zhang Shancai], the epigraph {題記} to cave #329: 'Therefore elder brother'...'Saṃgha Administrator' [Steward of the Three Caves]...'given in offering by the śramaṇa Shancai, Great Dharma Teacher Who Expounds and Propagates the Three Teachings and Was Bestowed a Purple Robe' 故兄……僧政(知)□(三)(窟)……闡揚三教大法師賜紫沙門善才供養.[[79]](#footnote-79) The eulogy on the portrait records:

11) Upholding moral conduct at Lingtu [Temple], [he] did not miss a retreat in winter or summer. Governing over vast resources, over the years

12) [he] did not act contrary to reason and old [things] accumulated. Because of this, his reputation spread far and the commanding general raised his rank to *falü*;

13) he presided over ceremonies of the five [ordination] platforms, and was repeatedly granted work at the Three Caves as an award...

11靈圖守行，冬夏不失於安居;葺治鴻資，春秋

12靡乖而舊積。所以芳聲遠播，元戎擢法律

13之班;秉儀五壇，重錫獎三窟之務……

{59}Shancai 善才 is also seen in P. 3100 *Jingfu ernian tuzhong gongying deng qing lüshi Shancai chong sizhu zhuang ji dusengtong Wuzhen panci* 景福二年徒衆供英等請律師善才充寺主狀及都僧統悟真判辭 [An Account from the Second Year of Jingfu (893) of a Group of Disciples Including Gongying and Others Requesting That the Vinaya Teacher Shancai Fill the Post of Temple Head and the Judgment by Chief Buddhist Controller Wuzhen], which commends his 'refined spirit of practice, his eloquence and quick wit, his every affair having courtesy; that the people of the time praised him and sighed in admiration, unanimously recommending him for a period, insisting on relying on this person; that for the duration of his taking care of affairs, there was no one who surpassed him' 精心練行，辯捷臨機，每事有儀， 時人稱嘆，一期食舉，必賴斯人，理務之間，莫過此者.

From this we know that Shancai was once recommended for [the position of] temple head (*sizhu*) of Lingtu Temple 靈圖寺, which matches with the record in the eulogy on the portrait that he 'upheld the moral conduct at Lingtu [Temple]' 靈圖守行. In S. 2575 *Tang tianfu wunian bayue lingtusi tuzhong shangzuo Yishen deng qing Daxing chong sizhu zhuang bing dusengtong panci* 唐天復五年八月靈圖寺徒衆上座義深等請大行充寺主狀并都僧統判辭 [An Account from the Eighth Month of the Fifth Year of Tianfu (905) in the Tang of a Group of Disciples Including Top Seat Yishen and Others Requesting that Daxing Fill the Post of Temple Head and the Chief Buddhist Controller's Judgment], at this time Shancai probably is no longer serving as the temple head of Lingtu Temple, [and] the chief Buddhist controller of this time is Kang Xianzhao 康賢照. During the period in which Shancai was filling the post of temple head, he presided over the activities of religious practice and study, such as the winter and summer retreats, for the disciples of the temple; his name was disseminated widely and in the time of Zhang Huaiding 張淮鼎 he was promoted to the position of *falü* 法律,[[80]](#footnote-80) assuming responsibility for the concrete monastic affairs of the three meditation caves in the Mogao Grottoes. The eulogy on the portrait also reveals to us that during the fifteen years when Shancai held the post [of *falü*{?}], he 'was warmly respectful and administered blamelessly' 温恭清政, had many accomplishments {建樹}, and later during the Jinshanguo 金山國 period he also participated in the work of renovating Sanjie Temple 三界寺, being promoted as 'Buddhist Monastic Administrator Conferred Purple Robes Who is a Greatly Virtuous 'Inner Offerer' [at the Imperial Alter] Who Has Reached the Ordination Platform Inside and Outside the Capital' 釋門僧政賜紫京城内外臨壇供奉大徳.

The inspector of the Three Caves (*jianjiao sanku*) and the steward of the Three Caves (*zhi sanku*) both are monastic positions that take direct responsibility for the supervision and inspection of the spiritual practice and study of the meditator monks {禪僧--and nuns? 'meditating monastics'? 'meditator clergy members'?} at the three meditation caves. Looking at the two positions from the assumption of these roles, they are differentiated by whether the person is exemplary in meditation practice or in terms of moral restraints and rules of discipline, as a meditation teacher or as a vinaya teacher; the time [of the positions] was during the Cao-family Guiyi Army period. The epigraph from cave #188 also says, ...'the Inspector-of-the-Cave Meditation Teacher Yuantong made offerings with single-minded focus' …檢校窟襌師圓通一心供養.[[81]](#footnote-81)

Materials on the Three-Caves Resident Meditation Teacher (*zhusanku chanshi*) and the Cave-Residing Meditation Teacher (*zhuku chanshi*) can be seen, separately, in P. 4640 *Zhusanku chanshi bo shamen Faxin zan* 住三窟襌師伯沙門法心贊 [Eulogy for Śramaṇa Faxin, Elder Brother to the Three-Caves Resident Meditation Teacher] and in cave #443: 'Śramaṇa Jiechang, Cave-Residing Meditation Teacher for Sanjie Temple, made offerings with single-minded focus' 住窟禪師三界寺沙門戒昌一心供養.[[82]](#footnote-82) Materials on Faxin 法心 are also seen in cave #119 of the Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes, within which is a sculpture of Faxin making offerings. Names of monks under Dayun Temple 大雲寺 and Jingtu Temple 净土寺 in S. 2614V *Shazhou zhusi sengni mingbu* 沙州諸寺僧尼名簿 [Registry of Names for Monks and Nuns of All the Temples of Shazhou] have the name Faxin, and near the seam on the back side of the paper with P. 2245 *Sifenlü jieben shu juan san* 四分律戒本疏卷三 [Fascicle Three of the *Commentary on the Four-Part Vinaya Manual of Precepts* (Skt. *Dharmaguptaka-bhikṣu-pratimokṣa-sūtra*)] has the signature 'Jingtu Tan'guang' 浄土談廣. S. 6889 *Sifenlü jieben shu juan si* 四分律戒本數卷四 [Fascicle Four of the *Commentary on the Four-Part Vinaya Manual of Precepts* {reading 數 as a typo for 疏}] also has the signature Tan'guang, and the document P. 4640 was probably {60} written after the thirteenth year of Xiantong 咸通.[[83]](#footnote-83) Faxin was, in the latter part of the ninth century, a monk of Jingtu Temple who took up the position of Meditation Teacher of the Three Caves (*sanku chanshi*). Guiding the meditator monks in their cultivation of meditation entailed providing corrections and resolutions for problems appearing in the course of practice for all the clergy members sent by the various temples to study meditation.

The times of appearance of the 'Three-Caves Resident Meditation Teacher' (*zhusanku chanshi*) and the 'Cave-Residing Meditation Teacher' (*zhuku chanshi*) are not the same, [their] different [appearances taking place] between the ninth and the tenth centuries. As guides who were permanently stationed in the Three Caves [to help with] the practice and study of meditating clergy members, the responsibilities of the two positions probably did not differ.

 There are many records of Cave Meditators (*kuchan*) and 'cave-residing meditator monks or nuns' (*zhuku chanseng*) in the epigraphs of the Mogao Grottoes. They were monks and nuns, sent by the various temples of Dunhuang's religious communities, who had come to cultivate meditation and, in a certain amount of time and with practical guidance from a 'cave-residing meditation teacher' (*zhuku chanshi*), were practicing meditation with great diligence ('pure progress', *jingjin* 精進; Skt. *vīrya*). Among them were Buddhist *falü* (clergy with expertise in the teachings or rules of discipline) {有釋門法律} and ordinary monks and nuns, all recorded in the epigraphs as having their own affiliations with a monastery.

The three meditation caves were directly under the supervision of the Management Office (*dusi*), which organized the meditation practice in these [facilities] for each temple's monks and nuns, beyond a doubt giving expression to this important function of the base for cultivating meditation {awk, but how to fix?}. At ordinary times, the great multitude of monks and nuns worked in each temple, but for designated periods [they] came here for a set amount of time to [seek] realization (*quzheng* 取證, Skt. *samanvāgata*), and because of this the three meditation caves were––to use a phrase circulating in the Chan school during the Tang and Song periods as explanation––'a place where buddhas are selected and a site for the release [of suffering]' 選佛場和解脱場. Instances of 'cave meditators' (*kuchan*) and 'meditator monks or nuns' (*chanseng*) in epigraphs and in the records of [historical] materials include [these]:

...cave meditator...seen paying respects to painted Guanyin [#]1 □窟襌□見是敬畫觀音一

Cave meditator Yande, a Buddhist *falü* of Bao'en Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪報恩寺釋門法律鹽棏供養

Cave meditator Fusui, a Buddhist *falü* of Liantai Temple, gave offerings. 窟襌蓮臺寺釋門法律福遂供養

Cave meditator Xingdao, a Buddhist *falü* of ... Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪……寺法律興道供養

Cave meditator..., a Buddhist *falü* of Shengguang Temple, ... 窟禪聖光寺釋門法律…

Cave meditator Xingsui, a Buddhist *falü* of Xiande Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪顯德寺釋門法律興遂供養

Cave meditator ...cun, a Buddhist *falü* of Lingtu Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪靈圖寺法律□存供養

Cave meditator Zuoxing, a Buddhist *falü* of Sanjie Temple, was seen making offerings. 窟禪三界寺釋門法律左興見[供養] {供 as superscript, 養 as subscript}

{61}Cave meditator Zhou..., a Buddhist *falü* of Longxing Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪龍興寺釋門法律周□□供養

Cave meditator [and Assembly President {a leader of some kind}] ..., *falü* of ... Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪□□寺法律□會長供養

Cave meditator ..., *falü* of ... Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪□□寺法律□□供養

Cave meditator ..., a Buddhist *falü* of Kaiyuan Temple, gave offerings. 窟襌開元寺法律□□□供養

Cave meditator Suohui, ... *falü* of ... Temple, deposited an offering. 窟禪……寺……法律索會存供養

Cave meditator ..., ... *falü* of [Bao'en] Temple, gave offerings. 窟禪□(報)□(恩)寺……法律□□□供養

Cave-residing meditator monk Hui..., a śramaṇa of Xiande Temple, gave offerings with single-minded [devotion]. 住窟禪僧顯德寺沙門惠□□一心供養

Cave-residing [meditator] [monk] Rui..., a śramaṇa of..., ...with single-minded [devotion]. 住窟□(禪)□(僧)□□□沙門□(瑞)□一心□□

...inspector of the Cave and Meditation Teacher Yuantong gave offerings with single-minded [devotion]. ……檢校窟禪師圓通一心供養[[84]](#footnote-84)

In the listing above of [instances of] 'cave-residing meditator monks (or nuns)' (*zhuku chanseng*) and 'cave meditators' (*kuchan*), a quite outstanding characteristic is that the proportion made up of 'Buddhist *falü*' is relatively high. Secondly, among [Dunhuang's] five convents, Shengguang Temple also had [resident nuns] with status as 'cave meditator nuns' (*kuchan ni* 窟襌尼) training and studying in the three meditation caves. We saw that the three meditation caves were under the control of the Management Office (*dusi*) and that the system of operations that it organized were independent and outside of the [administration of the] 'three directors' (*san'gang*) of the various temples, placing particular stress on the training and study [aspect of] the saṃgha official (*seng'guan*) administrative system.

2.5 Thought on Dhūta (Austerities) and the Social Function of Dunhuang's *Araṇya*

From the ninth to tenth centuries, Dunhuang had altogether nineteen *araṇya* (*lanruo/lanre* 蘭若), separately labeled by [either] a religious phrase, the local authorities building [it], the name of the donor, etc.[[85]](#footnote-85) *Araṇya* may be looked upon as small temples, which had multiple functions in Dunhuang, this peculiar Buddhist city. A deep inquiry into the functions of *araṇya* will help us with an overall understanding of the special nature of Dunhuang Buddhism.

{62}The Sanskrit for *lanre/lanruo* 蘭若 is *āranya* [sic.? (araṇya)], and the Pāli is *aranna* [sic.? (*arañña*)]. It is also rendered *alianru/elianru* 阿練茹, *alanna/elanna* 阿蘭那, *alannu/elannu* 阿蘭奴, and is abbreviated as *lanruo* and *lianruo* 練若, and translated as *shanlin* 山林 (mountain forest) and *huangye* 荒野 (wilderness). It means a far-off place, a quiet place, a most idle place, a place without disputes; it is a *krośa* (mile) removed from human settlements and is a leisurely place appropriate for spiritual practice. The practitioner-monks {比丘道人} at this domicile for spiritual practice are called *alanruojia* /*elanruojia* 阿蘭若迦 (Skt. *āranyaka*{araṇyaka? āraṇyaka?}). According to a record in the first fascicle of the *Huiyuan yinyi* 慧苑音譯 [Huiyuan's Pronunciations and Meanings],[[86]](#footnote-86) *araṇya* are divided into three types: 1) *damo alanruo* 達摩阿蘭若, Skt. *dharma-āranya*, which are bodhi-sites where people seek release [from suffering]; 2) *modengqie alanruo* 摩燈伽阿蘭若, Skt. *mataṅga-āranya*, a graveyard or [place] a *krośa* (mile) removed from human settlements, a place where the mooing of a great ox cannot be heard; 3) *zhantuoqie* *alanruo* 旃陀伽阿蘭若, Skt. *dandaka-āranya*, a desert wilderness with no human smoke. This a division of *araṇya* from the early periods of Indian Buddhism.

The twenty-fifth fascicle of the *Yuqie shidi lun* 瑜伽師地論 [Discourse on the Stages of Concentration Practice] has an even more concrete explanation of *araṇya*: 'What is that which is called an "*araṇya*"? It refers to living in an uninhabited place, a mountain forest, or agricultural fields {垌野}, using the margins, and anything for a bed, keeping far from all village settlements––this is what is meant by residing in *araṇya*' 云何名爲住阿練若？謂住空閑、山林、垌野，受用邊際，所有卧具，遠離一切村邑聚落，如是名爲住阿練若. Furthermore, in the same fascicle, the point is made that the primary purpose for residing in *araṇya* is to eradicate a clinging desire for housing.

Among the *araṇya* of Dunhuang, only the Suo-family *araṇya* 索家蘭若 and the Ma-family *araṇya* 馬家蘭若 are situated in the west of the city;[[87]](#footnote-87) the others are mostly within city limits. Fascicle twenty-four of the *Genben shuoyiqie youbu pinaiye* 根本説一切有部毗奈耶 [Vinaya of the Mūla-Sarvâstivāda School] explains clearly that 'those living in an *araṇya* are to be 500 bow-lengths from a village' 在阿蘭若住處者，去村五百弓.[[88]](#footnote-88) The emphasis on the distance of an *araṇya* from a village is [because] being close to one is not beneficial for the practice of meditation and being far from one is inconvenient for begging for food. The method of practicing at an *araṇya* is one of the methods for practicing austerities (*toutuo* 頭陀, Skt. *dhūta*), listed at the top of the 'twelve austerities' (*shi'er toutuo* 十二頭陀). The fourteenth fascicle of the *Mohe bore boluomi jing* 摩訶般若波羅蜜經 [Great Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra] records:

A Dharma preacher receives twelve austerities: 1) to do an *araṇya*, 2) to live only on alms, 3) [to wear] patchwork garments, 4) to eat [the day's food] in a single sitting, 5) to be frugal with the amount of food [eaten], 6) to not drink thick beverages after noon, 7) to dwell in cemeteries, 8) to dwell beneath a tree, 9) to dwell out in the open, 10) to remain in a seated posture and not recline, 11) begging for food in [proper] order, and 12) to [have] merely three garments. 説法者受十二頭陀，一作阿蘭若，二常乞食，三納衣，四一坐食，五節量食，六中後不飲漿，七塚間住，八樹下住，九露地住，十常坐不卧，十一次第乞食，十二但三衣。[[89]](#footnote-89){63}

The sixteenth fascicle of the *Shizhu piposha lun* 十住毗婆沙論 [Commentary on the *Daśabhūmika-sūtra*] points out the ten merits of the practice of *araṇya*:

[Regarding] monks who receive a place for an *araṇya*, although they increase all kinds of merit, we can summarize that they see ten benefits, and therefore, for the duration of one's life, [this practice] should not be abandoned. What are the ten [benefits]? 1) Freely coming and going; 2) having no self and no possessiveness {Skt. *na...ātmā vâtmīyaṃ vā*}; 3) to be free in one's abiding, without hindrances; 4) to turn one's mind joyfully toward learning [while] abiding in *araṇya*; 5) to have few desires and few matters [to attend to] in one's abode; 6) to not pity {i.e. to be indifferent to} the life of the body, because one is satisfied by merit; 7) to distance oneself from the multitudes because of their noisy chatter; 8) although practicing [for] merit, to not seek rewards; 9) to follow along with meditative concentration, easily obtaining a unity of mind; and 10) to live in an open space, easily giving rise to an awareness of being without hindrances. For inquiring about illness and whatnot, one comes [back] to the temple. 受阿練若處比丘，雖增長種種功德，略説見十利故，盡形不應捨，何等為十？ 一，自在來去。二，無我無我所。三，隨意所住，無有障礙。四，心轉樂習，阿練若住處。五，住處少欲少事。六，不惜身命，為具足功德故。七，遠離衆鬧語故。八，雖行功德不求恩報。九，随順禪定，易得一心。十，於空處住，易生無障礙想，問訊病等來至寺者。[[90]](#footnote-90)

The Buddha once praised the twelve austerities as the root of spiritual practice. The sixty-ninth chapter of the *Dazhidu lun* 大智度論 [Treatise on the Great Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra] [says], 'The Buddha wanted to cause his disciples to follow the path of spiritual discipline and to give up worldly pleasures, so he praised the twelve austerities' 佛意欲令弟子隨道行捨世樂，故讚十二頭陀. In the same fascicle, it also says:

The twelve austerities are not named as precepts. If one can practice them, then they adorn the precepts; if one cannot practice them, this is not a violation of the precepts. As with charity, where if one practices it one gains merit, but those who cannot practice it are without fault, the austerities are like this... The method [of practicing] *araṇya* is to remove oneself far away from the hustle and bustle [of the world], abiding in a vacant place. The nearest distance [allowed for the *araṇya*] is three *li[[91]](#footnote-91)*; if one can be further removed, this is of benefit to virtue. To have obtained already this removal of one's body [from worldly influences] causes one's mind, also, to be far removed from the five desires and the five obstructions [to wisdom]. 十二頭陀不名為戒，能行則戒莊嚴，不能行不犯戒。譬如布施，能行則得福，不能行者無罪，頭陀亦如是……阿蘭若法，令身遠離憒鬧，住於空閑，遠離者最近三里，能遠益善，得是身遠離已，亦當令心遠離五欲五蓋。[[92]](#footnote-92)

The above materials help us to understand that the site of an *araṇya* should maintain a certain distance from villages, in order to be convenient for meditative training and religious practices {襌修行道}. *Araṇya* are one of the twelve methods of practicing austerities and are a primary mode of religious practice for monks. Living in *araṇya* has a host of merits, as praised by the Buddha.

Dunhuang's *araṇya* are of different types and natures. First, according to a record in the document P. 3343 *Lübu shushi* 律部疏釋 [An Exegesis of the Vinaya], the Shazhou (Dunhuang) monk Tanxing 曇興 copied scriptures and disciplinary codes at the 'Military' *Araṇya* (*junmen lanre* 軍門蘭若). P. 2085 *Sifenlü shanfan buque xingshi chao juan shang zhi yu* 四分律删繁補闕行事鈔卷上之餘 [Remaining Portion of the First Fascicle of the Transcription of Abridged and Augmented Rules of Conduct from the Four-Part Vinaya] also says that, 'Inspection of the Dongshan *Araṇya* was completed and [it was] again established on the sixteenth day of the sixth month of the year of the tiger' 寅年六月十六日於東山蘭若勘了再定.[[93]](#footnote-93) {64} Among the nineteen *araṇya*, currently there are not yet [other identified] records on the practice and study activities of clergy members such as other *araṇya* monks. To live in *araṇya* is a kind of spiritual cultivation [based on] austerities {頭陀修行}. And for someone to copy out scriptures and vinaya writings, this person's life in the moral restraints and rules of discipline must have been rigorous and plain. The sites of the Junmen *Araṇya* and Dongshan *Araṇya*––although we have no way to be certain, but judging from their having accommodation for monks and being diligent in vigorous practical training and study––probably had the protective support of a lay benefactor. Among Dunhuang's *araṇya*, the ones we already know of are only these two, serving as *araṇya* that transcended the [mundane] world with methods for the practice of austerities.

Secondly, an *araṇya* built by a prominent family of aristocrats had the respective surname of the clan bestowed upon it, highlighting this special characteristic of the *araṇya* of prominent families. In the Dunhuang document S. 086 *Chunhua ernian machounü huishi shu* 淳化二年馬醜女回施疏 [A Discussion from the Second Year of Chunhua (991) of the Homely Woman of the Ma Family Devoting Herself to Saving Others] there is record of a homely woman of the Ma 馬 family, after arriving at the final moments [of the life of a family member], holding large-scale Dharma assemblies {法會} such as the giving of alms (*shishe* 施舍), [scripture] recitation and recollecting [the buddhas' names] {or 'the reformation of one's thinking'?} (*zhuannian* 轉念), and offerings of food to the Buddhist clergy (*zhaigong* 齋供). On the ninth day of the third month, [she] donated to Dunhuang's famous and large temple, Jin'guangming Temple 金光明寺, one *shi* 碩[[94]](#footnote-94) of wheat, and she donated to the Ma-Family Araṇya, situated to the west of the city, which her own clan had built, and to the Suo-Family Araṇya, to which she was connected by marriage. At first she donated one *pi* 疋 (bolt) of cotton cloth, but upon the opening of the tomb and cremation of the corpse, she again donated, 'one green-jade bracelet and woven skirt, a purple damask-silk blouse, two white-silk blouses, one silk scarf, one silk handkerchief, one cotton handkerchief, three *shi* of millet, and one bolt of cotton cloth' 緑鐲織裙一腰，紫綾子衫子、白絹衫子共兩事，絹領巾壹事、綉鞋一兩(雙)、絹手巾一個，布手巾一個、粟三碩、布壹疋. She also provided for seventeen Buddhist assemblies (*hui*會), feeding meals to 230 clergy members, holding ten recitations from the *Miaofa lianhua jing* 妙法蓮花經 [Sūtra of the Lotus of the Wonderful Dharma], eighty from the *Guan Mile pusa shangsheng doushuai tian jing* 觀彌勒菩薩上生兜率天經 [Sutra on the Contemplation of the Bodhisattva Maitreyaʼs Ascent to Rebirth in Tuṣita Heaven], two from the *Jin'gang bore boluomi jing* 金剛般若波羅蜜經 [Diamond Sūtra], one fascicle of the *Shi zhong sishiba qing jie* 重四十八輕戒 [ten major and forty-eight minor precepts], 600 recitations of the *Foding zunsheng tuoluoni* 佛頂尊勝陀羅尼 [Dhāraṇī of the Jubilant Buddha-Corona, Skt. *Uṣṇīṣa-vijayā-dhāraṇī*], one hundred recitations of the *Bore boluomiduo xinjing* 般若波羅蜜多心經 [Heart Sūtra], three thousand recitations of the *Cishi zhenyan* 慈氏真言 [Mantra of Maitreya], and so forth.

The grandeur of the Ma-family homely woman's remembrance services was not that which would be beyond the means of a prominent aristocratic family. Among the items she was donating, many are associated with those used by women; perhaps they were proceeding to donate items used earlier in life by the homely woman. At Dunhuang, clothing items of the deceased were put through auction {or sale by street criers? 唱賣} and could be traded for provisions of grain or bolts of cotton cloth. For instance, the document P. 2638 [says] 'In the thirty-second year (935), Vice Director Cao reached his grave and his items of clothing were auctioned for 3,540 *chi[[95]](#footnote-95)* of cotton cloth; when the Great King reached his grave, his items of clothing were auctioned for 8,320 *chi* of cotton cloth; when Liang Mabu reached his grave, his items of clothing were auctioned for 510 *chi* of cotton cloth' 乙未年曹僕射臨壙衣物唱得布叁仟伍佰肆拾尺，大王臨壙衣物唱得布捌仟叁佰貳拾尺，梁馬步臨壙衣物唱得布伍佰壹拾尺.

{65}Evidently, the donation of clothing from a deceased person and its subsequent auctioning was already a kind of cultural practice in the Dunhuang region. Among Dunhuang's *araṇya*, those capped with {冠以} the surname of a great clan also include the '...Changtai *Araṇya*' □長太蘭若 of P. 2817, the 'An Ziqing *Araṇya*' 安子清蘭若 of P. 2738V, the 'Zhou Family *Araṇya*' 周家蘭若 of P. 2738V, the 'Song Family *Araṇya*' 宋家蘭若 of S. 6583V, the 'Tang *Araṇya*' 唐蘭若 of P. 1261V, the '*Araṇya* of Eminent Teacher Kong' 孔闍梨蘭若 in P. 3707, and the 'Dong Baode *Araṇya*' of S. 3929. It is not difficult to make out the proportion of *araṇya* occupied by those built by prominent families, among Dunhuang's nineteen *araṇya*. Still, the construction of many *araṇya* of prominent families also helps us to learn about the relationship of Dunhuang aristocrats and *araṇya*, and it helps us to clarify one other characteristic of *araṇya* at Dunhuang.

Around the time of Kaiyuan 開元 (713-741) in the Tang, those surnamed Ma 馬 were a famous and prominent clan. One Xianghao Lingxin 香號靈信 from P. 3718 *Tang gu hexi shimen zheng sengzheng lintan gongfeng dade jian chanyang sanjiao pinizangzhu cizi shamen heshang miaozhenzan bing xu* 唐故河西釋門正僧政臨壇供奉大徳兼闡揚三教毗尼藏主賜紫沙門和尚邈真讚并序 [Eulogy on the Portrait of the Greatly Virtuous 'Inner Offerer' [at the Imperial Alter] Who Has Reached the Ordination Platform and Is an Upright Buddhist Saṃgha Administrator of Hexi Who Died in the Tang Dynasty and Also Śramaṇa Preceptor Bestowed a Purple Robe Who Expounds and Propagates the Three Teachings and Is Master of the Vinaya-Piṭaka, With a Preface] was preceptor with the secular surname Ma, and whose, 'lofty name reached the imperial capital, [where he] was bestowed purple [robes] in a public declaration' 即高名透達於帝京、恩錫紫彰. From the end of the eighth century to the start of the tenth century, the number of residents with the name Ma stood at the eighteenth place among all surnames at Dunhuang. The Suo 索 were also a prominent clan at Dunhuang and such documents as P. 4660 *Jin'guangming si gu Suo falü miaozhenzan* 金光明寺故索法律邈真贊 [Eulogy on the Portrait of Falü {Master of the Teachings and Disciplines?} Suo Who Died at Jin'guangming Temple] written by Wuzhen 悟真, and P. 4660 *Shazhou shamen Suo falü kuming* 沙州釋門索法律窟銘 [Cave Inscription of the Shazhou Śramaṇa Falü Suo] record the fact that Suo-family clergy members held posts as upper-level saṃgha officials {僧官}. At the same time, the Suo were an affluent and powerful family with extensive agricultural assets {桑麻萬壑的豪家}, and during the Guiyi Army period, the Suo were relatives to both the Zhang and Cao families on the wife or mothers' side {外戚}; the Suo were probably a first-class family at Dunhuang. The Tang 唐 were [also] a prominent family at Dunhuang. The preceptor Wuzhen 悟真, Chief Buddhist Controller (*dusengtong*) from 869 to 895, had the secular surname Tang. The epigraph in document 8418 of the Beijing Library collection says, 'Recorded by *bhikṣu* Wuzhen of the Tang family of Lu (Shandong) at the twenty-second [hour] on the sixteenth day, the seventh new moon, third month {??}, in the fifty-third year in the sequence [set by] the Great Barbarian [regime]' 大蕃歲次丙辰三月庚午朔十六日乙酉魯國唐氏比丘悟真記, and according to P. 2748 *Guoshi Tang heshang baisui shu* 國師唐和尚百歲書 [An Account of the National-Teacher Preceptor Tang Being One Hundred Years in Age] we learn that Wuzhen had been glorified as a 'national teacher' 國師. The Song 宋 were also a prominent family in Dunhuang. The epigraph for cave #156 at the Mogao Grottoes says,

 By imperial order of the State of Song [to be] Commandery Grand Mistress of Henei (lands north of the Yellow River), Guangping {her name?}, of the Song family, made offerings with single-minded [devotion]. 敕宋國河内郡君太夫人廣平宋氏一心供養[[96]](#footnote-96)

During the time of Zhang Yichao 張議潮, the Song clan was a notable family that intermarried with the Zhang family.[[97]](#footnote-97) {66}Among the *araṇya* constructed by Dunhuang's famous families and affluent class, what is worth noting is that Dong Baode 董保德, who served as Lackey (*yaya* 押衙) to the Military Commissioner (*jiedu* 節度), constructed a Dong Baode *Araṇya* 'at the eastern entrance to West-Traversing Lane off North Street, within the inner city walls of the government seat' 當府子城内北街西横巷東口. According to a record in the document S. 3929V/1, Dong Baode's 'painting was more than excellent, his pigments rare and extraordinary' 丹青增妙，粉墨希奇, and furthermore that 'the resources of his house were abundant, having a surplus when people ate' 家資豐足、人食有餘. Under the context of [his] collecting praise from higher and lower [status individuals] of his family, [his family members] constructed an *araṇya*, together cultivating merit. The *araṇya* that they built is of considerable scale, 'the heart of the temple having four walled enclosures, [with] images and sculptures, all of marvelous buddhas, arranged for display; forming a ridge at the four corners, [with] a dangling iron chain for pulling and ringing a bell, clearly sufficient. New, it could be mistaken for the palace of Maitreya, created like the pagoda for raising a king.' 刹心四廓，圖塑諸妙佛鋪;結脊四角，垂拽鐵索鳴鈴，宛然具足。新疑彌勒之宫，創似育王之塔.

The materials revealed by the above documents help us understand that the scale of *araṇya* of private households, in terms of standards for their construction, seem not to have differed from the average monastery. The faith-based Buddhism {信仰佛教}of the prominent families of Dunhuang [helped to] vigorously promote the development of Buddhism, giving rise to a kind of intensifying effect in the process of Buddhism's transmission. They were some patrons of large monasteries, carrying out donations to the monasteries and sponsoring meetings for the fast of purification (*zhaihui* 齋會), just as the Ma family mentioned above, at the time of the Buddhist services for when the homely woman of their household reached her end, made special donations of property to Jin'guangming Temple and were probably [already] protectors and sustainers of this temple.

At the same time, famous and prominent families expended resources to build other *araṇya*, serving as venues for the faith of one's own clan; it was here that one's clan carried out all kinds of activities such as praying [to buddhas or gods]{祈願}. [Among] the children of prominent families leaving home (*chujia* 出家), there were also those who lived at *araṇya* and passed their days in purity and comfort. The *araṇya* of famous families, moreover, had a certain level of efficacy in such areas as strengthening the solidarity of the clan or accumulating its power. For *araṇya* built by famous families, the aristocrats of great households were the true heads, really, of these *araṇya*. The reception of Buddhism{奉佛} among Dunhuang's notable clans had a decisive influence on the development of Dunhuang Buddhism. In the future, with the tentative title 'Dunhuang mingzu yu fojiao' 敦煌名族與佛教 [Dunhuang's Notable Clans and Buddhism], I plan to carry out a deeper inquiry into this problem.

Furthermore, the relationship between Dunhuang's *araṇya* and [state-sponsored] communities [of neighboring families] (*she* 社){this probably refers to lay Buddhist societies, not the state-designated communities; change here and below} is also considerably intimate. From S. 5828 *Shesi guiyue* 社司規約 [Stipulations for the People in Charge of the Community] and S. 4860V *Chuangjian lanre gongde ji* 創建蘭若功德記 [An Account of Merit from the Founding of *Araṇya*], we learn that the founding and maintenance of some *araṇya* had the direct participation of some communities and that this has caused some of the *araṇya* to embody some characteristics of the communities. The document S. 4860V records an account of [Buddhist] merit-building, [describing] how in particular neighborhoods (*fang* 坊), communities (*she* 社), and the town (*yi* 邑), at the suggestion of the officials of the communities {社官}, twenty-eight people together put up the resources to found an *araṇya*. All the people including the officials of the communities were, 'Longsha aristocrats, notable households of the five commanderies'...'The three officials spoke to the group of communities, saying, "We want now to divine for and buy an advantageous [parcel of] land"...The gathering from the communities and such [persons] three times gave their approval' 龍沙貴族，五郡名家…… 三官謂衆社曰:今欲卜買勝地，覜置伽藍……社衆等三稱其善. {67}The *araṇya* interior:

A sculpture of the Venerable Buddha Śākyamuni stood alongside his retinue, {?}[its] pale green brushwork completed; on the eastern wall was an 'image of transformation' (*bianxiang* 變相) depicting the subjugation of demons; on the western wall was a platform with a coloured, greatly sagacious, thousand-armed, thousand-eyed bodhisattva; on both sides upon entering the gate were talismanic wheels (*ruyilun* 如意輪) of unerring lassos (*bukong juansuo* 不空羂索, Skt. *amogha-pāśa*); outside the gate and under the eaves were painted the four heavenly kings and their attendants; in the four corridors were painted a thousand images of sages. The painted 'images of transformation' (i.e., images of scenes from the sūtras) and such were uniformly of agile skill: the light of a full moon reaching into a cave, excellent characteristics [of the Buddha's body] and a golden brightness to his complexion, illumination from a thousand rays of light, lotuses in splendour [with] all kinds of deities. The deities, having penetrated the ten [levels] of sagehood, are decorated in jewels and sitting serenely. The world-protecting heavenly kings are closely encircled by the eight kinds of beings. Lotuses grow in the front courtyard, on the same pattern as the Wild Goose Pagoda (Skt. *Haṃsa stūpa*), the pure sound [of the Buddha's voice] can be heard, just like in a meeting at Jetavana. 塑釋迦牟尼尊佛並侍從，縹畫功畢，東壁畫降魔變相，西壁彩大聖千臂千眼菩薩一鋪，入門兩邊畫如意輪不空羂索，門外檐下繪四天大王及侍從，四廊繪千照賢聖。所畫變相等，并以畢功，洞聞滿月，相好金容，映耀千光，蓮輝百神。神通十聖，敷寶座以安祥；護界天王，擁八部而圍繞。庭生菡萏，將同雁塔之儀；梵響知鳴，直像祇園之會。[[98]](#footnote-98)

The adornment of the Buddha images in the *araṇya* was as if the Jetavana [monastery] of olden days had reappeared, moreover transferring this merit to the military commissioner (*jiedushi*) and lay Buddhist societies {社邑}. S. 4860V *Chuangjian lanre gongde ji* helps us to understand that the groups from those particular neighborhoods, communities, and towns were all aristocratic, notable families of Dunhuang and that they founded an *araṇya* in the name of the community, earning merit to benefit their society.

The maintenance of decrepit *araṇya* was also carried out through the direct initiative of the community. The document S. 5828 *Shesi guiyue* [says] 'In the city are a ruined *araṇya* and things like an original Buddha-hall in disrepair. Within the community, there being no previous item [of discussion] for a case of merit-building [through] repair, [they] suddenly put up a notice to gather people from the community, investigating and repairing the *araṇya* and Buddha-hall' 在城有破壞蘭若及故破佛堂等，社内先來無上件功德修理條故，忽然放帖集點社人，檢索修理蘭若及佛堂. According to the research of Chikusa Masaaki, this document is from the end of the Turpan period or early in the Guiyi Army period.[[99]](#footnote-99) Repair of the *araṇya* and Buddha-hall was not originally stipulated [for oversight by] the people in charge of the community, [but], 'the people of the community wanted to cultivate merit and to make donations, deciding things and pressing for the repair and decoration of the Meritorious Ones, taking this upon themselves and consulting [together]' 社人欲得修功德及布施、裁物并施力修英功德者，任自商量.

Carrying out renovations of decrepit *araṇya* and Buddha-halls was considered a form of merit, and was undertaken on a voluntary basis. Documents relating to the founding of *araṇya* as well as the sculptures and colour paintings inside *araṇya* also include S. 0474 *Lanre nei zaoxiang gongde ji* 蘭若内造像功德記 [An Account of Merit from Making Statues in an *Araṇya*], P. 4040 *Jinshanguo shiqi xiuwen fang xiang she zaiji shangzu lanre biao hua lianglang dasheng gongde zan bing xu* 金山國時期修文坊巷社再緝上祖蘭若標畫兩廊大聖功德讚并序 [Praise for the Merit from the Neighborhoods, Lanes, and Communities Renovating the Signs and Paintings and the Great Sages of the Two Corridors in the *Araṇya* of their Forebears During the Rebuilding of Education in the Jinshan Kingdom Period, With a Preface], and, furthermore, the names of Dunhuang's *araṇya* appear in documents [called] *shesi zhuantie* 社司轉帖 (circulating notices from the people in charge of the community{/='lay Buddhist societies'?}), such as:

{68}Duobao lanre 多寶蘭若 [Many Treasure *Araṇya*]: S. 5139V *Qinqing she zhuantie* 親情社轉帖 [Circulating Notice of the Qinqing Community] S. 705, S. 6614V *Shesi zhuantie* 社司轉帖 [Circulating Notice from the People in Charge of the Community]

Guanlou lanre 官樓蘭若 [Official-Restaurant *Araṇya*]: S. 2894V *Qinqing she zhuantie* 親情社轉帖 [Circulating Notice of the Qinqing Community] P. 5003, P. 3434 *Shesi zhuantie* 社司轉帖 [Circulating Notice from the People in Charge of the Community] дх. 02449VI *Shewenshu* 社文書 [Community Document]

Dunhuang lanre 敦煌蘭若 [Dunhuang *Araṇya*]: S. 4660 *Qinqing she zhuantie* 親情社轉帖 [Circulating Notice of the Qinqing Community]

...changtai lanre □長太蘭若 [...('Long'+'Greatest') *Araṇya*]: P. 2817 *Shesi zhuantie* 社司轉帖 [Circulating Notice from the People in Charge of the Community]

Kong sheli lanre 孔闍梨蘭若 [Teacher Kong *Araṇya*]: P. 3707 *Qinqing she zhuantie* 親情社轉帖 [Circulating Notice of the Qinqing Community]

Jiejia lanre 節加蘭若 [Increase Moral Integrity *Araṇya*]: S. 1435V, *Guangqi ernian shesi zhuantie* 光啓二年社司轉帖 [Circulating Notice from the People in Charge of the Community from the Second Year of Guangqi (886)]

Dangfang lanre 當房蘭若 [Common Room of the Clan *Araṇya*]: S. 474 *Gongde ji* 功徳記 [An Account of Merit]

Xin lanre 新蘭若 [New *Araṇya*]: P. 5032V *Shesi zhuantie* 社司轉帖 [Circulating Notice from the People in Charge of the Community]

Etc.

From the founding of *araṇya* by lay Buddhist societies {社邑}and from the maintenance of *araṇya*, we can already clearly see the relationship between communities (*she*){'communities'-->'societies'? or is the former better?} and *araṇya*. Since some *araṇya* were built by lay Buddhist societies, the community should be the true owner and manager of the *araṇya*. Whether or not these *araṇya* had resident monks or nuns still cannot be ascertained, due to limitations imposed by a shortage of material [records]. Still, the materials in *shesi zhuantie* record that gatherings of the lay Buddhist societies and the putting on of Dharma assemblies {法會} such as meals for the clergy (*zhai* 齋), burial [rites] (*zang* 葬), and sacrificial festivals (*ji* 祭) all took place at *araṇya*.

In document S. 6424 *Song kaibao banian shiyue qing bintouluboluo shangzuo shu* 宋開寶八年十月請賓頭盧波羅上座疏 [Memorandum on the Invitation of Top Seat Piṇḍola-bhāra[dvāja] in the Tenth Month of the Eighth Year of Kaibao (975) in the Song Dynasty] on the backside of a pieced-together scroll fragment, there is the rescript (*shuwen* 疏文) 'Go to the original residing Buddha-hall attendant and make offerings according to the old standards' 就本居佛堂子準舊設供, signed by brother officers of the community, Yin Xing'en and others {This seems confused: Is this a lay Buddhist society trying to get favors from the emperor? Here, '幸恩' could be not a name, but rather part of the statement about the lay Buddhists attracting favor. Or is this just a comment (not memorandum) communicating something locally within the lay Buddhist community? I cannot make much sense out of all this.}. Of course, the relationship between Buddha-halls (*fotang* 佛堂) and *araṇya* deserves to receive some further research. In any case, serving as small temples without the inscribed horizontal board (*e* 額), in terms of their qualities, there should not have been too great a discrepancy. Fujieda Akira, in 'Tonkō no sōni seki', has discussed both of them together.[[100]](#footnote-100) Actually, *araṇya* had, in some senses, already become the central site of activities for [lay Buddhist] communities. Every time the lay Buddhist societies gathered, they carried out penalties for those who were late or who did not come. Because Dunhuang's *araṇya* were mostly built in bustling commercial quarters{市區}, and with the frequent activities of the [lay Buddhist] communities at the *araṇya*, the relationship between [lay Buddhist] communities and *araṇya* was made quite intimate.

*Araṇya* were also venues for the faith-based practices of lay Buddhist societies. Araṇya very much bore the colours of [their] lay Buddhist societies, clearly embodying the functions of the lay Buddhist societies.{69} In addition, based on the research of Doi Yoshikazu on P. 4525 *Guanfu jiu poli* 官府酒破歷 [A Record of Expenditures on Alcoholic Beverages by the Local Authorities] and S. 6452B *Mousi poli* 某寺破歷 [Record of Expenditures for Some Temple], he proposes that Dunhuang's *araṇya* also functioned as public sites for social interaction.[[101]](#footnote-101) This change in the qualities of *araṇya* had already elicited the attention of the ruling authorities, becoming one of the objects of attack in movements to abolish Buddhism{廢佛運動}. The fourth fascicle of [Ennin's] *Nittō guhō junrei kōki* 入唐求法巡禮行記 [Record of Travel to the Tang in Search of the Dharma]{cited earlier--keep this as an aid or drop?} records how in the seventh month of the fourth year of Huichang 會昌 (844), close to two hundred mountain hermitages (*shanfang* 山房), *araṇya*, ordinary Buddha-halls (*fotang*), public wells (*yijing* 義井), and villages or small towns were demolished. The seventy-sixth fascicle of the *Quan tang wen* 全唐文 [The Complete Tang Writings] records how in the eighth month of the fifth year of Huichang (845), 4,600 *siyuan* 寺院 (monasteries) and more than 40,000 *zhaoti* 招提 (monasteries, Skt. *caturdiśaḥ*/*cātur*-*deśika*) and *araṇya* were prohibited and destroyed.

Some of Dunhuang's *araṇya* were under the jurisdiction of the monasteries of religious communities{教圑寺院}; the document P. 2638 has record of 'the *araṇya* of various temples' 諸寺蘭若. At the same time, serving as a place for achieving liberation through the bitter practice of austerities, the Junmen *Araṇya* and Dongshan *Araṇya* still had the simple and unsophisticated style of the *araṇya* of early periods and were a rarity{鳳毛麟角} among Dunhuang's *araṇya*. *Araṇya* built by famous and prominent families were venues for the respective clan's devotional prayers. *Araṇya* founded and maintained by a lay Buddhist society served as a center for the activities of the lay Buddhist society. As the backgrounds of Dunhuang's *araṇya* have all kinds of discrepancies, as discussed above, [this] also clarifies the different functions of Dunhuang's *araṇya*. This also is one of the important characteristics of popular Buddhism in Dunhuang.

2.6 Characteristics of Dunhuang's Buddhist Temples

Concerning the problem of the nature of Dunhuang's monasteries, Chikusa Masaaki had pointed out as early as 1961 that Dunhuang's monasteries are all vinaya temples (*lüsi* 律寺), and he believed that the institutions of the Rules of Purity (*qinggui* 清規) of Chan Buddhism in the Tang and Five Dynasties did not influence Dunhuang.[[102]](#footnote-102) Jiang Boqin, in his paper 'Dunhuang pini zangzhu kao' 敦煌毗尼藏主考 [A Study of Dunhuang's Vinaya Librarians]{70} uses an investigation of vinaya librarians to assert that, in terms of their organization, Dunhuang's Buddhist temples had the characteristics of vinaya temples.[[103]](#footnote-103) Shiina Kōyū presented [the paper] 'Shotō zensha no ritsuin kyojū ni tsuite' 初唐禪者の律院居住について [On Early-Tang Meditators Residing in Vinaya Temples], which considers that the residing in vinaya monasteries of early-period meditators was a stage passed prior to the Chan school [achieving institutional] independence.[[104]](#footnote-104) The research of our predecessors provides important insights{啓迪} for our understanding the characteristics of Dunhuang monasticism, and at the same time also allows us have hope that we can approach problems on the organization of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples with improved understanding. This section first proceeds to retrace the phenomenon of meditator and vinaya [monks or nuns] residing together, and then turns to the completion of Baizhang's Rules of Purity (*Baizhang qinggui* 百丈清規) and an analysis of how the independence of Chan-school religious groups did not have much influence on Dunhuang's Buddhist temples. Based on Dunhuang's textual materials, we will explore this problem of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples still continuously holding to an organizational pattern of meditator and vinaya [monks or nuns] residing together.

2.6.1 A Search for the Origins of Meditator and Vinaya [Monks or Nuns] Co-Residing

According to the *Chanmen guishi* in the sixth fascicle of the *Jingde chuandeng lu*: 'What is taken to be the Chan school originated in small rooms, but ever since [Huineng 慧能 of] Caoxi many [practitioners] live in vinaya temples, albeit in separate halls, because in terms of exposition of the teachings [and] firm adherence [to these], they were not yet in accord with moral standards' 以禪宗肇自少室，至曹溪已來多居律寺，雖别院，然於説法住持未合規度故.[[105]](#footnote-105) Zanning says in 'Bieli chanju' 别立襌居 [Establishing Separate Residences for Meditators] from the first fascicle of the *Dasong sengshi lüe*:

Bodhidharma's Way is already in practice, with those who mutually speak to each other in 'opportune points' (*jifeng* 機鋒) singing their replies, but as for its transformation of the multitudes, [they] only follow temples and live in separate halls, moreover, without different standards. Chan Master Daoxin resided at Donglin Temple; Chan Master [Hui]neng resided at Guangguo Temple; Chan Master Tan lived at Baima Temple––all of them [under] disciplinary restraints. Only, those who practice and study Chan sometimes practice austerities (Skt. *dhūta*), the five-patch garment of thrown-away [fabric] being different, and that is all. Later there was Huaihai, the Chan master of Baizhang Mountain, who [with] creativity sorted the filaments of silk, separately establishing a common hall [i.e., sorted through the Buddhist disciplinary teachings to establish a common set of standards for Chan Buddhists]... Now, all the new rules, which were named '*conglin*' 叢林 ('grove'), were different from the vinaya and originated with Baizhang. 達磨之道既行，機鋒相遘者唱和，然其所化之衆，唯隨寺别院而居，且無异制。道信禪師住東林寺，能禪師住廣果寺， 談禪師住白馬寺，皆一例律儀。唯參學者或行杜多，糞掃、五納衣為异耳。後有百丈山禪師懷海，創意經綸，别立通堂…… 凡諸新例，厥號叢林，與律不同，自百丈之始也。[[106]](#footnote-106)

In the three hundred years between Bodhidharma and Baizhang Huaihai, Chan monks and nuns lived in vinaya temples, and, while observing the practices of disciplines and rites{律儀'vinaya rites'?}, they propogated the Chan style{禪風or 'meditation style'?} of their own house. The establishment of the Rules of Purity of Baizhang Huaihai marks the formal independence of the Chan-lineage{禪宗or 'meditation school'? this and related terms are problematic when simply rendered 'Chan'} religious community.{71} The meaning of this is that what China pursued [intellectually and popularly] was Mahāyāna Buddhism, while what it put into practice was the moral precepts and disciplinary rules of Hīnayāna Buddhism; Baizhang was an epoch-marking Chan master who smashed through the contradictions of this situation.[[107]](#footnote-107) From the perspective of the communal [living] and [the maxim of] 'one day without work is one day without food' that Baizhang promoted, Baizhang Mountain probably had a Chief of Manor (*zhuangzhu* 莊主) set up, along with an existing temple manor (*zhuangyuan* 莊園).[[108]](#footnote-108) Let's first take a look at the situation with meditator and vinaya [monks or nuns] residing together before Baizhang's time.

During the Tang dynasty, famous large temples all had meditation halls (*chanyuan* 襌院), and, especially before Chan-lineage religious communities had become independent, meditator monks and nuns mostly lived in vinaya temples. Among these, the tendency is especially pronounced for the northern lineages of Chan (*beizong chan* 北宗禪). As recorded in the 'Songyue si bei' 嵩岳寺碑 [Songyue Temple Stele] in fascicle 263 of the *Quan tang wen*, during the time of [Emperor] Daizong 代宗 (762-779), 'The meditation hall to the west is a remnant of the Palace of Eight Directions from the Wei. At the time, Meditation Master Yuan sat [there], insisting on residing on the mountain. His conduct showing no [trace of] vulgarity, four kingdoms respected this.' 西方襌院者，魏八極殿之余趾也。時有遠襌師坐必居山，行不出俗，四國是仰. And at this time, the famous meditation master Puji 普寂 (651-739) of the northern lineage was stationed{駐錫?} here.[[109]](#footnote-109) Faru 法如, a disciple of the Fifth Patriarch [of Chan] Hongren, lived at Shaolin Temple 少林寺; the *Tangzhong yue shamen Shi Faru chanshi xingzhuang* 唐中岳沙門釋法如襌師行狀 [A Record of the Activities of Meditation Master Shi Faru, a Śramaṇa of the Central Mountain During the Tang Dynasty] says, 'He travelled north to the Central Mountain (Mt. Song 嵩山) and later lived at Shaolin Temple, being with the assembly for three years' 北游中岳，後居少林寺，處衆三年.[[110]](#footnote-110) And Hui'an 慧安, a contemporary of Faru, lived at Huishan Temple 會善寺 at the end of the seventh century. Nanyang Huizhong 南陽慧忠, 'at first lived in the western meditation hall of Qianfu Temple, and [then Emperor] Daizong came to rule, [and] responding [to the emperor's invitation] with a visit, he settled at Guangzhai Temple' 初居千福寺西襌院，及代宗臨御，復迎止光宅精藍.[[111]](#footnote-111) Jingjue 净覺 (683-750), author of the *Lengjia{qie/ga} shizi ji* 楞伽師資記 [Record of Teachers and Disciples of the Laṅkâvatāra], lived at the famous temple of Chang'an, Da'an'guo Temple 大安國寺; Weikuan 惟寬 (755-817), a disciple of Mazu 馬祖, in the thirteenth year of Zhenyuan 貞元 (797) 'settled at Shaolin Temple on Mount Song' 止嵩山少林寺,[[112]](#footnote-112) [and] 'in the fourth year of Yuanhe (809), Xianzong wrote a memorial on Emperor Wu summoning him to Anguo Temple, where for five years he inquired into the Way at Linde Hall' 元和四年憲宗章武皇帝詔於安國寺，五年，問道於麟德殿.[[113]](#footnote-113) {72} The Chan school's northern lineage meditation master Yifu 義福 lived at Ci'en Temple 慈恩寺 in Chang'an,[[114]](#footnote-114) and Chonghui 崇惠 of the Niutou 牛頭 lineage first lived at Zhangxin Temple 章信寺 in Chang'an in the early years of Dali 大歷 [766-779], later residing at Anguo Temple 安國寺.[[115]](#footnote-115) And the famous meditation master Nanquan Puyuan (748-834), in the twelfth year of Dali (777), received the complete precepts at Huishan Temple 會善寺 on Mount Song.[[116]](#footnote-116) Puji's dharma-descendant (*fasun* 法孫) Zangyong 藏用 lived at An'guo Temple and filled the office of top seat at this temple.[[117]](#footnote-117)

That meditation masters of the Chan school's various lineages resided in either vinaya temples or large temples is a situation that was common before the independence of the Chan school, and among the above mentioned temples, those that had set up an ordination platfrom include Shaolin Temple, which in 'the fourth year of Chang'an (704), year number forty-one, fourth month, seventh day, this temple's administrators, Temple Head Yijiang, Top Seat Zhibao, Chief Rector Daju, Meditation Master Faji, and a group of disciples deliberated on whether Shaolin Temple would reestablish an ordination platform' 長安四年歲次甲辰四月七日，此寺綱維寺主義獎、上座智寶、都維那大舉、法濟襌師及徒衆等議以少林山寺重結戒壇.[[118]](#footnote-118) Huishan Temple 會善寺 set up ordination platforms in, respectively, the second year of Dali (767) and the eleventh year of Zhenyuan (795).[[119]](#footnote-119) In the middle of the eighth century, Da'an'guo Temple 大安國寺 incorporated a vinaya seminary 律院, with such vinaya masters as Rujing 如净, a Greatly Virtuous Once Who Has Reached the Ordination Platform, producing accurate commentaries on the vinaya.[[120]](#footnote-120) Baoying Temple 寶應寺 of Fuzhou 撫州, well known in society for its ordination platform, in 'the southeast of the temple [grounds] set up the Universally Unobstructed Meditation Hall' 寺東南置普通無礙禪院.[[121]](#footnote-121) In the Tang dynasty, many large monasteries clearly had the form of a vinaya temple, setting up ordination platforms and [having] vinaya masters give talks on precepts, while at the same time embodying the other functions of a large temple, such as lectures on the scriptures, translation of scriptures, and the cultivating of meditation. We know that in the meditation lineages {trying to avoid anachronism here}, before they were independent, the meditator clergy lived at big temples; this sort of situation continued right up until the Five Dynasties period. For example, the document S. 529 *Zhushan shengji zhi* 諸山聖迹[跡？character needs checking]志 [Essay on Holy Remains in the Various Mountains], in line 151, is a record of one monk's travels to famous places and mountains of his time. {73}At the Central Mountain 中岳 [were] 'six Buddhist monasteries and six Daoist temples, with more than 300 Buddhist and Daoist [clergy members], meditator and vinaya [clergy] coresiding, their deportment solemn and respectful' 僧寺六所、道觀六所，僧道三百余人，襌律同居，威儀肅穆. At Youzhou 幽州 was the greatly virtuous vinaya and meditation [master] Shenghong 盛弘, whose karmic deeds were singularly lofty.[[122]](#footnote-122) In the Five Dynasties period, the meditation lineages differentiated into 'lamps' 燈 and spread, especially southern Chan [lineages], which flourished to prominence for a time, having Hunan 湖南 and Jiangxi 江西 as centers.[[123]](#footnote-123)

And in the north, the pattern of having meditator and vinaya [clergy members] reside together continues. There is a direct relationship between the true independence of the Chan lineages [on the one hand], and [on the other hand] the formation of Baizhang's Rule of Purity and construction in each region of Chan temples 襌林. The greatest difference between Chan temples and vinaya temples is in their different views on the moral restraints and rules of discipline, those of the Chan school manifesting in a pattern [set by] the school, the Chan school [having been] first [to] shape its own Rules of Purity, which are also an important symbol of the independence of the Chan school.

The Rules of Purity depart from the traditional moral restraints and rules of discipline, but their basic spirit is in accord with the moral restraints and rules of dicipline. In the *Chanmen guishi* it says: 'The lineage I follow does not belong to the Greater or the Lesser Vehicles (i.e., Mahāyāna and Hīnayāna), but it is not different from the Greater or Lesser Vehicles; where it makes compromises after extensive study, these are set up on the basis of established models, taking care that they are appropriate' 吾所宗非局大小乘，非异[異?]大小乘，當博約折中，設於制範，務其宜也.[[124]](#footnote-124) This is the refreshing attitude of the Chan school toward the moral restraints and rules of discipline.[[125]](#footnote-125) Using the *Sifen lü* 四分律 [Four-Part Vinaya], which has prevailed in [Chinese] vinaya temples, as a foundation, [the Rules of Purity] synthesize such Mahāyāna vinaya as the *Yuqie lun* 瑜伽論 [Discourse on the Stages of Concentration Practice], the{which?} *Yingluo jing* 瓔珞經 [Diadem Sūtra], and the *Fanwang jing* 梵網經 [Brahmā's Net Sūtra], setting up compromises after thorough study, and with these formulating standards of conduct appropriate for the spiritual cultivation of meditators.

Another symbol of the Chan school's independence is the continuous expansion of the scale of the Chan Buddhist community. At the time of the fourth patriarch Daoxin 道信, there were some 500 to a little over a thousand disciples, lay and tonsured. Those in the various provinces who studied the Way (*dao* 道) gathered like clouds to the twin peaks and Regional Chief{reading 刺使 as 刺史} Cui Yixuan 崔義玄 also heard about him and went to pay his respects.[[126]](#footnote-126) Under Daoxin's discipleship, there should have been rules formulated to provide standards for the life of cultivation and study for meditator monks and nuns,[[127]](#footnote-127) and in such patterns of living as moving materials via waterways, doing work, and labouring, there were [some things that] constituted innovations in the early period of Chan monasticism{叢林}.[[128]](#footnote-128) {74} Helin Xuansu 鶴林玄素 expounded and propogated Chan-school [teachings] at Helin Temple 鶴林寺, attracting disciples.[[129]](#footnote-129) Meditation Master Chonghui 崇慧 at the 'start of Qianyuan 乾元 in the Tang, resided at Mount Tianzhu 天柱山 in Shuzhou 舒州 and established a temple. In the first year of Yongtai 永泰, it was by imperial edict granted the name Tianzhu Temple' 唐乾元初，往舒州天柱山創寺。永泰元年，敕賜號天柱寺.[[130]](#footnote-130) Guangyao 光瑶 of Baozhen Cloister 寶真院 in the Tang was the first to establish a meditation temple {(*chan'gong* 禪宮) meditation hall? HDC only says it is a Buddhist temple}. Daojian 道堅, from within the same biography, was deeply revered by the Minister of State 相國 at that time, Duke Yan 燕公, who built a temple and invited him to live there.[[131]](#footnote-131) Nanyang Huizhong 南陽慧忠 taught at Guangzhai Temple 光宅寺 according to the spiritual capacities of his audience for sixteen years,[[132]](#footnote-132) and Heze Shenhui 荷澤神會 (670-762), because he had once helped [Emperor] Daizong 代宗 and Guo Ziyi 郭子儀 recapture the two capitals, was in the time of Suzong 肅宗 invited inside [the imperial court to receive] offerings, in order to construct Heze Temple 荷澤寺.[[133]](#footnote-133) At the same time, Shenhui, owing to the penetrating subtleties of the constructed theories of the southern [Chan] lineages, caused Southern Chan to take the position of orthodoxy in the Chan school.[[134]](#footnote-134) In the eighteenth year of Kaiyuan 開元 (730), at the great assembly at Huatai 滑臺 in Luoyang, the position raised by Shenhui established the foundations of Southern Chan thought.[[135]](#footnote-135) At Mount Dashi 大石山 in Huangzhou 黄州, Fulin 福琳 'made a hermitage and lived there; the number of meditation companions relying on him were very many' 結庵而居，襌侣[侶?]依之甚衆.[[136]](#footnote-136) Daotong 道通 built a meditation temple {(*chanyu* 禪宇)as above, HDCD just says it is a Buddhist temple; consult Zengaku daijiten 671d, to which I don't have access} at Mount Ziyu 紫玉山 in Tangzhou 唐州, his students [studying] the fourfold collection (*siji* 四集).[[137]](#footnote-137) Nanquan Puyuan 南泉普願 settled at Mount Nanquan 南泉山 for thirty years, his disciples [numbering] several hundred.[[138]](#footnote-138) In the Five Dynasties [period], although the phenomenon of Chan and vinaya monks residing together [still] existed, the number of meditation temples{(*chanyu* 禪宇)} was on the rise. According to a record in S. 529 *Zhushan shengji zhi*, the Taiyuan [Plain] had at the time ten large meditation halls{(*chanyuan* 禪院) At what point should these be called 'Chan temples'? Is the sectarian consciousness strong enough before the Song period? Are these dedicated halls or independent monastic communities?} and over a hundred small meditation halls. {75}Youzhou 幽州 [had] over fifty meditation halls and Zhenzhou 鎮州 had thirty-six large meditation halls, as well as fifty-seven small meditation halls.[[139]](#footnote-139) The building of a great number of Chan temples{襌寺} and meditation halls{禪院} is an important marker for the Chan school's entering a [period of] flourishing, and these became bases for the propogation of Chan methods.

2.6.2 The Nature of Dunhuang Temples

In the above discussion, we saw that Dunhuang's temples had the three directors of a monastery (*san'gang* 三綱) as the core of their organizational structure, and furthermore that a vinaya master often appears in documents relating to a monastery. The positions of the *san'gang* [administration] in monasteries were often filled by vinaya masters, and the existence of vinaya masters in Dunhuang's various temples was probably quite common. Examples include Vinaya Master Shenxiu 神秀 of Kaiyuan Temple 開元寺 in S. 515 1-2V, Vinaya Master Shanlai 善來 filling the role of temple head in the document P. 3100, Vinaya Master Fayuan 法圓律師 and Vinaya Master Zhao 照律師 in the document Дх6065, and on the back-middle of P. 2856: Vinaya Master Ciyin 慈音律師, Vinaya Master Xiqing 喜慶律師, Vinaya Master Cihui 慈惠律師, Vinaya Master Qingguo 律師, Vinaya Master Xiji 喜寂, etc. Vinaya masters had a widespread presence at Dunhuang, reflecting the vinaya-temple character of Dunhuang monasticism. Nonetheless, according to material in Dunhuang documents, there appeared also meditation masters (*chanshi* 禪師), [dual] meditation and vinaya [clergy] (*chanlü* 襌律), and meditation halls (*chanyuan* 襌院). For example:

The document S. 530 *Shazhou shimen Suo falü kuming* 沙州釋門索法律窟銘 [Cave Inscription of the Shazhou Śramaṇa Falü Suo]{same document title as P. 4660, above, with same official title ('Falü') that is difficult to translate} says: 'After seventy-six springs and autumns, in'...'day'...'month in the tenth year of Xiantong in the sequence of years, he reached his end in seated posture at his original abode in the meditation hall at Jin'guangming Temple' 春秋七十有六、咸通十年歲次□月□日坐終於金光明寺本居禪院。

P. 6005 *Shimen tie zhusi gangguan*: 'Handled by the Meditation-and-Vinaya [Master] and the Top Seat of Yangben Temple' 仰本寺禪律及上座勾當.

S. 2575 *Houtang tiancheng sinian sanyue jiuri Puguangsi zhi fangdeng daochang bang* 後唐天成四年三月九日普光寺置方等道場榜 [Notice from the Ninth Day, Third Month, in the Fourth Year of Tiancheng During the Later Tang That Puguang Temple Set Up a Mahāyāna Practice Site]: 'We request that on the seventeenth day the meditator and vinaya Greatly Virtuous Ones (Skt. *bhadanta*) appear in all their glory' 十七日請諸寺襌律大德榮發.

 Дх6065 *Cheng'en tie* 乘恩帖 [Notice on Cheng'en]: 'with respect to meditator and vinaya elders of all the temples' 仰諸寺尊宿禪律, and 'Meditation Master Daoguang' 道光襌師.

P. 4660 *Li jiaoshou zan* 李教授讚 [Eulogy on Instructor Li]: 'He went down to cities, he went down to the outer cities [beyond the city walls], running around with his Chan questioning' 傾城傾郭，奔驟問禪.

P. 4660–3 *Cao gong miaozhenzan* 曹公邈真讚 [Eulogy on the Portrait of Duke Cao]: 'secret instructions in the meditation hall' 禪庭密示.

P. 3818–7 *Ma Lingxin miaozhenzan* 馬靈信邈真讚 [Eulogy on the Portrait of Ma Lingxin]: 'the meditation hall silent' 禪庭寥寂.

{76}From the Tang and Five Dynasties to the beginning of the Song, the Chan-school documents composed by mostly a core of Chan practitioners{襌者} are, in terms of volume, quite impressive.[[140]](#footnote-140) Furthermore, documents from the early periods of the Chan lineages{禪宗'school' vs 'lineage' depends on sectarian consciousness} were, at Dunhuang, already circulating, such as the *Lengqie shizi ji* 楞伽師資記 [Records of Teachers and Disciples of the Laṅkâvatāra], *Liuzu tanjing* 六祖壇經 [Platform Sūtra of the Sixth Patriarch], *Shenhui heshang yulu* 神會和尚語録 [Recorded Sayings of Preceptor Shenhui], *Tanfa yize* 壇法儀則 [Regulations of the Ordination Platform and Teachings], *Xinxin ming* 信心銘 [Inscription on the Mind of Faith], and *Fufazang yinyuan zhuan* 付法藏因緣傳 [Chronicle of the Successive Transmission of the Dharma Canon]. Japanese scholars such as Yanagida Seizan 柳田聖山 have already done thorough organizing and research on these documents.[[141]](#footnote-141) [Preceptor] Moheyan 摩訶衍 (Tib. Ma ha ya na) went from Shazhou to Lhasa, reasoning on and explaining meditation methods, with Dunhuang becoming an important channel for the Chan school to disseminate into Tibet, and also giving shape to a system of meditation methods taking Mahāyāna as its core,[[142]](#footnote-142) while moving a step toward merging with Madhyamaka (*zhongguanpai* 中觀派). Moheyan at times appeared with status as a teacher of Madhyamaka.[[143]](#footnote-143) Research on Moheyan and subitism (*dunmen* 頓門) has also produced considerable achievements.[[144]](#footnote-144) At the same time, Dunhuang also [was a site of] discovery of a number of impressive documents on the Tibetan Chan-school,[[145]](#footnote-145) this being an important historical verification of the interaction of Dunhuang and Turpan (Tibetan) schools of Chan Buddhism.

From this it is not hard to see that the Chan school had a certain influence in Dunhuang and in Tibet, with a very small effect on the organization of religious groups{I, the translator, remain unconvinced by some of this evidence, because mention of 禪 does not necessarily denote a sectarian understanding of the term. This section needs vetting by someone with good knowledge of the timeline of sectarian consciousness for Chan, in order to determine how to best translate each instance.}. Dunhuang's Buddhist temples continued to exist in the form of vinaya temples, even though in the Central Plain the Chan school and the [Buddhist schools based on doctrinal] teachings drank from separate streams. Especially after the Five Dynasties, the Chan school was moving toward a full blossoming, but on the basis of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples accomodating each school, the phenomenon of meditator and vinaya [clergy members] residing together was still maintained.

After looking into the reason [for this], we believe that the independence of the Chan school in the Central Plain is connected with the direct support of emperors, kings, and literati (*shidaifu* 士大夫), {77}and that the epoch-making appearance of Meditation Teacher{/Chan Master} Baizhang without a doubt stimulated a crucially important historical effect on the process of the Chan lineages moving toward independence [as a separate school of Buddhism]. Chan teachers{禪師} in all regions took a single *araṇya* {山林} as their centre, dividing the lamp to propogate [Chan methods], having a monastic life independent of the [Buddhist schools based on doctrinal] teachings. In the history of Dunhuang Buddhism, despite the continuity of the Chan school's passing of the lamp, the return to the west of Puji's 普寂 style of Chan,[[146]](#footnote-146) and the settling down [as abbot] of people such as Moheyan, still, the entirety of the organizational structure of the religious community at Dunhuang did not give rise to very big waves, resulting in the meditation lineages being unable to set up independently outside the monasteries of [Buddhist schools based on doctrinal] teachings.

Apart from this, the character of Dunhuang Buddhism is also expressed in aspects of the coexistence of Buddhist Studies {佛學研究} and Buddhism of the masses {庶民佛教}. Tankuang's 曇曠 cursory reading was quite broad, with [scholastic] attainments in the *Jin'gang jing* 金剛經 [Diamond Sūtra], *Qixin lun* 起信論 [Awakening of Faith], and in consciousness-only [thought] (*weishi* 唯識). Annotated commentaries on these scriptures were all in circulation at Shazhou (Dunhuang).[[147]](#footnote-147) The period of Zhang Yichao's 張議潮 political power (848-867), just after the Huichang suppression of Buddhism, was a period in which [emperors] Xuanzong 宣宗 and Yizong 懿宗made utmost efforts to revitalize Buddhism. Zhang Yichao sent eminent monks as emissaries to Buddhist circles of the Central Plain and Chang'an to build liaisons, and to the Tang court to seek those scriptures and books lacking at Shazhou.[[148]](#footnote-148) Moreover, by the time of [the eras] Xianheng 咸亨 and Shangyuan 上元 in the Tang, manuscript editions of the *Jin'gang jing* and *Fahua jing* 法華經 [Lotus Sūtra] were already circulating at Dunhuang, which undoubtedly was an influence on Dunhuang provided by Chang'an Buddhism.[[149]](#footnote-149) Facheng 法成, in Buddhist-Studies lectures on subtle points of reasoning such as consciousness-only (*weishi*) at Dunhuang, again advanced ~~the development of~~ {redundant?} the level of theory in the instruction of Buddhism at Dunhuang, and brought [new] vitality to Dunhuang Buddhism. Precisely because a portion of the Buddhist clergy excelled at Buddhist learning{内學} and was proficient in non-Buddhist classics, the development of learning in Dunhuang's Buddhist temples was directly promoted.[[150]](#footnote-150) According to reasearch by Naba Toshisada 那波利貞, {78}Dunhuang's Buddhist temples also had set up temple schools (*sishu* 寺塾), from which one could learn non-Buddhist [subjects] from erudite śramaṇa instructors.[[151]](#footnote-151) Yan Gengwang thinks that, with doctrinal studies in monasteries flourishing, Buddhist clergy members could not only impart knowledge to the sons of lay households as a social service, but also could cultivate{籍} [these relationships] to attract first-rate devotees.[[152]](#footnote-152) Upon reaching the period of Zhang Chengfeng's 張承奉 [rule], however, the status of Dunhuang's religious community fell. The documents S. 1064 *Tianfu ernian Guiyi jun jiedushi Zhang Chengfeng tie* 天復二年歸義軍節度使張承奉帖 [Notice from Military Commissioner of the Guiyi Army Zhang Chengfeng in the Second Year of Tianfu (904)] and *Dusengtong xianzhao tie* 都僧統賢照帖 [Notice from Chief Buddhist Controller Xianzhao] lay bare this news, clearly with prudence, before the notice from the military commissioner (*jiedushi*). This is connected to things such as the decline of activities of Buddhist learning at Dunhuang, and the falsifications{僞濫or corruption?} of monks and nuns.[[153]](#footnote-153) In the Cao-family Guiyi Army period, the military commissioners in successive posts took refuge and believed in{歸信} Buddhism, copying Buddhist scriptures such as the *Foming jing* 佛名經 [Sūtra on the Names of the Buddhas],[[154]](#footnote-154) opening up caves [in the rock wall] and making statues, the sounds of craftsmen not ceasing [to resound] in one's ears. Cao Yijin 曹議金 took the lead in renovating large caves like the ninety-eight caves of the Mogao Grottoes, stimulating fondness among other social classes for almsgiving, statue building, and such. And at this time apocryphal scriptures (*weijing* 僞經) abounded[[155]](#footnote-155) and *bianwen* 變文 [narratives] were in vogue, causing Dunhuang Buddhism to hereupon end its longstanding status as a superior religous community, the climate of emphasizing doctrine and emphasizing cultivated realization (*xiuzheng* 修證, Skt. *samudāgama*) became in one transformation the worldly Buddhism of the masses.

Lastly, according to records in the document Dunyan 敦研{Dunhuang Research Academy?} 0322 *Laba randeng fenpei ku mingshu* 臘八燃燈分配窟名数 [Register on the Lighting of Lanterns and Their Distribution to Caves on the Eighth Day of the Last Month], on the eighth day of the last month of the year (the day of the Buddha's enlightenment), lanterns were lit at sites of worship{神堂} such as Langzi ('Wolf Cub') Temple 狼子廟, again causing us to see how Dunhuang Buddhism in the periods following Guiyi Army [rule] had become intermixed with elements of folk belief.

To summarize the above [analysis], the character of Dunhuang's Buddhist temples at first had the organization of vinaya temples as a foundation, causing meditator and vinaya [monks or nuns] to reside together, with such phenomena as the merging of Chan (meditation) and Pure Land [methods] continuing to exist in Shazhou, the meditation training at meditation caves and *araṇya* also reflecting as a characteristic feature that Dunhuang Buddhism emphasized practice.

Next, we take up doctrinal research, with Tankuang 曇曠 and Facheng 法成 at the centre, along with the cave-opening, statue-building, almsgiving, and scripture-copying of the Buddhism of the masses, which represent, in that order, the main currents of Dunhuang Buddhism. Lastly, after drifting into the Buddhism of the masses, Dunhuang Buddhism also added elements of folk belief.

1. Trans. note: 'West of the river', a reference to lands to the west of the Yellow River, including the Hexi Corridor河西走廊, a string of oases comprising a section of the Northern Silk Road, roughly corresponding to modern-day Gansu. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Chikusa Masaaki 竺莎雅章. 'Tonkō no sōkan seido' 敦煌の僧官制度 [The System of Saṃgha Officials in Dunhuang]. *Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 31 (1961): 185. {cited previously, but I revised the title translation: adjust prev to this one} [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Trans. note: 'Forest' or 'wilderness', secluded places for spiritual practice. See the dedicated section on these below, in this chapter. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Fujieda Akira藤枝晃. 'Tonkō no sōni seki' 敦煌の僧尼籍. *Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 (Kyōto) 39 (1959): [page?]. {previously cited. ZR gives no page info} [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Rong Xinjiang 榮新江. *Dunhuang xue shiba jiang* 敦煌學十八講 [Eighteen Lectures on Dunhuang Studies]. Beijing: Bejing daxue chubanshe, 2001, p.216. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Xie Henai 謝和耐 (Jacques Gernet). Geng Sheng 耿昇, trans. *Zhongguo wu–shi shiji de siyuan jingji* 中國五–––十世紀的寺院經濟 [Monastic Economy in China from the Fifth through Tenth Centuries]. []: Gansu renmin chubanshe, 1987. {style Q: how to add tranlator? Note also that ZR does not give the translator when citing this in Chapter One. Should Ch or French name be dominant here and in reference list?} [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Yamazaki Hiroshi 山崎宏. 'Tōdai sōkan seido' 唐代僧官制度 [The System of Saṃgha Officials in the Tang Dynasty]. In *Chūgoku chūsei bukkyō no tenkai* 中國中世佛教の展開 [Development of Chinese Medieval Buddhism], edited by [], [pages]. [Kyōto]: Hōzōkan, 1972. {Same prob as in Ch1: ZR cites a chapter from the book, but gives no page info; I changed the title translation, so adjust the previous citation to this} [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Jiang Boqin. *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu* 唐五代敦煌寺戶制度 [Dunhuang's Temple-Household System in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987, pp. 51-53. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Jiang Boqin. *Dunhuang shehui wenshu daolun* 敦煌社會文書導論 [An Introduction to the Documents of Dunhuang Society]. [] Taiwan: Xinwenfeng chubanshe gongsi, 1992, Chapter 7: Jiaotuan 教團 [Religious Communities]. {cited in Ch1, so drop Ch and Engl title? Also: style check for ZR's practice of citing chapters, but not giving page #s} [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. Doi Yoshikazu土肥義和. 'Jiin to seikatsu' 寺院と生活 [Monasteries and Life]. In *Tonkō kōza: Tonkō no shakai* 敦煌講座•敦煌の社会 [Dunhuang Lectures: Dunhuang Society], edited by [], [pages]. []: Daitō shuppansha, [year?]. {incomp citation} [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Tanaka Ryōshō田中良昭. *Tonkō zenshū bunken no kenkyū* 敦煌禪宗文獻の研究 [Research on Chan-School Documents of Dunhuang]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1983, pp. []. {ZR gives: Chapter 5, Section 2: 'Shoki zenshū no kairitsu ron' 初期禪宗の戒律論 [A Discussion of Moral Restraints and Rules of Discipline in the Early-Period Chan School] --Integrate this into citation, or use page #s?} [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Hao Chunwen. *Tang houqi Wudai Song chu Dunhuang sengni de shehui shenghuo* 唐後期五代宋初敦煌僧尼的社會生活 [The Social Life of Dunhuang's Monks and Nuns in the Late Tang, Five Dynasties, and Early Song]. []: Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe, 1998. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Satō Mitsuo. *Genshi bukkyō kyōdan no kenkyū* 原始佛教教團の研究 [Research on Primitive Buddhist Communities]*.* Tōkyō: Sankibō busshorin, 1963, p. 279. {cited in ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *Nanchuan dazangjing* 南傳大藏經 [Pāli Buddhist Canon], fascicle 3, p.190. {incomplete ref info} [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Wang Bangwei王邦維. *Nanhai jigui neifa zhuan jiaozhu* 南海寄歸內法傳校注 [Annotated Critical Edition of the *Nanhai jigui neifa zhuan*]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1995, p. 65. {cited in ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. In the Eastern Jin period, Faxian's 法顯 primary reason for crossing over to India was that he 'Always felt indignant about the errors and omissions in the scriptures and codes of discipline, and vowed to go on a quest' [for better editions] 常慨經律舛闕，誓志尋求. T (*Taishō zō* 大正藏 [Taishō Canon]) no. 2064, 50: 956b09. {1st instance of Taishō citation, so include guide to abbr.? This is what ZR gives. Provide full Taishō citation? T = CBETA [Chinese Buddhist Electronic Text Association] (2008). Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 大正新脩大藏經. Edited by Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次郎 and Watanabe Kaigyoku 渡邊海旭. Tokyo: Taishō shinshū daizōkyō kankōkai/Daizō shuppan, 1924-1932.} [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. *Gaoseng zhuan* 高僧傳 [Biographies of Eminent Monks]. 'Dao'an zhuan' 道安傳 [Biography of Dao'an], fascicle five. Edition edited and annotated by Tang Yongtong 湯用彤. Zhonghua shuju, 1996, p. 180. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Ui Hakuju宇井伯壽. *Shaku Dōan kenkyū* 釋道安研究 [Research on Shi Dao'an]. Iwanami shoten, 1956, pp. 24-25. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. Ōchō Enichi 橫超慧日. *Chūgoku bukkyō no kenkyū* 中國佛教の研究 [Research on Chinese Buddhism]. Kyōto: Hōzōkan, 1958, p. 184. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. Fukui Fumimasa 福井文雅. 'Tōdai zokukō gishiki no seiritsu wo meguru shomondai' 唐代俗講儀式の成立をめぐる諸問題 [Some Problems Concerning the Formation of the Tang-Dynasty Public-Lecture Ceremony]. *Taishō daigaku kenkyū kiyō* 大正大學研究紀要 54 (year): pages. {missing info} [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Tsuchihashi Shūkō 土橋秀高. 'Chūgoku ni okeru kairitsu no kussetsu' 中國における戒律の屈折 [Distortion of the Vinaya in China]. *Ryūkoku daigaku ronshū* 龍谷大學論集 393 (1970): [pages]. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *Chu sanzang jiji* 出三藏記集 [Compilation of Notes on the Translation of the Tripiṭaka]. 'Jingbai daoshi ji juan diliu' 經唄導師集卷第六 [Compilation on the Officiant for Sūtra Chanting: Fascicle Six]. T no. 2145, 55: from 92b14. {ZR omitted the text #, which I have supplied, and only gives page 92, which is the beginning of the cited section, but does not tell us where to find the relevant content.} {ZR's practice is to cite sections from canonical texts, rather than giving specific page information: How should these footnotes be structured? Section first, or title first?} [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. *Fayuan zhulin* 法苑珠林 [A Pearl Grove in the Dharma Garden]. 'Baizan pian di sanshisi' 唄贊篇第三十四 [Article on Singing Praise: Part Thirty-Four]. T no. [], 53: 575c-576a. {missing info} [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. *Huiyuan waizhuan* 慧遠外傳 [Unofficial Biography of Huiyuan]. T no. [], 85: 1316c. {missing info} [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. Hirakawa Akira. *Ritsuzō no kenkyū* 律蔵の研究 [Research on the *Vinaya Piṭaka*]. Tōkyō: Sankibō busshorin, 1960, p. 161. {prev cited; drop char.s?} [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Tsukamoto Zenryū. *Tsukamoto Zenryū chosakushū* 塚本善隆著作集 [Tsukamoto Zenryū's Collected Works]. Chapter Three. []: Daitō shuppansha, 1975. {missing info: still needs page #s and style correction} [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Moroto Tatsuo 諸戶立雄. *Chūgoku Bukkyō seidoshi no kenkyū* 中國佛教制度史の硏究 [Research on the History of Chinese Buddhist Institutions]. Chapter One. []: Hirakawa shuppansha, 1990. {ditto} [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. *Weishu*魏書 [Book of Wei]. Juan 114, 'Shi Lao zhi' 釋老志 [Records on Buddhists and Daoists]. Zhonghua shuju, 1974. {citation style...} [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Fujieda Akira 藤枝晃. 'Tonkō no sōni seki' 敦煌の僧尼籍 [Documentation {Registers?} of the Monks and Nuns of Dunhuang] {*Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 (Kyōto) 39 (1959): []. Cited in Ch 1, but shouldn't he provide page info?}. Also Li Zhengyu 'Dunhuang diqu gudai cimiao siguan jianzhi' 敦煌地區古代祠廟寺觀簡志 [A Simple History of Ancient Ancestral, Buddhist, and Daoist Temples of the Dunhuang Region]. *Dunhuang xue jikan* 敦煌學輯刊 1-2 (1988): []. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Chikusa Masaaki 竺沙雅章. *Chūgoku bukkyō shakaishi kenkyū* 中國佛教社會史研究 {Ch/Jp script issue} [Research on the Social History of Chinese Buddhism]. Kyōto: Dōhōsha, 1982, p. 365. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. Chikusa Masaaki竺沙雅章. 'Tonkō no sōkan seido' 敦煌の僧官制度 [The System of Saṃgha Officials in Dunhuang]. {cited in Ch 1. ZR gives no further detail. I changed the title translation, so adjust prev to this (done in my file of Ch1, but needs attention in the edited file. Add the rest of the info?: *Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 30 (1961): []. } [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. Jiang Boqin姜伯勤. *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*唐五代敦煌寺戶制度 [Dunhuang's Temple-Household System in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987, Chapter Three, Section One. {cited in Ch1. Style check.} [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Niida Noboru仁井田陞. *Tōrei shūi ho* 唐令拾遺補 [Addenda and Corrigenda to the Remnants of Tang Statutes]. Tōkyō: Tōkyō daigaku shuppansha, 1997, p. 1003. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. 'Kaiyesi bei' 開業寺碑 [Stele of Kaiye Temple]. In *Jinshi cuibian* 金石萃編 [An Edited Collection of Inscriptions], edited by Wang Chang, fascicle 59, [page?]. []: Zhongguo shudian, 1985. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. 'Shaolinsi jietanming' 少林寺戒壇銘 [Ordination Platform Inscriptions of Shaolin Temple]. In *Jinshi cuibian*, edited by Wang Chang. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Zanning 贊寧. *Dasong seng shi lue*大宋僧史略 [Song-Dynasty Outline of the History of the Buddhist Clergy], T no. [], 54: 2.244c. {cited earlier in Ch2; note missing Taishō info} [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. *Chanmen guishi* 禪門規式 [Behavioral Code of the Chan School]. In *Jingde chuandeng lu* 景德傳燈録 [Record of the Transmission of the Lamp Published in the Jingde Era], T no. [], 51: 6.251a. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. *Chanyuan qinggui* 禪苑清規 [Rules of Purity for Chan Monasteries], fascicle two. X {《續藏經》第16套，第5册 I cannot find this based on his citation. A re-carved and annotated edition is in CBETA at X no. 1245, 63册} [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. *Sifen lü* 四分律 [Four-Part Vinaya, Skt. *Dharmaguptaka-vinaya*]. T no. 1428, 22: 48.922c-927c. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Trans. note: Years since being ordained. [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. *Pinimu jing* 毗尼母經 [Sūtra on the Source of the Vinaya]. T no.[], 24: 6.831a-838c. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Tang Geng'ou 唐耕藕 and Lu Hongji 陸宏基, eds. *Dunhuang shehui jingji wenxian zhenji shi lu* 敦煌社會經濟文獻真蹟釋録 [A Record Explaining the Authenticity of Documents on Dunhuang's Society and Economy], vol. 4. []: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1986, p. 58. {style check} [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. *Chixiu Baizhang qinggui* 敕修百丈清規 [Baizhang Rules of Purity Reconstructed by Imperial Decree]. 'Liang xu zhang' 兩序章 [Two Prefaces], fourth fascicle. T no. [], 48: 4.1130c. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. *Sifenlü shanfan buque xingshi chao* 四分律刪繁補缺行事鈔 [Transcription of Abridged and Augmented Rules of Conduct from the Four-Part Vinaya]. T no. [], 40: 1.6b. [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. *Chanmen guishi* 禪門規式 [Behavioral Code of the Chan School]. In *Jingde chuandeng lu* 景德傳燈録 [Record of the Transmission of the Lamp Published in the Jingde Era], T no. [], 51: 6.251a. {exactly same as above citation; both need a style check} [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. *Yakuchū zen'en shingi* 譯注襌苑清規 [The Translated and Annotated Rules of Purity for Chan Monasteries], fascicle 4. Tōkyō: Sōtōshū shūmuchō 曹洞宗宗務廳, 1973. {page?} [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. *Fozu tongji* 佛祖統記 [Comprehensive Record of the Buddhas and Patriarchs]. T no. [], 49: 36.341c. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Jiang Boqin 姜伯勤. *Dunhuang shehui wenshu daolun* 敦煌社會文書導論 [An Introduction to the Documents of Dunhuang Society], Chapter Seven 'Jiaotuan' 教團 [Religious Communities]. [] Taiwan: Xinwenfeng chubanshe gongsi, 1992. {book cited prev. in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. *Wumenguan* 無門關 [The Gateless Passage]. T no. [], 48: 40.[]. [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. Michihata Ryōshū 道端良秀. *Tōdai bukkyōshi no kenkyū* 唐代仏敎史の研究. Kyōto: Hōzōkan, 1983 {1957 in Ch 1}, p. 104. [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. *Chanyuan qinggui*. X no.[], 63: 3.531a. [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. Trans. note: Teaching, practice, and realization; Skt. *trayāṇāṃ dharmāṇām*; *tṛtīyo dharmaḥ*. [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. *Wudeng huiyuan* 五燈會元 [Combined Sources for the Five Lamps]. X no.[], 24: 9.924b. [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. *Jingde chuandeng lu* 景德傳燈録 [Record of the Transmission of the Lamp Published in the Jingde Era]. T no.[], 51: 11.[]. {already cited above; missing page info here} [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. Chikusa Masaaki竺沙雅章. 'Tonkō no sōkan seido' 敦煌の僧官制度 [The System of Saṃgha Officials in Dunhuang]. {cited in Ch 1 and above in Ch2. ZR gives no further detail: add? *Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 30 (1961): [].} [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. Tanaka Ryōshō 田中良昭. *Tonkō zenshū bunken no kenkyū* 敦煌禪宗文獻の研究 [Research on Chan-School Documents of Dunhuang]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1983. {cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. Ran Yunhua 冉雲華. *Zhongguo chanxue yanjiu lunji* 中國禪學研究論集 [Collected Papers on the Study of Chinese Chan Buddhism]. []Taiwan: Dongchu chubanshe, 1990. {cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. *Xu gaoseng zhuan* 續高僧傅 [Continued Biographies of Eminent Monks]. T no. [], 50: 17.569b. [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. Ibid. T no. [], 50: 21.613a. [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. Kitahara Kaoru 北原薰. 'Bantō godai no tonkō jiin keizai: Shūshi kessan hōkoku wo chūshin ni' 晚唐五代の敦煌寺院經濟––收{収use Jp or Ch character forms?}支决{決}算報告を中心に [Dunhuang Monastic Economy in the Late Tang and Five Dynasties: A Focus on Reports of the Final Accounting of Revenues and Expenditures]. In Kōza Tonkō [3] –Tonkō no shakai 講座敦煌[3] • 敦煌の社会, edited by [], [371-456]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1980. [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. Trans. note: *Hanshi jie* 寒食節, when only cold food is eaten for three days leading up to Tomb-Sweeping Day, Qingming jie 清明節. Both are implied here. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. Ennin. *Nittō guhō junrei kōki*, Fascicle 3, entry for the 25th of the twelfth month of the fifth year of Kaicheng 開成. {prev citation in Ch2} [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. Jiang Boqin姜伯勤. *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*唐五代敦煌寺戶制度 [Dunhuang's Temple-Household System in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987. {prev cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. 'Yue'an Haigong chanshi daoxing bei' 月庵海公禪師道行碑 [Stele on Chan Master Yue'an Haigong's Religious Practice]. In *Jinshi cuibian* 金石萃編 [An Edited Collection of Inscriptions], edited by Wang Chang [], fascicle 3, [page?]. []: Zhongguo shudian, 1985. {details imported from a previous mention of this collection} [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. *Mohesengqi lü*. T no. [], 22: 34.500a. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)
66. Chikusa Masaaki. 'Tonkō no sōkan seido'. {This is all ZR gives. Prev. cited.} [↑](#footnote-ref-66)
67. See Section 2 of Chapter Two in Jiang Boqin姜伯勤. *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*唐五代敦煌寺戶制度 [Dunhuang's Temple-Household System in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987. {prev cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-67)
68. Trans. note: Each of these terms from Buddhist monasticism has its own history of interpretation in Asian monastic contexts, and because these interpretations shifted over time and place, the adoption of Western terminology as analogs can prove inadequate and misleading. As the research in this book demonstrates, the implementation of these positions was dynamic and irregular. For this reason, an East Asian term, e.g. *weina* 維納, should be regarded as denotative and the English translation, e.g. 'rector', as merely suggestive. Nonetheless, for the sake of readability, I have opted to use English translations in extended discussions where too much terminology might become cumbersome. {move earlier in the book?} [↑](#footnote-ref-68)
69. Liu Huida 劉慧達. 'Beiwei shiku yu chan' 北魏石窟與禪 [Northern Wei Caves and Meditation]. *Kaogu xuebao* 考古學報 3 (1978): []. [↑](#footnote-ref-69)
70. He Shizhe 贺世哲. 'Dunhuang mogaoku beichao shiku yu changuan' 敦煌莫高窟北朝石窟與襌観 [The Northern Dynasties Caves of Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes and Dhyāna-Contemplation]. In *Dunhuang yanjiu wenji* 敦煌研究文集, edited by [], [pages]. Gansu renmin chubanshe, 1982. [↑](#footnote-ref-70)
71. He Shizhe 贺世哲. 'Dunhuang mogaoku {this was omitted in body text; which correct?}suidai shiku yu shuanghong dinghui' 敦煌隋代石窟與雙弘定慧 [Dunhuang's Sui-Dynasty Caves and the Dual Promotion of Meditation and Wisdom]. In *1983 nian quanguo Dunhuang xue taolunhui wenji: shiku kaogu pian shang* 1983年全國敦煌學討論會文集•石窟考古篇上 [Proceedings from the 1983 National Conference on Dunhuang Studies: Papers on the Archaeology of Caves Volume One], edited by [], [pages]. Gansu renmin chubanshe, 1987. [↑](#footnote-ref-71)
72. Sudō Hirotoshi 須藤弘敏. 'Chanding biqiu tuxiang yu Dunhuang 285 ku' 襌定比丘圖像與敦煌285窟 [Images of Monks in Meditative Concentration and Dunhuang's Cave #285]. In *Dunhuang xue guoji yantaohui wenji* 敦煌學國際研討會文集 [Collected Papers of the International Conference on Dunhuang Studies], 'Shiku kaogu pian' 石窟考古篇 [Papers on the Archaeology of Caves] {superfluous?}, edited by [], [pages?]: Liaoning meishu chubanshe, 1990. [↑](#footnote-ref-72)
73. Doi Yoshikazu. 'Tokuron tonkō no shakai to bukkyō: 9–10 seiki no bakkōkutsu to sansho zenkutsu to tonkō bukkyō kyōdan' 特論敦煌の社會と佛教–––九–十世紀の莫高窟と三所禪窟と敦煌佛教教圑 [Master Class on Dunhuang's Society and Buddhism: The Mogao Grottoes of the Ninth through Tenth Centuries, the Three Meditation Caves, and Dunhuang's Buddhist Communities]. In Dai yikkan 第1卷 'Higashi ajia bukkyō to wa nanika' 東アジア佛教とは何か [What is East Asian Buddhism?], *Higashi ajia bukkyō* 東アジア佛教 [East Asian Buddhism], edited by Takasaki Jikidō 高崎直道 and Kimura Kiyotaka 木村清孝, [pages?]. Tōkyō: Shunjūsha, 1995. {many problems with this citation} [↑](#footnote-ref-73)
74. Ma De 馬德. *Dunhuang Mogao ku shi yanjiu* 敦煌莫高窟史研究 [Historical Research on the Mogao Caves of Dunhuang]. []: Gansu renmin chubanshe, 1997, p. 212. {prev cited in Ch 1} [↑](#footnote-ref-74)
75. Doi Yoshikazu. 'Tokuron tonkō no shakai to bukkyō: 9–10 seiki no bakkōkutsu to sansho zenkutsu to tonkō bukkyō kyōdan' 特論敦煌の社會と佛教–––九–十世紀の莫高窟と三所禪窟と敦煌佛教教圑 [Master Class on Dunhuang's Society and Buddhism: The Mogao Grottoes of the Ninth through Tenth Centuries, the Three Meditation Caves, and Dunhuang's Buddhist Communities]. In Dai yikkan 第1卷 'Higashi ajia bukkyō to wa nanika' 東アジア佛教とは何か [What is East Asian Buddhism?], *Higashi ajia bukkyō* 東アジア佛教 [East Asian Buddhism], edited by Takasaki Jikidō 高崎直道 and Kimura Kiyotaka 木村清孝, [pages?]. Tōkyō: Shunjūsha, 1995. {same citation as above, repeated in full, as ZR does} [↑](#footnote-ref-75)
76. Ibid. [↑](#footnote-ref-76)
77. ibid. [↑](#footnote-ref-77)
78. Rong Xinjiang 榮新江. 'Dunhuang miaozhen zan niandai kao' 敦煌邈真贊年代考 [A Study of the Dating of Dunhuang's Portrait Encomia]. In *Dunhuang miaozhen zan jiaolu bing yanjiu* 敦煌邈真贊校録并研究 [Critical Editions and Research on Dunhuang's Portrait Encomia]. Taibei: Xinwenfeng chubanshe, 1994, p. 360. [↑](#footnote-ref-78)
79. *Dunhuang mogaoku gongyangren tiji* 敦煌莫高窟供養人題記 [Epigraphs on People Who Made Offerings at Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes]. []: Wenwu chubanshe, 1986, p. 133. {no author given} [↑](#footnote-ref-79)
80. Zheng Binglin 鄭炳林. *Dunhuang beimingzan jishi* 敦煌碑銘贊輯釋 [Dunhuang's Steles, Inscriptions, and Encomia Edited and Explained]. []: Gansu jiaoyu chubanshe, 1992. [↑](#footnote-ref-80)
81. *Dunhuang mogaoku gongyangren tiji* 敦煌莫高窟供養人題記 [Epigraphs on People Who Made Offerings at Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes]. P. 82. [↑](#footnote-ref-81)
82. *Dunhuang mogaoku gongyangren tiji*. P. 167. {fix above citation and replace this one with ibid + page #} [↑](#footnote-ref-82)
83. Rong Xinjiang榮新江. 'Shazhou guiyijun liren jiedushi chenghao yanjiu' 沙州歸義軍歴任節度使稱號研究 [Research on the Names of Military Commissioners Serving in Succession in the Guiyi Army in Shazhou]. *Dunhuang xue* 敦煌學 19 (1992): [pages]. [↑](#footnote-ref-83)
84. *Dunhuang mogaoku gongyangren tiji* 敦煌莫高窟供養人題記 [Epigraphs on People Who Made Offerings at Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes]. []: Wenwu chubanshe, 1986, pp. 69-70. {above citation lacked publisher} [↑](#footnote-ref-84)
85. Doi Yoshikazu 土肥義和. 'Bakkōkutsu senbutsudō to daiji to ranya to' 莫高窟千佛洞と大寺と蘭若と [The Mogao Grottoes' Cave of a Thousand Buddhas and Great Temple and *Araṇya*]. In *Kōza Tonkō: Tonkō no shakai* 講座敦煌*•*敦煌の社会, edited by Ikeda On池田温, [pages?]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1980, p. 364. {cited in Ch1, but information in red was not included there; this citation still needs work} [↑](#footnote-ref-85)
86. Trans. note: This refers to the *Xinyi dafangguang fo huayanjing yinyi* 新譯大方廣佛華嚴經音義 [Pronunciation and Meanings of the New Translation of the Flower Ornament Sūtra], a lexicographical reading aid compiled by Huiyuan 慧苑 in the Tang dynasty. [↑](#footnote-ref-86)
87. Jiang Boqin姜伯勤. *Tang Wudai Dunhuang sihu zhidu*唐五代敦煌寺戶制度 [Dunhuang's Temple-Household System in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. {cited in Ch1; ZR only gives name and title here} [↑](#footnote-ref-87)
88. *Genben shuoyiqie youbu pinaiye* 根本説一切有部毗奈耶 [Vinaya of the Mūla-Sarvâstivāda School, Skt. *Mūla-sarvâstivāda-vinaya-vibhaṅga*]. T no. [], 23: 24.756c. [↑](#footnote-ref-88)
89. *Mohe bore boluomi jing* 摩訶般若波羅蜜經 [Great Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra, Skt. *Pañca-viṃśati-sāhasrikā-prajñā-pāramitā*]. T no. [], 8: 14.320c. [↑](#footnote-ref-89)
90. *Shizhu piposha lun* 十住毗婆沙論 [Commentary on the *Daśabhūmika-sūtra*, Skt. *Daśabhūmika-vibhāṣā*]. T no. [], 26: 16.111c-112a. [↑](#footnote-ref-90)
91. Trans. note: Roughly equivalent to one English mile in total, if judged on the basis of the Chinese measure word. [↑](#footnote-ref-91)
92. *Dazhidu lun* 大智度論 [Treatise on the Great Perfection of Wisdom Sūtra, Skt. *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-śāstra*]. T no. [], 25: 68.537b–c. [↑](#footnote-ref-92)
93. Ikeda On 池田温. *Chugoku kodai shahon shikigo shūroku* 中國古代寫本識語輯錄 [A Compilation of Editors' Notes for Ancient Chinese Manuscripts]. Tōkyō: Daizō shuppansha, 1990. {In-text mention in Ch1, but no citation in Ch1 notes?} [↑](#footnote-ref-93)
94. Trans. note: A measure equivalent to a *dan* 石, or 120 *jin* 斤, a little over 120 English pounds in weight. [↑](#footnote-ref-94)
95. Trans. note: The measure *chi* 尺 is roughly comparable to an English foot. [↑](#footnote-ref-95)
96. *Dunhuang mogaoku gongyangren tiji* 敦煌莫高窟供養人題記 [Epigraphs on People Who Made Offerings at Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes]. []: Wenwu chubanshe, 1986, p. 73. {also cited above with no author} [↑](#footnote-ref-96)
97. Jiang Boqin 姜伯勤. 'Dunhuang miaozhenzan yu Dunhuang mingzu' 敦煌邈真讚與敦煌名族 [Dunhuang Portrait Encomia and Notable Families of Dunhuang]. In *Dunhuang miaozhenzan jiaolu bing yanjiu* 敦煌邈真讚校録并研究 [Collated Records of Dunhuang's Portrait Encomia and Research], edited by [], [page range]. []: Xinwenfeng chuban gongsi, 1994. [↑](#footnote-ref-97)
98. Ning Ke 寧可 and Hao Chunwen 郝春文. *Dunhuang sheyi wenshu jijiao* 敦煌社邑文書輯校 [Edited and Annotated Documents on Dunhuang's Lay Buddhist Societies]. []: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 1997, p. 680. [↑](#footnote-ref-98)
99. Chikusa Masaaki. *Chūgoku bukkyō shakaishi kenkyū*, p. 530. [↑](#footnote-ref-99)
100. Fujieda Akira 藤枝晃. 'Tonkō no sōni seki' 敦煌の僧尼籍 [Documentation {Registers?} of the Monks and Nuns of Dunhuang] *Tōhō gakuhō* 東方學報 (Kyōto) 29 (1959): []. {cited above, and in Ch1; elsewhere I have the volume number as 39, not 29; page info also needed} [↑](#footnote-ref-100)
101. Doi Yoshikazu. 'Tokuron tonkō no shakai to bukkyō: 9–10 seiki no bakkōkutsu to sansho zenkutsu to tonkō bukkyō kyōdan' 特論敦煌の社會と佛教–––九–十世紀の莫高窟と三所禪窟と敦煌佛教教圑 [Master Class on Dunhuang's Society and Buddhism: The Mogao Grottoes of the Ninth through Tenth Centuries, the Three Meditation Caves, and Dunhuang's Buddhist Communities]. In Dai yikkan 第1卷 'Higashi ajia bukkyō to wa nanika' 東アジア佛教とは何か [What is East Asian Buddhism?], *Higashi ajia bukkyō* 東アジア佛教 [East Asian Buddhism], edited by Takasaki Jikidō 高崎直道 and Kimura Kiyotaka 木村清孝, [pages?]. Tōkyō: Shunjūsha, 1995. {same citation as above, repeated in full, as ZR does here, again} [↑](#footnote-ref-101)
102. Chikusa Masaaki. 'Tonkō no sōkan seido'. {This is all ZR gives. Prev. cited.} [↑](#footnote-ref-102)
103. Jiang Boqin姜伯勤. 'Dunhuang pini zangzhu kao' 敦煌毗尼藏主考 [A Study of Dunhuang's Vinaya Librarians]. *Dunhuang yanjiu* 敦煌研究 3 (1993): [page range]. [↑](#footnote-ref-103)
104. Shiina Kōyū椎名宏雄. 'Shotō zensha no ritsuin kyojū ni tsuite' 初唐禪者の律院居住について [On Early-Tang Meditators Residing in Vinaya Temples]. *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 17-2 (1969): [page range]. [↑](#footnote-ref-104)
105. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 6.250c-251a. [↑](#footnote-ref-105)
106. *Dasong sengshi lüe*. T no. [], 54: 1.240a-b. [↑](#footnote-ref-106)
107. Kagamishima Genryū鏡島元隆. 'Hyakujō shingi no seiritsu to sono igi' 百丈清規の成立とその意義 [Formation of the Baizhang Rules of Purity and Its Significance]. *Zen kenkyūjo kiyō* 禅研究所紀要 [Journal of the Institute for Zen Studies, Aichi Gakuin University] 6-7 (1976): p. 122. {cited prev in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-107)
108. Kondō Ryōichi 近藤良一. 'Hyakujō shingi no seiritsu to sono genkei' 百丈清規の成立とその原型 (Formation of the *Baizhang qinggui* and Its Original Form). *Hokkaidō komazawa daigaku kenkyū kiyō*北海道駒沢大学研究紀要, 3 (1968): p. 36. {Prev cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-108)
109. See *Quan tang wen*, fascicle 262, 'Dazhao chanshi taming' 大照禪師塔銘 [Epitaph on Meditation Master Dazhao]. [↑](#footnote-ref-109)
110. *Jinshi xubian* 金石續編 [Supplementary Collation of Epigraphy]. Fascicle 6. .... {No previous citation} [↑](#footnote-ref-110)
111. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 5.244a. [↑](#footnote-ref-111)
112. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 5.255a [↑](#footnote-ref-112)
113. *Song gaoseng zhuan* 宋高僧傅 [Song Biographies of Eminent Monks]. Fascicle 10. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong 范祥雍. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987, p. 228. [↑](#footnote-ref-113)
114. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 9. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 197. [↑](#footnote-ref-114)
115. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 17. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 426. [↑](#footnote-ref-115)
116. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 11. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 255. [↑](#footnote-ref-116)
117. *Quan tang wen*, fascicle 510, 'Songshan huishansi jietan ji' 嵩山會善寺戒壇記 [Records from the Ordination Platform of Huishan Temple on Mount Song], by Lu Changyuan 陸長源. {style: ZR's shorthand fn style puts the reference work first, consulted text next. Okay, or reformat?} [↑](#footnote-ref-117)
118. *Quan tang wen*, fascicle 914, 'Shaolinsi jietan ming bing xu' 少林寺戒壇銘并序 [Epigraph of the Shaolin Temple Ordination Platform With Preface], by Yijing 義净. *Jinshi cuibian*, fascicle 70. [↑](#footnote-ref-118)
119. 'Huishansi jietan die' 會善寺戒壇牒 [Certificates of Ordination from Huishan Temple]. In *Jinshi cuibian* 金石萃編 [An Edited Collection of Inscriptions], edited by Wang Chang, fascicle 94, [page?]; *Quan tang wen*, fascicle 510, 'Songshan huishansi jietan ji' 嵩山會善寺戒壇記 [Records from the Ordination Platform of Huishan Temple on Mount Song], by Lu Changyuan 陸長源. {style needs fixing, truncating} [↑](#footnote-ref-119)
120. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 15. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. Pp. 376-379. [↑](#footnote-ref-120)
121. *Quan tang wen*, fascicle 338, 'Fuzhou baoyingsi lüzangyuan jietan ji' 撫州寶應寺律藏院戒壇記 [Records on the Ordination Platform of the Vinaya Seminary of Baoying Temple in Fuzhou]. [↑](#footnote-ref-121)
122. Zheng Binglin 鄭炳林. *Dunhuang dili wenshu huiji jiaolu* 敦煌地理文書匯輯校録 [An Annotated Collection of Dunhuang's Geographical Documents]. []: Gansu jiaoyu chubanshe, 1989, pp. 274, 269. [↑](#footnote-ref-122)
123. Suzuki Tetsuo 鈴木哲雄. *Tō godai zenshū: Kōsei: Konan* 唐五代禪宗•江西•湖南 [The Chan School in Tang and Five Dynasties: Jiangxi and Hunan]. []: Daitō shuppansha, 1984. [↑](#footnote-ref-123)
124. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 6.251a. [↑](#footnote-ref-124)
125. Satō Tatsugen 佐藤達玄. *Chūgoku bukkyō ni okeru kairitsu no kenkyū* 中國佛教における戒律の研究 [Research on Moral Restraints and Rules of Discipline in Chinese Buddhism]. Tōkyō: Mokujisha, 1986, p. 483. {cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-125)
126. 'Daoxin zhuan' 道信傳 [Biography of Daoxin]. In *Xu gaoseng zhuan*. T no. [], 50: 20.606b. [↑](#footnote-ref-126)
127. Tanaka Ryōshō. *Tonkō zenshū bunken no kenkyū*. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1983, p. 468. {cited earlier and in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-127)
128. Shiina Kōyū椎名宏雄. 'Tōzan hōmon keisei no haikei' 東[洞INBUDS]山法門形成の背景 [On the Background Shaping the Dongshan Teachings]. Shūgaku kenkyū 宗學研究 12 (1970): []. [↑](#footnote-ref-128)
129. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 4.229b-c. [↑](#footnote-ref-129)
130. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 4.229c. [↑](#footnote-ref-130)
131. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 10. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 224. [↑](#footnote-ref-131)
132. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 5.244a. [↑](#footnote-ref-132)
133. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 8. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 180. [↑](#footnote-ref-133)
134. Suzuki Tetsuo 鈴木哲雄. *Tō godai zenshū shi* 唐五代禪宗史 [A History of the Chan School in the Tang and Five Dynasties]. Tōkyō: Sankibō busshorin, 1985. First section of the last essay. [↑](#footnote-ref-134)
135. Ishii Shūdo 石井修道. *Sōdai zenshū shi no kenkyū* 宋代禪宗史の研究 [Research on the History of the Chan School in the Song Period]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1987, p. 407. [↑](#footnote-ref-135)
136. *Jingde chuandeng lu*. T no. [], 51: 13.305b. [↑](#footnote-ref-136)
137. *Wudeng huiyuan* 五燈會元 [Combined Sources for the Five Lamps]. X no. [], 136: 3.111. [↑](#footnote-ref-137)
138. *Song gaoseng zhuan*. Fascicle 11. Edition punctuated and annotated by Fan Xiangyong. P. 256. [↑](#footnote-ref-138)
139. Zheng Binglin. *Dunhuang dili wenshu huiji jiaolu*. []: Gansu jiaoyu chubanshe, 1989, pp. 266, 307. [↑](#footnote-ref-139)
140. See the second chapter of Shiina Kōyū 椎名宏雄. *Sōgenpan zenseki no kenkyū* 宋元版襌籍の研究 [Research on Chan Texts From the Song and Yuan]. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1993. [↑](#footnote-ref-140)
141. Yanagida Seizan 柳田聖山. *Shoki zenshū shisho no kenkyū* 初期禪宗史書の研究 [Research on the Historical Writings of the Early-Period Chan School]. Kyōto: Hōzōkan, 1967. [↑](#footnote-ref-141)
142. Tanaka Ryōshō. *Tonkō zenshū bunken no kenkyū*. Tōkyō: Daitō shuppansha, 1983. {cited earlier; no page info provided, though I think the use calls for it} [↑](#footnote-ref-142)
143. Obata Hironobu 小畠宏允. 'Chibetto no zenshū to rekidai hōbōki' チベットの禅宗と『歴代法宝記』 [The Tibetan School of Chan and the *Lidai fabao ji*]. *Zenbunka kenkyūjo kiyō* 禅文化研究所紀要 6(1974): 139-176. {ZR had the wrong name, so I looked this up and fixed it, adding page numbers; in doing so, the character forms are Japanese, not fanti Chinese--how to manage Japanese text still needs a decision} [↑](#footnote-ref-143)
144. Ueyama Daishun 上山大峻. 'Chibetto ni okeru zen to chūganha no gōryū チベットにおける禅と中観派の合流 [The Merging of Chan and Madhyamaka in Tibet]. In *Chibetto no bukkyō to shakai* チベットの仏教と社会 [Buddhism and Society in Tibet], edited by Yamaguchi Zuihō 山口瑞鳳, 31-54. Tōkyō: Shunjūsha, 1986. {ditto: fixed, but also Japanized} [↑](#footnote-ref-144)
145. Harada Satoru 原田覚. 'Makaen zenji to tonmon' 摩訶衍禅師と頓門 [Meditation Teacher Moheyan and Subitism]. *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度學佛教學研究 55 (1979): 77-81 (L).{ditto: fixed, but also Japanized} Also Zhang Guangda 張廣達. 'Tangdai chanzong de chuanru Tufan ji youguande Dunhuang wenshu' 唐代禪宗的傳入吐蕃及有關的敦煌文書 [The Chan School's Dissemination into Turpan in the Tang Dynasty and Related Documents from Dunhuang]. *Xuelin manlu* 學林漫録 3(1981): [page range]. [↑](#footnote-ref-145)
146. Jiang boqin 姜伯勤. 'Puji yu beizong chanfeng xixuan Dunhuang' 普寂與北宗禪風西旋敦煌 [Puji and the Return to Dunhuang of the Chan Style of the Northern Lineages]. In *Fojiao yu Zhongguo chuantong wenhua* 佛教與中國傳統文化 [Buddhism and Traditional Chinese Culture], edited by Wang Yao 王堯, 467-493. []: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 1997. [↑](#footnote-ref-146)
147. Okimoto Katsumi冲本克己. 'Tonkō shutsudo seizōbun zenshū bunken no kenkyū' 敦煌出土西藏文禪宗文獻の研究(2) [Research on Documents of the Chan School in Tibetan Script Excavated at Dunhuang (2)]. *Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 27-2 (1979): [46-49(L)]. {pages added, but title characters not Japanized} [↑](#footnote-ref-147)
148. Ueyama Daishun上山大峻. *Tonkō bukkyō no kenkyū* 敦煌佛教の研究 [Research on Dunhuang Buddhism]. Kyōto: Hōzōkan, 1990, p. 65. {cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-148)
149. Shi Pingting 施萍婷. 'Sanjiesi • Daozhen • Dunhuang zangjing' 三界寺•道真•敦煌藏經 [The Temple of the Three Realms, Daozhen, and Dunhuang's Buddhist Canon]. In *Dunhuang xue guoji yantaohui wenji* 敦煌學國際研討會文集 [Collected Papers of the International Conference on Dunhuang Studies], edited by [], [page range]. []: Liaoning meishu chubanshe, 1990. {cited in Ch1} [↑](#footnote-ref-149)
150. Tsukamoto Zenryū 塚本善隆. 'Tonkō bukkyōshi gaisetsu' 敦煌佛教史概説 [An Outline of the History of Dunhuang Buddhism]. In *Seiiki bunka kenkyū* 西域文化研究, vol.1, edited by [], [page range]. Kyōto: Hōzōkan, 1958. [↑](#footnote-ref-150)
151. Naba Toshisada 那波利貞. 'Tō shōhon zatsushō kō' 唐鈔本雜[抄]考 [A Study of Reading Notes from Transcribed Books of the Tang Dynasty]. *Shinagaku* 支那學 10 (year): [page range], special issue. {(ZR seems to have mistaken the title and is missing/has conflicting information. See 武紹衛『敦煌寫本硏究年報』第十二號(2018.03)85-99 頁): 那波利貞《唐鈔本雜抄考――唐代敦煌庶民教育史研究の資料》,《支那學》第 14 號,1942 年} [↑](#footnote-ref-151)
152. Yan Gengwang 嚴耕望. *Tangshi yanjiu conggao* 唐史研究叢稿 [Collected Papers Researching Tang History]. Hong Kong: Xinya yanjiusuo chuban, 1969, pp. 375-376. [↑](#footnote-ref-152)
153. Rong Xinjiang榮新江. 'Jiu [dao] shi shiji Guiyijun shidai de Dunhuang fojiao' 九––十世紀歸義軍時代的敦煌佛教 [Dunhuang Buddhism of the Ninth to Tenth-Century Guiyi Army Period]. *Qinghua hanxue yanjiu* 清華漢學研究 1 (1994): []. {cited in Ch1 without mention of the ninth century; which is correct?} [↑](#footnote-ref-153)
154. Ikeda On. *Chugoku kodai shahon shikigo shūroku*. [Tōkyō: Daizō shuppansha, 1990,] p. 898. [↑](#footnote-ref-154)
155. See Makita Tairyō 牧田諦亮. *Gikyō no kenkyū* 疑經の研究 [Research on Scriptures of Doubtful Authenticity]. Kyōto: [], 1976. [↑](#footnote-ref-155)